



National Association For Ethnic Studies

Ethnic
Studies
Review

2013

Volume 36 Issues 1-2

ISSN: 1555-1881

The National Association For Ethnic Studies

Ethnic Studies Review (ESR) is the journal of the National Association For Ethnic Studies (NAES). ESR is a multi-disciplinary international journal devoted to the study of ethnicity, ethnic groups and their cultures, and inter-group relations. NAES has as its basic purpose the promotion of activities and scholarship in the field of Ethnic Studies. The Association is open to any person or institution and serves as a forum for its members in promoting research, study, and curriculum as well as producing publications of interest in the field. NAES sponsors an annual spring conference.

Editorial Board

Editor

Ron Scapp, College of Mount Saint Vincent

Associate Editors

David Aliano, College of Mount Saint Vincent
Ravi Perry, Virginia Commonwealth University

Editorial Advisory Board

Edna Acosta-Belen University at Albany, SUNY	Rosanne Kanhai Western Washington University
Jorge A. Bustamante El Colegio de la Frontera Norte (Mexico)	Paul Lauter Trinity College
Duane W. Champagne University of California, Los Angeles	Robert L. Perry Eastern Michigan University
Laura Coltelli University de Pisa (Italy)	Otis L. Scott California State University, Sacramento
Russell Endo University of Colorado	Alan Spector Purdue University, Calumet
David M. Gradwohl Iowa State University	K. Victor Ujimoto University of Guelph (Canada)
Maria Herrera-Sobek University of California, Irvine	Irene Vernon Colorado State University, Fort Collins
Evelyn Hu-DeHart Brown University	John C. Walter University of Washington
Vernon Johnson Western Washington University	Bernard Young Arizona State University

Designed by Eileen Claveloux

Ethnic Studies Review (ESR) is published by the National Association For Ethnic Studies for its individual and subscribing libraries and institutions. NAES is a member of the Council of Editors of Learned Journals.

Copyright©ESR, The National Association For Ethnic Studies, 2016. All Rights reserved. Written authorization to photocopy any part of this publication, store in a retrieval system, or transmit by any means must be obtained from NAES.

Editor's Note: Please note that the actual date of publication of ESR Volume 36 is Spring 2016. To provide continuity and consistency for cataloguing and research purposes, the Editorial Board is publishing the journal in the correct sequence even though we are behind in our publishing schedule. The journal will be current as of Fall 2017.

ESR

ESR

Ethnic Studies Review

The Journal of the
National Association for Ethnic Studies

Volume 36 Issues 1 and 2

Table of Contents

Articles

Understanding the Nature and Effects of Police-Citizen Encounters in Social Context: The Road Less Traveled Alfred R. D’Anca	1
Enacting “Smoke, Lilies, and Jade” as Black Gay Print Culture Shawn Anthony Christian	21
Closing the Gap: A Research Agenda for the Study of Health Needs among American Indian/Native Hawaiian Transgender Individuals Irene S Vernon and Trudie Jackson	37
Examining the Impact of Parental Socialization on the Coping Styles of Black Graduate Students Faced with Microaggressions Robert D. Colbert, Kai M. Perry, and Marcia Anderson.....	59
Discursive and Processual Socialization of the Mass into Acts of Violence: the Case of Rwandan Genocide Jeylan Wolyie Hussein.....	77
Exploring the Dynamics of Identity Based Conflict and the Possibility for its Sustainable Management: A Study of the Persistent Ethno-Religious Conflict in Wukari Area of Taraba State, Nigeria Jude A. Momodu, G.I. Matudi, and Abiodun L. Momodu	105
Tribal-led People’s Resistance in Transition: 1765-1800 Ananda Bhattacharyya	127

Trusting an Abusive System: Systemic Racism and Black Political Engagement	
Matthew Simmons	139
The Fundi Effect: Activism through Empowerment	
Tony Jamal Lee	149

Book Reviews

<i>How to Slowly Kill Yourself and Others in America</i> by Kiese Laymon	
Leslie K. Dunlap	159
<i>Mentoring Faculty of Color: Essays on Professional Development and Advancement in Colleges and Universities</i> , by Dwayne Mack, Elwood D. Watson, and Michelle Madsen Camacho, eds	
Marie Sarita Gaytán	161
<i>Angry White Men: American Masculinity at the End of an Era</i> by Michael Kimmel	
Jonathan Grove	163

Ethnic Studies Review 36:1-2
Abstracts

**Understanding the Nature and Effects of Police-Citizen Encounters
in Social Context: A Road Less Traveled**

Alfred R. D'Anca
College of Mount Saint Vincent

Aggressive policing tactics have been identified as contributors to declining crime rate trends in urban, culturally diverse neighborhoods. They encompass stop and frisk practices which have spawned negative public opinion that contrasts with its justification by criminal justice officials as an effective means for the control and prevention of crime. The issue, however, begs deeper questions not readily addressed: how does the nature of police-citizen suspicion-based encounters influence the attitudes and behavior of both stakeholders; and does it contribute to effective crime control and prevention? Based on an analysis of theoretical and empirical research in the field, this article argues that a sense of shame and perception of fairness or unfairness are endemic to face-to-face suspicion-based encounters between police officers and the public, and have significant implications for the experience of justice, control and prevention of crime, and policy initiatives to promote community safety.

KEYWORDS: Justice; Shame; Fairness; Legitimacy; Crime Prevention; Crime Control

Enacting “Smoke, Lilies, and Jade” as Black Gay Print Culture

Shawn Anthony Christian
Wheaton College

This essay offers a comparative analysis of the ways that Isaac Julien's *Looking for Langston* (1989) and Rodney Evans's *Brother to Brother* (2005) inscribe Richard Bruce Nugent's landmark short story “Smoke, Lilies, and Jade” (1926). Both films are examples of how “Smoke,” which was first published in the short-lived but infamous journal *FIRE!!*, now functions as much more than an artifact from the Harlem Renaissance's dynamic print culture. As I contend through this analysis, “Smoke” is a central diegetic element in both films. It enables *Looking*'s visual depiction of the sojourn that Nugent's protagonist Alex has with his male lover “Beauty” and *Brother*'s depiction of an intergenerational collaboration that honors Nugent as a black gay male artist. Through honorific interpretations of “Smoke, Lilies, and Jade,” *Looking for*

Langston and *Brother to Brother* affirm a black gay print culture as indispensable to black gay film.

Keywords: “Smoke, Lilies, and Jade,” *Looking for Langston*; *Brother to Brother*, Black gay print culture, Black gay film, Harlem Renaissance

**Closing the Gap: A Research Agenda for the Study of Health
Needs among American Indian/Native Hawaiian
Transgender Individuals**

**Irene S Vernon
Colorado State University**

**Trudie Jackson
University of Arizona**

Objectives: To explore health research needs of American Indian and Native Hawaiian (AI/NH) transgender individuals. Methods: This qualitative study is composed of four focus groups and one informal meeting, totaling 42 AI/NH transgender individuals in four major cities. The theoretical and methodological approaches combined grounded theory with the principles of community based participatory research. Results: Healthcare and resiliency are two main themes that emerged as research needs with important subcategories within them. Access to quality care from medical professionals and access to care that is unique to their transgender status were subcategories within healthcare. Lived experiences, culture, and history were factors found to contribute to their resiliency. Conclusions: There are a number of factors that lead to health disparities among AI/NH people. They include the lack of quality care due to the negative encounters with health providers, health care providers' limited knowledge of transgender issues, and lack of transgender specific services. This must be researched further along with health provider care, attitudes, beliefs, and education. Understanding the lived lives of AI/NH transgender individuals and utilizing their culture and history in health interventions may improve their health and overall wellbeing.

Keywords: Gender, Transgender Persons, American Indian, Native Hawaiian, Health Disparities

Examining the Impact of Parental Socialization on the Coping Styles of Black Graduate Students Faced with Microaggressions

Robert D. Colbert, Kai M. Perry, and Marcia Anderson
University of Connecticut

This article explores case examples of two graduate students who endure microaggressions from their math professor at a predominantly White university. The role that parental socialization plays in how these students developed their racial identities and the coping strategies they employed, is analyzed through the lens of Triple Quandary theory (Boykin and Toms 1985). Findings from this investigation suggest that parental socialization is critical in preparing these students to cope with and respond to microaggressions in protective and adaptive ways. This paper illuminates coping styles, although divergent, that served these graduate students' needs and protected their individual racial identities. Further, the support these students received from their faculty advisor who is also Black, exemplifies the importance of mentorship and advocacy from faculty of color to Black college students' success. Direction for continuity in parental teachings for K-12 and university level educators are discussed.

Keywords: microaggressions, Triple Quandry Theory, higher education, racism

Discursive and Processual Socialization of the Mass into Acts of Violence: the Case of Rwandan Genocide

Jeylan Wolyie Hussein
Haramaya University, Dire Dawa, Ethiopia.

This article analyses discursive and processual socialization of the masses into acts of violence during the Rwandan genocide of 1994. The discursive aspects of the socialization include discourses of dehumanization, ethnic extremism and the dynamics of public socialization into violence and other acts of savagery. The processual dimension of the socialization refers to the violentization process. The article tries to show that the discursive and the processual aspects of socialization reinforced each other. It analyses the ideological and linguistic mechanisms mobilized in Rwanda to foment hatred and whip the masses into atrocities. The article, in addition, tries to explain the genocide through diverse social psychological theories and illustrate the interaction between the leaders' political agitation of the masses towards extermination and the perpetrators' action on the ground. The article argues that no single theory can fully explain the incomprehensible genocide since it was the result of a complex intermarriage between

social, ideological and moral forces. It also examines the role of cultural and linguistic resources in the violentization process. On the basis of the analysis, the article recommends what should be done to prevent similar atrocities in Africa.

Keywords: genocide, Rwanda, discourses of dehumanization, violentization, Hutu, Tutsi

Exploring the Dynamics of Identity Based Conflict and the Possibility for its Sustainable Management: A Study of the Persistent Ethno-Religious Conflict in Wukari Area of Taraba State, Nigeria

Jude A. Momodu, G.I. Matudi, and Abiodun L. Momodu
Federal University of Technology
(now Modibbo Adama University of Technology)
Yola- Adamawa State, Nigeria

This article explores the dynamics of identity-based conflict and the possibility for its management. The study in particular focuses on the persistent ethno-religious conflicts in the Wukari Area of Taraba State, Nigeria. The real issues precipitating the persistent ethno-religious conflicts and the costs of the conflicts were clearly brought to the fore. The study proposes a new paradigm for managing social conflicts at the community level through the 'use of community solutions for community problems' which will involve the constructive participation of all of the stakeholders in the community. This paper concludes by making a proposal for the establishment of a Truth and Reconciliation Committee (TRC) and a power sharing arrangement as strategies that could bring about lasting peace between the Jukun Christians/Traditionalist Jukun and the Jukun Muslims/Hausa Muslims who are the warring parties in the persistent ethno-religious conflicts ravaging Wukari Local Government Area of Taraba State, Nigeria.

Keywords: Identity Conflict, Ethno-Religious Conflict, Ethnicity, Religion, and Reconciliation

Tribal-led People's Resistance in Transition: 1765-1800

Ananda Bhattacharyya
West Bengal State Archives

The year 1799 A.D. is marked in the annals of Midnapore as the year of the great Chuar Rebellion when all the Adivasis, Sirdars and paiks broke out in a rebellion. They wanted the restoration of their Jagir lands which

the British had forcibly resumed earlier. It was a formidable resistance of the Adivasis against the colonial regime. The lawless tribes of the jungle mehal made common cause with the paiks and peasants and carried slaughter and flame to the very doors of the Magistrate's cutcherry. The plundered booty on some occasions was distributed among the ryots. The threat to burn the town and to plunder revenue was no doubt a form of anti-colonial resistance against the East India Company.

Key Words: Chuar Rebellion, Adivasi Resistance, Jungle Mehal

Trusting an Abusive System: Systemic Racism and Black Political Engagement

Matthew Simmons
Temple University

Africana people in America have relied upon the utilization of political participation in order to address the economic and societal ills that plague its community. Africana people have made strides at all levels of the American government. Africana people were a vital voting block that helped to elect the first American President of African descent. However, studies have shown that the conditions of Africana people in America have not substantially changed since the Voting Rights Act of 1965 was enacted. Africana political participation has not equated to socio-economic equality on a large scale for the Africana community. Utilizing Feagin's Systemic Racism Theory, this project looks to examine why solely relying upon the American political system is symptomatic of dis-agency for Africana people and argues that this dis-agency does not empower our people to seek solutions. It places the power to liberate in the oppressor's hands, thus maintaining the inequality that continues to exist in America. This article also argues for Africana people to look to themselves as the avenue for addressing the societal ills that it faces. It also argues that Africana people must be their own mechanism for liberation. In addition, the terms Africana and Black will be used interchangeably in the project because those terms are most readily identifiable to people of African descent living in America.

Keywords: Systemic Racism Theory, Africana/Black, Black Political Engagement, Voting, Voting Rights Act, Inequality, Africana Liberation

The Fundi Effect: Activism through Empowerment

Tony Jamal Lee
Afrikan Unity Initiative

The participatory democracy strategy of organization used by Ella Baker was greatly productive in grassroots activism, and has the potential to strengthen the political struggles of the present to the height of the movements in times past. Ella Baker was a prominent figure in the black freedom struggle. She was active in fighting for equal rights for Afrikans in America for over five decades. Her approach was characterized by an ability to mobilize and influence youth to action. In this work, there will be an analytical examination of how this methodology is equipped to stand the tests of time through what will be called The Fundi Effect. The Fundi Effect is a method of activism that is capable of being applied inter-generationally, and has the ability to address the reactionary manner with which injustice is dealt in attempts at social movements at present.

Keywords: Ella Baker, civil rights movement, The Fundi Effect, youth activism, grassroots organization

ARTICLES

UNDERSTANDING THE NATURE AND EFFECTS OF POLICE-CITIZEN ENCOUNTERS IN SOCIAL CONTEXT: A ROAD LESS TRAVELED

Alfred R. D'Anca
College of Mount Saint Vincent

The practice of stop, question, and frisk (hereto referred to as “stop and frisk”) by police officers, legally justified on the basis of reasonable suspicion of illicit behavior, represents a controversial issue of recurrent public concern, and has had pervasive undertones in diverse racial-ethnic urban neighborhood communities in which such tactics are more typically employed. Police officers are permitted to briefly stop and question a person to dispel the suspicion, and also to frisk the person without a warrant, without violating a person’s 4th Amendment rights to be protected from unreasonable search and seizure. (*Terry v. Ohio* 1968) It is not surprising that the practices have spawned discourse regarding the effect of such aggressive tactics on crime rates, as well as on crime control and crime prevention. Arguably, aggressive policing practices in themselves are deemed justifiable by criminal justice and some political officials to maintain social order and community safety. (Goldstein, 2013, A13) At the same time, however, justification for such practices, based on crime trend outcomes, fosters a growing divide between criminal justice administrators, social science researchers, and the judiciary. (Bratton and Kelling, 2006; Savage and Goode, 2013) In such a context, ideas of crime control and crime prevention are more likely to be discussed as complementary outcomes of each other.

Notwithstanding empirical evidence of declining crime trends both nationally and in local urban locales such as the New York metropolitan area, deeper questions emerge for analytical reflection regarding the nature of police work and future policy initiatives. What really happens when police and citizens meet in suspicion-based encounters? And what is the significance of emotions, such as shame, in such incidents?

While literature in the field more readily addresses to the use of shaming in the formal adjudicatory imposition of punishment to control criminal behavior, the effects of shame on citizens in suspicion-based encounters with police are not typically explored. (see Garvey, 1998,

745; Massaro, 1991, 1894-1897) At the same time, intended outcomes of shaming in formal arenas of criminal justice are not necessarily predictable. For example, according to Garvey (1998), shaming in the sentencing of offenders does little to address offenders' change of preferences for future behavior (757, 763)

This paper addresses the nature of suspicion-based encounters between citizens and law enforcement authorities in terms of the implications of shame on all parties, including the community, and is organized as follows: first, a brief discussion of a deeper dimension of crime trend research will suggest the need to address the issue of procedural responses by police from a somewhat different and inter-personal vantage point; second, the significance of shame will be presented as a contributor to perceptions about procedural fairness and justice by stakeholders in police-citizen encounters; third, the pertinence of this development will be discussed in terms of understanding crime control and crime prevention; and, finally, concluding remarks will be presented.

UNDERSTANDING CRIME TRENDS: DEEPER DIMENSIONS

It is well documented that violent and property crime rates have diminished consistently since 1995 both nationally and in urban locales (Uniform Crime Report, 2010, Tables 1, 1A, 2; Sourcebook, 2010, Table 4.2) Attempts to explain this trend have included the influence of police organizational culture, the politicization of crime data, and police - community relations. (Eterno, 2012; Chayes, 2012; Zhao, Scheider, and Thruman, 2002; National Evaluation, 2000)

Can crime rate trends be meaningfully explained? Zimring (2012) conducted a well-organized data analysis to explain the significant decline in crime rates in New York City amid relatively unchanged social conditions. His research (2012; 2007) revealed statistically unremarkable trends in unemployment in New York City during the 1990s, as well as below-national average growth of more crime-prone, younger age groups. At the same time, a declining incarceration rate in the New York metropolitan that remained below the national trend was accompanied by the maintenance of police manpower levels that was greater than those of nine other larger cities in the United States. (207-209; 240) What was most apparent, however, was a focus on more aggressive law enforcement tactics in crime-intensive areas. A computerized-data-centered operational program, known as COMPSTAT, relying on "a core set of management principles built around comprehensive crime analysis techniques" and a "culture of accountability" for superiors and line police officers alike, emerged to identify incidence of crime in the New York metropolitan area as well as to evaluate efforts of response by police (Dabney 2010, 29). According to Zimring (2007), this program influ-

ences the use of aggressive policing tactics at the street level.¹ (151) Eterno (2012), however, critically views COMPSTAT as placing an “addictive emphasis” on numerical data in police work that has reinforced an institutionalized police “performance culture” in the New York City Police Department and diminished officer discretion in encounters with the public. (A23) At issue then is the prioritization of deterrence measured in terms of crime rate decreases and as an outcome of aggressive police tactics. (see Buntin, 2013)

Zimring’s (2007) finding - - that more aggressive policing tactics represent the only real change in criminal justice in New York City and therefore, by process of elimination, most likely explains the decline of crime - - does not address a deeper dimension of police work and its effects on the public. In this regard, while Zimring (2012) concludes, in part, that policing strategies were a determining factor in the statistical decline of crime, he also acknowledges that his methodological approach does not explain the behavior of “human subjects” in such a context. Accordingly, there is a need to address the personal, interactive dimension that underlies behavioral outcomes in police-citizen encounters less addressed by a more exclusive reliance on quantitative crime data analysis.

This paper acknowledges the effect of aggressive policing strategies, at least in part, to explain crime trends but posits that the nature of suspicion-based police encounters with the public, such as in stop and frisk incidents, are social interaction episodes that comprise the presence of shame, a perceived sense of fairness or unfairness, and citizen and police perceptions of self and each other. (Sherman, 1993; Tyler 2000 and 2006; Braithwaite, 2000, 291-292; Dai, 2007; Murphy, 2009B, 173; Gau and Brunson, 2010, 258)

THE PRESENCE AND EFFECTS OF SHAME

Shame is endemic to social control as an outcome of sanctioning experiences and one’s involvement in the criminal justice process. (Sherman, 1993; Braithwaite, 2000 and 2006; Gau and Brunson, 2010, 273; Beck, Warner, and Ohmer, 2010, 362) At the very least, while shame is present as an effect of labeling an individual as a suspect or offender, research has been less likely to explore the relation of shame to

¹ Zimring (2007) identifies “street intervention practices” as related to the Broken Windows approach introduced by Kelling and Bratton (1988). More specifically, this *approach* to policing advocates the maintenance of social order by police intervention at relatively benign offense levels in order to prevent escalation to more serious criminality. According to Zimring (2007), the scope of the effect of stop and frisk tactics on crime rates is difficult to evaluate independent of other aggressive policing practices. (155; see also Fagan and Davies, 2000, 497; and, Fagan, Zimring, and Kim, 1998, 1320-1323, in regard to homicide trends in New York City).

the “subjective world of criminal offenders” in terms of their emotional satisfaction or dissatisfaction with their behavior. (Gray, 2010; Frazier and Meisenhelder, 1985)

The presence of shame in itself does not predict the likelihood of remorse in terms of offenders or suspects. Furthermore, there is no consensus regarding a deterrent effect of being shamed in a sanctioning experience. For example, Braithwaite (2000) maintains that the manner in which shame about criminal behavior is experienced in encounters influences crime rates. (281) He identifies two types of shaming. Integrative shaming by nature is characterized by respectful interaction between authority figure and subject, whereby “the offender is treated as a good person who has done a bad thing.” (282) Conversely, shaming can also be “stigmatizing,” characterized by disrespect, whereby the offender is treated as a bad person who has done a bad thing. According to Garvey (1998), doubts about the deterrent effect of shame are especially evident when it is stigmatizing: “. . . it may be because the offender is so socially isolated that he already is at risk of engaging in criminal behavior.” (752)

Deeper dimensions of the nature of reintegrative shame have broader ramifications. There is consensus among scholars that reintegrative shaming serves to “‘educate’ or shape the preferences of individuals who are punished” by “‘coupling’ . . . community disapproval with subsequent gestures of reacceptance and forgiveness.” (Note, 2003, 2192) At the same time, however, Braithwaite’s ideal construct of community, that provided a social context for reintegrative shaming, is criticized because of the uncertain degree to which persons in fact actually identify with principles of social normative behavior in respective communities. (Massaro, 1991, 1999) Massaro (1991) further argues that the application of effective shaming that is reintegrative is problematic because the culture of modern American urban communities is characterized by an absence or minimization of “high expectations of social responsibility, coupled with close social bonding, . . . and strong family attachment,” which are present in cultures that apply effective shaming. (1894; see also Note, 2003, 2194)

Shame, within the context of the relationship between the community and police as agents of social control, has further implications. Kemper (1978) affirms the need for a more comprehensive sociological approach to understand emotions in social situations by a greater focus on “what actually goes on *between* the actors” in social encounters that represent “relations of power and status.” (2, 31, italics added) He further asserts that the use of “excessive power” devalues the status of another, and not only evokes feelings of guilt and shame in the subject but also negates the subject’s “claims to . . . decency [and] fairness.” (68)

According to Massaro (1991) and consistent with Kemper (1978), shame can diminish the self-image of the shamed person. One might also hypothesize that in racially charged environments, shaming encounters can serve to reaffirm perceived secondary status by minority group members. (see Reisig et al, 2007) In effect, in subcultural community environments, perceived disrespectful shaming in police practices may convey a certain moral condemnation and is more likely to elicit hostile views toward legal authorities. (Note, 2003, 2191 and 2193) The social cost of such tactics includes the affirmation of a certain perceived sense of alienation by community residents who view themselves as being unequally protected by the law. (Stuntz, 2011, 8)

In their theoretical construct, Scheff and Retzinger (1997) further maintain shame that is disrespectful serves to weaken the offender's social connection or bond to society and may result in a repressive, personal pattern of behavior. In essence, the offender becomes ashamed of being shamed disrespectfully. In this regard, according to Sherman (1993), defiance, based on a perception by the citizen that the authority figure's procedural conduct is unjustified, or illegitimate, and a sense of isolation are more likely outcomes. (also, see Braithwaite, 2000, 291-292) And, scholarly discourse further reveals that a sense of fairness or unfairness by citizens in encounters with police officers both in arrest and non-arrest-related incidents influences citizens' long-term compliance with laws. (Murphy, 2009A, 2-3; also, see Tankebe, 2008, and Deutsch, 2006) Deterrence, then, may or may not be an outcome of shaming.

Suspicion-based police-citizen encounters, in which some degree of sanction is possible (e.g., a warning; a summons; a "pat-down"; an arrest), represent experiences that may spawn not only a feeling of shame but also a response to that feeling. (see Tyler 2006) According to Sherman (1993), however, there has been a paucity of research on the *effect* of shame on citizens who are subject to the authority of police officers in such encounters, and on police officers. For example, in their study regarding police decision-making in non-arrest encounters, Terrill et al (2007) focus on police perception of citizens while excluding citizen perceptions regarding police, which may have an effect on discretion in such incidents. Tankebe (2008) further points out "the failure of the procedural fairness literature" to include potential effects of police officers' "self-conception of their power" to better understand police-citizen encounters. (15)

Finally, the experience of being shamed also has subtle implications regarding one's sense of personal integrity. For example, perceived procedural unfairness in police-citizen encounters based on extra-legal factors such as race have been found to affirm citizens' sense of disrespect

by police. (Gau and Brunson, 2006; Dai, 2007) In this view, it is the suspect or offender and not the behavior that is labeled as criminal or deviant, and shamed. (Cohen 2001, 212; see also Morrison, 2006, 388) The effects of shaming, then, are influenced by the presence or absence of fairness.

THE MATTER OF FAIRNESS

In the doing of criminal justice, fairness has varied implications and reveals different underlying mind-sets. For example, Stuntz (2011) accentuates a distinction between the American Bill of Rights and the French Declaration of the Rights of Man and of the Citizen: the former is procedure-centered and emphasizes “being fair” while the latter emphasizes “being just.” (74-78) Likewise, according to Whitman (2009), in a broader and cross-cultural perspective, American policies of harsh sanctions to control and prevent crime can be explained by a greater emphasis on fairness as a procedural outcome rather than by a more emphatic focus on respect for the dignity of the individual which is more evident in Europe.

In a similar vein, Michel Foucault, in *Discipline and Punish* (1977), exploring whether penal reform in more contemporary society is more humane than its brutal past, maintains that the “humanity” ascribed to modern penal systems does not refer to a trait of the offender but rather to a more calculated and proportional sanctioning of offenders. (1977, 92, italics added)

This has implications for suspicion-based encounters between police and citizens wherein emphasis on social control for community safety is directed to the offense or suspected illicit behavior of suspects than the offender or suspect himself. In this regard, Hutson (2013), in an assessment of literature regarding the “psychology of moral consistency,” affirms the beneficial effect of focusing on the character of the person for positive reinforcement than the act in negative reinforcement: “Convinced that we’re bad, it’s hard to go back.” (12)

More subtle consequences of justifying the implementation of legal procedures for crime control also are evident. For example, Gopnik (2012), reflects that as systems become procedural and professionalized, the more “insulated” they and all who function or serve within them become from the “real effect . . . on real people”. (6; also, see Stuntz, 2011, 66-69) Hence, the achievement of fairness by procedural practice may be compromised. (Stuntz., 2011, 28)

In a comprehensive review of scholarly literature in the field, Tankebe (2009) identifies key characteristic traits that reflect a sense of procedural fairness that extends beyond legal practices. In particular, public perception about the fairness of encounters with police is influ-

enced by the nature of the communication and citizens' feeling that they are held "in high regard" by authorities. According to Tankebe (2009), the citizen perceives that his or her interaction with police is not aggravated by extra-legal factors. (9) A consequence is a greater likelihood that citizens will view police motives with trust and be able to provide input in police-citizen suspicion-based encounters. (10) Fairness in procedural matters then is informed in part by public perception: "The quality of interpersonal treatment concerns public evaluation that . . . legal authorities treat them with politeness, and dignity and respect their human rights." (10)

Sherman (1993), in his paradigmatic theory of deviance, emphasizes "defiance" as an outcome of the offender's perception of being sanctioned unfairly. This theme also is reflected in policy reports that address "police integrity," typically defined as "the normative inclination among police to resist the temptation to abuse the rights and privileges of their occupation." (U.S. Department of Justice, 2005, 2) In a report of a national conference of police officials, civil rights representatives, and community leaders, the U.S. Department of Justice affirmed the need for law enforcement agents to recognize and respect the value and dignity of every person." (U.S. Department of Justice, 2001, 5) It was emphasized that such a core value, when interwoven within the "culture" of police organizations rather than simply sought as a personal character trait of recruits, can spawn citizens' trust in police that enhances effective crime reduction policies. (3) Additionally, at a national symposium sponsored by the Office of Community Policing Services and the National Institute of Justice, the issue of citizen trust in police was stated poignantly: "Citizens aren't just interested in the results of policing—whether crime rates are down and people are feeling secure. Citizens want to be certain that their police are behaving correctly as well as being effective." (U.S. Department of Justice, 1997, 66)

According to Tyler (2006), sanctioning that is perceived as fair comports with procedural justice, enhances a sense of legitimacy regarding the law and one's personal responsibility to regulate his or her behavior. (313) Tankebe (2009), maintains that "police have an intrinsic non-negotiable obligation" to treat citizens not only fairly and respectfully but as human beings. (14) Consequently, the interconnectedness of human worth and procedural fairness can influence citizens' evaluative perceptions about encounters with legal authorities.

Furthermore, according to Tyler, legitimacy offsets a sense of social exclusion in citizens that would impede a relationship of honesty and trust with agents of the legal system. In this sense, legitimacy is the equivalent of procedural fairness. (Tankebe, 2009, 12) This in part explains a finding by Tyler (1990), based on empirical data, that legitimacy

is informed by the “process of fairness” as exercised during interactions than by outcomes. (Tankebe, 2009, 9; also see Bottoms and Tankebe, 2012, 119-121) According to Stuntz (2011), prominent reliance of the contemporary criminal justice system on legal procedures results in a “bureaucratic detachment” between authorities and citizens which may compromise the process that underlies the deeper meaning of procedural fairness. (252)

While police-citizen encounters that are perceived as procedurally fair can spawn a sense of legitimacy in the eyes of the public, perceived unfairness in citizen-police encounters has farther reaching effects. Murphy (2009A), in research that defined procedural justice in terms of fairness, courtesy, and the opportunity to citizens for input in encounters, reveals a significant impact of police practices on citizens: “. . .if members of the public perceive police as treating them unfairly, this signifies *police do not consider them to be important or valued members of the community.*” (114, italics added) Reisig et al (2007) accentuate the significance of “social context” factors on police and citizen attitudes and behavior. More specifically, they found that recidivistic behavior by former black male inmates is positively influenced by their return to neighborhood locales characterized by high levels of social inequality, thereby reinforcing a sense of secondary status.

Procedural fairness, both by its presence or absence, and its relationship to shame, has broader implications that are not readily apparent. Shaming can spawn a sense of moral condemnation, and “taken to be representative of a person’s entire identity.” (Garvey, 1998, 766) Such an outcome is especially likely if the suspect already has developed an “attachment” to criminal subcultural groups in a locale. (749) Hence, unfairness can exacerbate the effects of shame in encounters and, in turn, diminish a sense of legitimacy in regard to the legal system. Kemper (1978) further maintains that power and status inform all social relationships. In this regard, verbal abusive remarks by authority figures can serve to reduce claims of “status” by citizens as “dismissible.” (31) In such incidents, citizen compliance is likely to be made only “to avoid even further debasement.” (30)

The significance of the effect of the process underlying perceived procedural unfairness, as well as its effect on community attitudes is illustrated by a recent class action suit brought by African-American and Latino plaintiffs who are residents of the Bronx, New York, against the City of New York and the New York City Police Department, contesting the department’s stop and frisk policy. (*Jaenean Ligon v. City of New York*, 2013) The presiding Federal judge found in part that police stop and frisk encounters with citizen-residents were unconstitutional based on the nature of the encounters. While the case is contested on constitu-

tional grounds, the nature of the case facts and judicial reflections on record are especially noteworthy. In particular, the case record reveals that when residents were stopped and questioned by police about their presence and purpose for being in the area, “*attempted explanations were met with hostility*; especially if the person is a young black man, he is frisked, which often involves an invasive search of his pockets; in some cases, the officers detain the person in a police van.” (32-33, italics added) The judge commented reflectively on an earlier era of policing wherein “a local officer might have politely posed these questions to a stranger . . . and the *stranger might have gladly consented to answer the questions . . . out of politeness or a sense of civic duty.*” (98-99, italics added) Similarly, Gau and Brunson (2010), in their study of “order maintenance” policing strategies that include stop and frisk practices, found that while young urban males in “disadvantaged neighborhoods” understood that “suspicion-based stops” by police were conducted to insure community safety, the frequency and nature of such encounters served to diminish the legitimacy of such practices in the eyes of individuals and the community. (264)

Tyler and Wakslak (2004), in four research studies, further explored the effect of citizens’ *feeling* profiled in comparison to *being* profiled based on their perceptions of police acting (or failing to act) with procedural fairness. (254-255) Notably, they found that citizen and community support for police, and the acknowledgement of legitimacy of police actions in encounters, were less likely affected by trust in the *motives* of police as authority figures and more likely influenced by the *actions* of police who were perceived as “neutral” and respectful. (257) Hence, the psychology of police encounters with the public provides a context in which to further understand the effect of perceived on citizen, officer, and community attitudes and behavior in such incidents. (see Bottoms and Tankebe, 2012, 160; Bayley, 2002)

The use of aggressive police tactics in suspicion-based incidents, then, must be evaluated by the manner in which they are exercised and experienced by the stakeholders in such encounters. Research has identified police organizational culture as an aggravating factor in this regard. For example, Gau and Brunson (2010) found that order maintenance practices that accompany “quality of life” stops and arrests for lower-level offenses are not as defined as are higher-level offense procedures.² As a result, police may be more likely to rely on “extra-legal” factors such as race and neighborhood in initiating encounters with citizens. (258) Furthermore, in an ethnographic study, Dabney (2010) found that

² “Quality of life” stops and arrests are made to promote and maintain a more secure neighborhood environment based on the premise that even low level suspicious behavior will not be tolerated in the community. (see Kelling and Bratton, 2003)

officers tend to consider the organizational focus on statistical data as a “numbers game” to reflect the effectiveness of precinct operations that is measured by arrests for felony and misdemeanor offenses without distinction. (39-40) In essence, police discretion becomes compromised and line officers feel pressured to make a greater number of arrests, even amid a statistical decline in area crime in order to satisfy superiors. While the pertinence of police organizational culture is not misplaced, it obscures a deeper concern regarding police officers’ sense of themselves in terms the power they possess, the sense of the “moral rightness of their powers,” and officers’ relationship to the community. (Tankebe, 2009, 15)

IMPLICATIONS REGARDING THE EXPERIENCE OF JUSTICE

The relationship of shame, a sense of fairness, and legitimacy that characterize the nature of encounters between police and citizens, informs the experience of justice. (Braithwaite, 2000, Tyler, 2006, and Sherman, 1993) Discussions of justice in criminal matters, however, tend to focus more on its implementation than the meaning of justice. Von Hirsch (2007), however, critically reflects that retribution in criminal matters conveys a certain moral dichotomy of good versus evil. This can lead to a “dualistic fallacy” of thinking that simply distinguishes the criminal from the non-criminal person as distinct entities. (see Hagan, 2008, 16, 66, 174-175)

Braithwaite (2006) constructs a broader landscape of meaning regarding justice. He proposes an integrative idea of justice that encompasses “legal justice,” identified with the criminal justice system, and “social justice” identified with systems of social welfare. (398) He asserts, however, that attempting to achieve such dual-dimensional justice is not possible within a more exclusively retributive systemic framework that seeks to “deliver equal punishment for equal wrongs.” (398, 399) In essence, within a more retributive context that aims to make sanctions proportionate to categories of similar offenses, a more individualized approach to justice is compromised. This, in turn, may diminish the public’s belief in the “legitimacy of legal authorities” and that justice has been done. (Tankebe, 2009, 9)

Tyler (2006) further points out that the perception of procedural justice as fairly exercised contributes to citizens’ compliance with the law and can be a basis for an effective system of formal legal control: “people accept as their own feelings of responsibility and obligation for their actions in society.” (313; also see 320-321) And Braithwaite (2006) asserts that in such instances, a person is less likely to perceive that respect for his/her rights has been violated by discrimination. (398)

It is clear, therefore, that the meaning and effect of police-citizen encounters are defined by more than the exercise of procedural tactics. Rather, the manner in which decisions are made and carried out in encounters influence citizens' sense of justice and as well as their behavior. Such a view, however, necessitates acknowledgement of the limits of a more exclusively retribution-centered idea of justice. The punitive, retribution-oriented ideology that has governed the American approach to justice in criminal matters since the 1970s has resulted in a more "negative relationship between the police, courts, and residents of American communities." (Tyler, 2006, 308) And, Nagin (1998) concludes that legal authorities may tolerate negative consequences as necessary crime control practices to maintain social order.

An alternative approach to justice, founded philosophically on respect for the dignity of persons, is restorative in nature and consistent with Braithwaite's idea of reintegrative shaming. The idea of restorative justice has historical roots but has developed since the 1970s, and is operative in more than three-hundred jurisdictions throughout the United States. (Van Wormer, 2001, 33) According to Bazemore (2007), in this context, crime or illicit behavior not only is a violation of law but harms victims, communities, and offenders alike. Furthermore, each of the three "stakeholders" of crime incidents - - victims, the community, and the offenders - - assumes a responsibility in support of one another to effect reparation and influence future behavior. (Clear and Dammer, 2003, 328) Citizens, then, become each other's keeper! In such an environment, premised on a belief in the dignity of the human person, the sense of justice "does not center on shame" but rather "focuses on obligation and responsibility." (Tyler, 2006, 320)

The meaning of restorative justice in criminal and sanctioning matters, therefore, necessarily includes a communitarian dimension which, according to Tyler and Wakslak (2004), is more likely to enhance police management of encounters by their treatment of those whom they serve. (276) This in turn represents a vital element of the efficacy of the community policing model in its deeper dimensions. In particular, in establishing a partnership with the community, police are challenged to make distinction between "social control" and "coercive control" and socialize residents to identify and report ominous situations and persons to police. (see Beck, Warner, and Olmer, 2010). But it also makes demands on police to become more deeply identified with neighborhoods in a community-centered and respected guardian role. Such an understanding of guardianship typically would be less likely in locales where residents have low levels of trust in police. (e.g., see Gau and Brunson 2010) The implementation of police tactics, such as stop and frisk, when undertaken in a community to which police are identified culturally and profession-

ally, requires the police to be more than providers of professional enforcement services to a community, or as Dai (2007) concluded, police and citizens become “*co-producers* of public safety.” (123, italics added; see also Davis, 2012)

IMPLICATIONS FOR CRIME CONTROL AND CRIME PREVENTION STRATEGIES

Crime control and crime prevention as co-dependent outcomes of aggressive policing practices such as stop and frisk must be assessed within the context of the nature of police-citizen encounters. Based on the foregoing development, order maintenance is not measured simply by crime rates but is influenced by public perception of procedural fairness and legitimacy of police practices which informs citizens’ sense of procedural justice and their behavior.

Wilson and Kelling (1982) initially proposed the Broken Windows policing strategy which provided a theoretical context for aggressive police tactics, such a stop and frisk. They utilize an analogy to “broken windows” to describe the effect of neighborhood disorder on crime and community safety. Conversely, social order contributes to a sense of safety in the community by enhancing residents’ shared identity and investment in the neighborhood. (29, 36)

In such an environment, police serve a means to “elevate . . . the level of public order” by an enforcement presence in the community. Police are more proactive and intervene in more benign patterns of disorderly behavior (e.g., drinking in public, prostitution, vandalism, defacing property) in order to prevent more serious criminal acts and greater community fear. (34): This approach envisions a community that more cohesively engaged in maintaining social order, than relying on “law enforcement per se.” (36)

Wilson and Kelling (1982), however, provide a less defined account of the ramifications of the nature of police interaction with the public in those community environments. For example, they acknowledge that the effect of broken windows on “fair treatment” of residents is problematic, since broken windows tactics are likely conducted in neighborhoods in which all or most residents are racial minority members. (36; also, see DeStefano 2014) This concern, however, is not discussed more specifically except to infer that a resolution would involve the need for police officers, through training and supervision, to develop “a clear sense of the outer limits of their discretionary authority.” (35) As a result, while Broken Windows conveys a certain centeredness on police not only as enforcement agents for regulation of behavior but as facilitators of order in the community, it less clearly identifies deeper implications of the

nature of interaction between police and the public in locales deemed to be disordered, on community safety.

The Broken Windows policing strategy has spawned scholarly discourse regarding its theoretical premise and applied outcomes. For example, Harcourt (1998), in his research regarding the relation of social disorder and crime in New York City, found a causal link between order-maintenance and the effects of aggressive policing. He argues, however, that aggressive policing tactics are legitimized as regulatory efforts and not necessarily in terms of any deterrent effect: “[stop and frisk tactics to improve “quality of life” in communities] have little to do with fixing broken windows and much more to do with arresting window breakers – or persons who look like they might break windows, or who are strangers, outsiders, or disorderly.” (28)

In 2006, Bratton and Kelling, in an apologetic response to their critics, posited that neighborhood disorder creates citizens’ fear of crime which diminishes social controls and creates an environment where crime can more readily exist. (78) They further argued that the “real world” demands that focus be prominently placed on procedural enforcement than on fixing broken windows environments.

Crime control and crime prevention, as complementary outcomes, however, encompass more than procedural control strategies. The perception of the community about the experience underlying these practices is most pertinent to social control outcomes. (Massaro, 1991, 1898) This is empirically supported in a recent study by Fratello, Rengifo, and Trone (2013) who surveyed about 500 people, 18 to 25, and also interviewed a smaller sample of 13- to 21-year-olds” in five high crime communities in the New York metropolitan area where residents were more likely to be stopped and questioned by police. Their research addressed the effect of such encounters on citizens and found that of those surveyed, 88% do not believe residents in their neighborhood trust police, only 24% would report a person whom they knew committed a crime, 40% would report a crime that they witnessed, and 41% would report a crime that victimized them. (17) This study also found that those surveyed maintained a strong racial-ethnic identity, as well as a sense of self-confidence and self-reliance (19), in spite of the overwhelming negative perceptions of police practices in their neighborhood life experiences. Weitzer (2000), in ethnographic research that compared a black lower-class neighborhood to respective white and black middle-class neighborhoods, further found that the social class structure of black neighborhoods may, at least in part, influence the attitudes of residents

toward police.³ Bayley (2002) emphasizes that residents' perceived sense of alienation by police discourages residents' cooperation with police and aggravates neighborhood hostility toward the system of law and its agents. In effect, then, both control and prevention of crime as complementary outcomes of aggressive police tactics are compromised. Attempting to address the matter of community safety without deeper acknowledgement of the effects of police-citizen suspicion-based encounters, then, is at best problematic.

As developed in this paper, control-based policing tactics for crime deterrence that generate public perception of procedural unfairness not only result in adverse reactions by the targeted communities and their residents, but also fosters a sense of social exclusion and broader skepticism regarding equity in the system of law. While deterrence-centered policing practices can contribute to crime control, at least based on reported diminishing crime trends, the realization of crime prevention goals require the implementation of procedures in a manner that will affect future behavioral decisions by citizens. Therefore, prevention of crime, which encompasses both the exercise and social perception of legal procedural implementation, cannot more simply be viewed as a contemporaneous outcome of crime control practices.

CONCLUSIONS

While crime rate data have served as a primary unit for analysis to evaluate community safety, their ramifications for crime control and prevention have not been more aggressively addressed. This paper, by a critical assessment of criminal justice and social scientific literature, has argued that suspicion-based encounters between police and citizens are characterized by the experience of shame that is inter-related with a perceived sense of fairness and justice whose effects extend to citizens, police officers and communities as stakeholders. As a result, traditional understanding and ramifications of crime control and crime prevention, as antecedents for community safety, must be revisited.

The nature of social interactive experiences in suspicious encounters between police and the public elicits citizens' perceptions regarding fairness or unfairness, and, based on findings of theoretical, analytic and empirical studies, affect both residents and their neighborhood communities. (Sherman, 1993; Braithwaite, 2000; Tyler and Wakslak, 2004; Tyler, 2006; Tankebe, 20008; Gau and Brunson, 2010) As a result, stop and frisk as an aggressive police tactic reveals deeper dimensions of meaning in regard to crime control and prevention. Fratello, Rengifo, and

³ Data compiled in research by Fratello, Rengifo, and Trace (2013) strongly imply that negative community perceptions regarding implementation of police stop and frisk tactics may also breed stronger racial group solidarity.

Trone (2013), in their study of the effects of stop and frisk on the public, identified an effect among racial/ethnic minority groups targeted for more aggressive policing tactics: “younger members of these racial and ethnic groups have such low opinions of police that they are unlikely even to report a violent crime against themselves. (21) Furthermore, data reveal that while the young residents of high-crime communities surveyed for this study reported high-levels of distrust of police officers, they also expressed a certain optimism founded on a strong racial identity and a feeling of trust by their friends. (20) What might comprise this “optimistic” self-view that seemingly coexists with young people’s skepticism about the legitimacy of the system of law and its agents?⁴ Would police-citizen encounters in suspicion-based incidents founded on a respect that Braithwaite (2000) describes in regard to reintegrative shaming serve to facilitate a sense of self-confidence among citizens that is informed by perceived legitimacy of law and its agents? In this regard, there is a need to more deeply understand the effect on police officers’ self-perception of the manner in which they carry out procedures in terms of their own sense of legitimacy as authority figures in encounters. (see Bottoms and Tankebe, 2012)

The social community context in which police and citizens encounter each other influences the manner in which police practices are experienced - - not only by citizens but by law enforcement officers themselves. According to Weitzer (2000), the social class structure of neighborhoods inform citizen perceptions of police and is predictive of policing strategies which are more likely to be proactive than reactive in poorer neighborhoods. (143) Accordingly, there is a need to understand “neighborhood-specific relations” between police and residents by a neighborhood contextual research approach. (152). Kemper (1978) affirms that even one-time meetings spawn perceptions in both stakeholders whether residents were previously known to police or not known. Consequently, in view of the influence of the social environment on citizen perceptions and attitudes, as well as on those of law enforcement officers, there is a need to develop and include programs of cultural awareness that combine service and learning, in police training curricula. In this regard, Bayley (2002) proposes that police are more likely persuaded by “evidence-based” training that maintaining a human rights sensitivity in implementing legal procedures facilitates the control and prevention of crime. (135) The learning objectives of such training

⁴ This finding by Fratello, Rengio, and Trone (2012) is consistent with the results of social psychological research by Asencio (2013) that affirms principles of identity theory; namely, that appraisals by members of one’s social networks of trusted others serve to support one’s self-image than appraisals by criminal justice agents.

should extend to experiential awareness of the process underlying different citizen outlooks and response in these encounters.

The goals of crime control and crime prevention, when politicized, tend to be presented as contemporaneous effects of aggressive policing tactics. However, the nature of police-citizen encounters emphasizes the need for criminal justice policy initiatives to address control and prevention of crime as outcomes of a longer-term and more complex process correlated not simply to procedural tactics but to the social context in which they are implemented. The result may be a new path to deterrence based on a deeper understanding of the nature of police encounters with the public and their effects on shaping the attitudes, behavior, and sense of justice among citizens, the community, and law enforcement agents alike.

REFERENCES

- Asencio, Emily. (2013). Self-esteem, reflected appraisals, and self-views: Examining criminal and worker identities. *Social Psychology Quarterly* 76(4), 291-313.
- Bayley, David. (2002). Law enforcement and the rule of law: Is there a tradeoff. *Commentary* 2 (1), 133-154.
- Bazemore, G. (2007). The expansion of punishment and the restriction of justice: Loss of limits in the implementation of retributive policy. *Social Research*, 74 (2), 651-662.
- Beck, Elizabeth, Warner, Barbara D., and Ohmer, Mary L. (2010). Linking informal social control and restorative justice: Moving disorganization theory beyond community policing. *Contemporary Justice Review* 13 (4), 355-369.
- Bottoms, Anthony and Tankebe, Justice (2012). Beyond procedural justice: A dialogic approach to legitimacy in criminal justice. *The Journal of Criminal Law and Criminology* 102 (1), 119-170.
- Braithwaite, John. (2000). Shame and criminal justice. *Canadian Journal of Criminology* 42 (3), 281-298.
- (2002). Setting standards for restorative justice. *British Journal of Criminology* 42, 563-577.
- Buntin, John. (2013, July 14). What does it take to stop crips and bloods from killing each other? *The New York Times*, pp. 38-55.
- Bratton, William J. and Kelling, George. (2006). There are cracks in broken windows. *National Review* (On-line). Available: http://old.nationalreview.com/comment/bratton_kelling200602281015.asp
- Buntin, John (2013, July 14). Peace in gangland. *New York Times Magazine*, 36-39, 44, 54-55.

- Chayes, Matthew. (2012, August 2). False stats at two precincts. *Newsday*, p. A 2.
- Clear, T. and Dammer, H. (2003). *The offender and the community 2nd Ed.* Belmont, CA: Wadsworth.
- Cohen, Ronald L. (2001). Provocations of restorative justice. *Social Justice Research* 14 (2), 209-232.
- Dabney, Dean. (2010). Observations regarding key operational reality in a Compstat model of policing. *Justice Quarterly* 27 (1), 28-51.
- Dai, Mengyan. (2007). Procedural justice during police-citizen encounters. Unpublished Doctoral Dissertation. University of Cincinnati.
- Davis, Michael A. Community building as crime control. *American policing in 2022: Essays in the future of a profession*. Eds. Debra Cohen McCullough and Deborah L. Spence. 2012. Washington, DC: U.S. Department of Justice, 29-32.
- DeSterfano, Anthony (2014, August 5). Crime analyst stands by 'windows' tactic. *Newsday*, p. A 28.
- (2013, January 9). NYPD loses ruling. *Newsday*, p. A5
- Deutsch, Morton. (2006). A framework for thinking about oppression and its change. *Social Justice Research* 19 (1), 7-41.
- Doolin, K. (2007). But what does it mean: Seeking definitional clarity in restorative justice. *Journal of Criminal Law*, 71 (5), 427-440.
- Dorne, C.K. (2008). *Restorative justice in the United States*. Upper Saddle River, NJ: Prentice-Hall.
- Eterno, John.A. (2012, June 18). Policing by numbers. *The New York Times*, p. A 23.
- Fagan, Jeffrey and Davies, Garth. (2000). Street stops and broken windows: Terry, race, and disorder in New York City. *Fordham Urban Law Journal* 28 (2), 455 – 504.
- Fagan, Jeffrey, Zimring, Franklin, and Kim, June. 1998, Declining homicide in New York City: A tale of two trends. *Journal of Criminal Law and Criminology* 88 (4), 1277-1323.
- Foucault, Michel. (1977). *Discipline and Punish*. London: Allan Lane.
- Fratello, Jennifer, Rengifo, Andres F., and Trone, Jennifer. (2013). Coming of age with stop and frisk: Experiences, self-perceptions, and public safety implications. New York: Vera Institute of Justice.
- Frazier, Charles.E. and Meisenhelder, Thomas. (1985). Exploratory notes on criminality and emotional ambivalence. *Qualitative Sociology* 8 (3), 266-284.

- Garvey, Stephen P. (1998). Can shaming punishments educate? *Cornell Law Faculty Publications* Paper 277, 733-794.
- Gau, Jacinta.M. and Brunson, Rod K. (2010). Procedural and order maintenance policing: A study of inner-city young men's perceptions of police legitimacy. *Justice Quarterly* 27 (2), 255-279.
- Gopnik, Adam. (2012, January 30). The caging of America. *The New Yorker*, 3-13.
- Gray, Rebecca. (2010). Shame, labeling and stigma: Challenges to counseling in alcohol and other drug settings. *Contemporary Drug Problems* 37, 685-703.
- Hagan, Frank. 2008. *Introduction to Criminology-6th Ed.* Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage.
- Harcourt, Bernard J. (1998). Reflecting on the subject: A critique of the social influence conception of deterrence, broken windows theory, and order-maintenance policing New York style. *Michigan Law Review* 97 (2), 291-388.
- Hutson, Matthew (2013, August 18). Good deeds gone bad." *The New York Times*, p. 12.
- Jaenean Ligon v. City of New York, 12 CV 2274 (S.D.N.Y. 2013)
- Kelling, George L. and Bratton, William J. (2003). Declining crime rates: Insiders' view of the New York City story. In *Controversies in Criminal Justice*. (ed.) Schoot H. Decker, Leanne F. Alarid, and Charles M. Katz. Los Angeles, CA: Roxbury Publishing.
- Kemper, Theodore D. (1978). *A Social Interactional Theory of Emotions*. New York: John Wiley and Sons.
- Massaro, Toni. (1991). Shame, culture, and American criminal law. *Michigan Law Review* 89, 1-59.
- Morrison, Brenda. (2006). School bullying and restorative justice: Toward a theoretical understanding of the role of respect, pride, and shame. *Journal of Social Issues* 62 (2), 371-392.
- Murphy, K. (2009A). Procedural justice and affect intensity: Understanding reactions to Regulatory authorities. *Social Justice Review* 22, 1-30.
- (2009B). Public satisfaction with police: The importance of procedural justice and police performance in police-citizen encounters. *The Australian and New Zealand Journal of Criminology* 42 (2), 159-178.

- Nagin, D.S. (1998). Criminal deterrence research at the onset of the twenty-first century. In M. Tonry (ed.), *Crime and justice*, 23, 1-42. Chicago: University of Chicago Press.
- National Evaluation of the COPS Program*. 2000. National Institute of Justice. Washington, DC.
- Note: Shame, stigma, and crime. (2003). Evaluating the efficacy of shaming sanctions in criminal law. *Harvard Law Review* 116 (7), 2186-2208.
- Papachristos, Andrew W., Meares, Tracey L., and Fagan, Jeffrey. (2012). Why do criminals obey the law: The influence of legitimacy and social networks on active gun offenders. *The Journal of Criminal Law and Criminology* 102 (2), 397-442.
- Riesig, Michael.D., Bales, William D., Hay, Carter, and Wang, Xia (2007). The effect of racial inequality on black male recidivism. *Justice Quarterly* 24 (3), 408-434.
- Savage, Charlie and Goode, Erica (2013, August 13). Judge rejects New York's stop-and-frisk policy. *The New York Times*. p. A1, A16.
- Sherman, Lawrence (1993). Defiance, deterrence, and irrelevance: At theory of criminal sanction. *Journal of Research in Crime and Delinquency* 30 (4), 445-473.
- Scheff, Thomas. and Retzinger, Suzanne. (1997). Shame, anger, and the social bond: A theory of Available: [http://www.TASA.org/library/pdfs/TAASAL library/49.pdf](http://www.TASA.org/library/pdfs/TAASAL%20library/49.pdf)
- Sourcebook of Criminal Justice Statistics*. (2010). Department of Justice, Bureau of Justice Statistics. Washington, DC. Available: <http://www.albany.edu/sourcebook/pdf/t422010.pdf>.
- Stuntz, William. J. (2011). *The collapse of American criminal justice*. Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press.
- Tankebe, Justice. (2008). Policing, procedural fairness and public behavior: A review and critique. *International Journal of Police Science and Management* 11 (1), 8-19.
- Terrill, William and Paoline, Eugene A. (2007). Non-arrest decision-making in police-citizen encounters. *Police Quarterly* 10 (3), 308-331.
- Terry v. Ohio, 392, U.S. 1 (1968)
- Tyler, Tom. (2006). Restorative justice and procedural justice: Dealing with law-breaking. *Journal of Social Issues* 62 (2), 307-326.

- Tyler, Tom. R. and Wakslak, Cheryl .J. (2004). Profiling and police legitimacy: Procedural justice, attributions of motive, and acceptance of police authority. *Criminology* 42 (2), 253-281.
- Uniform Crime Report*. (2010). Federal Bureau of Investigation, Department of Justice, Washington, DC. Available: <http://www.fbi.gov/about-us/cjis/ucr/crime-in-the-u.s/2010/crime-in-the-u.s.-2010/index-page>
- U.S. Department of Justice (1997). *Police integrity: Public service with honor*. National Institute of Justice, Washington, DC.
- U.S. Department of Justice. (2001). *Principles for promoting police integrity: Examples of promising police practices and policies*. Office of Justice Programs, Washington, DC.
- U.S. Department of Justice (2005). *Enhancing police integrity*. Office of Justice Programs, Washington, DC.
- Von Hirsch, Andrew. (2007). The “desert” model for sentencing: Its influences. *Social Research* 74 (2), 413-434.
- Van Wormer, K. (2001, November). Restoring justice. *USA Today*, 32-34.
- Weitzer, Ronald. (2000). Racialized policing: Residents’ perceptions in three neighborhoods. *Law and Society Review* 34 (1), 129-155.
- Whitman, James. (2007). What happened to Tocqueville’s America? *Social Research* 74 (2), 251-268.
- Wilson, James Q. and Kelling, George L.(1982, March 1). The police and neighborhood safety: Broken windows. *The Atlantic Monthly*, 29-38.
- Zhao, Jihong, Scheider, Matthew, and Thruman, Quint. Funding community policing to reduce crime: have COPS grants made a difference? *Criminology and Public Policy* 2 (1), 7-32.
- Zimring, Franklin. (2007). *The Great American Crime Decline*. New York, NY: Oxford University Press.
- (2012). *The City That Became Safe*. New York, NY: Oxford University Press.

ENACTING “SMOKE, LILIES, AND JADE” AS BLACK GAY PRINT CULTURE

Shawn Anthony Christian
Wheaton College

“funny how characters in books said the things one wanted to say.”

—“Smoke, Lilies and Jade” (1926)

As one of several musings that the character Alex utters in Richard Bruce Nugent’s landmark short story “Smoke, Lilies, and Jade,” this idea about the role of characters in books resonates in how two contemporary films—Isaac Julien’s *Looking for Langston* (1989) and Rodney Evans’ *Brother to Brother* (2004)—position “Smoke” as relevant for their, and by implication, other narrative representations of “transgressive black sexuality” (Carbado et al 2002, 11). In visualizing the past that is the Harlem Renaissance through depictions of “Smoke,” both films affirm a black gay print culture as indispensable to black gay film.

First published in the short-lived but infamous journal *FIRE!!*, “Smoke, Lilies, and Jade” was contemporaneously critiqued and subsequently marginalized because of its content.¹ Evocative of the New Negro era’s dynamic identity (re)formations, “Smoke” casts Alex as a young man who contemplates his desires while he negotiates social and familial expectations. The story’s narrator characterizes Alex as a wanderer and introduces him to readers in terms of his unfocused desire: “*He wanted to do something . . . to write or draw . . . or something . . .*” “All he wanted to do was . . . lay there comfortably smoking . . . think . . . wishing he were writing . . . or drawing . . . or something . . . something about the things he felt and thought” (Nugent 1926, 33). Notwithstanding the art that Alex encounters in Harlem, “Smoke, Lilies, and Jade” comprises neither scenes of *him* actually writing or drawing nor referencing a past artistic work, except for his mother’s derisive statement, “just because you’ve tried to write one or two little poems that no one understands” (34). What the short story does detail is, however, Alex’s appreciation of the male body and connection—emotional and

¹ David Levering Lewis’s editorial note in *The Portable Harlem Renaissance Reader* provides a useful example of subsequent interpretations of the contemporaneous response to Nugent’s short story. Lewis describes “Smoke, Lilies, and Jade” as, “the scandal of the Harlem Renaissance, an impressionistic celebration of androgyny, homosexuality, and drugs” (569).

physical—with another artist. In the midst of their first encounter, Alex locates one of his desires in “Beauty”:

... the echo of their steps mingled ... they walked in silence ... the castanets of their heels clicking in accompaniment ... the stranger inhaled deeply and with a nod of content and a smile ... blew a cloud of smoke ... Alex felt like singing ... the stranger knew the magic of blue smoke also ... they continued in silence ... the castanets of their heels clicking rhythmically ... Alex turned in his doorway ... up the stairs and the stranger waited for him to light the room ... no need for words ... they had always known each other ... as they undressed by the blue dawn ... Alex knew he had never seen a more perfect being ... his body was all symmetry and music ... and Alex called him Beauty ... long they lay ... blowing smoke and exchanging thoughts ... and Alex swallowed with difficulty ... he felt a glow of tremor ... and they talked and ... slept. (36)

Alex internalizes his relationship with Beauty, or his white male lover Adrian, as an uncontrollable and confusing complement to his love for Melva. Michael Cobb describes this dynamic as “Smoke” as “two loves—man and woman, race and sexuality—that exist not only at the same time, but also in the same aesthetic articulation, the same literary phrase” (2000, 346). The extended focus on Alex’s multi-form desires pointedly mark “Smoke, Lilies, and Jade” as a narrative of black queer desire and artistry for which the short story is most known (Dickel 2012, 91).

“Smoke” now benefits from a celebratory discourse that several histories forge including the inaugural issue of *Other Countries* (1987), Joseph Allen Boone’s *Libidinal Currents* (1998), Thomas Wirth’s *Gay Rebel of the Harlem Renaissance* (2002), and the anthology *Black Like Us* (2002). Though the earliest of the texts that I note in this regard, *Other Countries* provides a useful illustration of this important historicizing. Editor Colin Robinson constructs a “family tree” through which he announces the volume’s conception in 1988 and notes that “Smoke, Lilies, and Jade” is an early relative of this “new manchild in a family whose” works function as a “small but growing canon of Black Gay Male literature” (1987, 1). Whether in terms of the short story’s primacy, content, or relationship to the Harlem Renaissance, the historiography of “Smoke, Lilies, and Jade” often positions it as a point of origin in black queer, literary history. As I demonstrate below, *Looking for Langston* and *Brother to Brother* echo and recreate Alex’s experience in

ways that position both films as efforts to further projects that detail black gay identities in print.

An early example of this cultural work is Robert Reid Pharr's bibliography "Books, journals, and periodicals by black gay authors and publishers." A contribution to the landmark anthology *Brother to Brother: New Writing by Black Gay Men*, "books, journals, and periodicals . . ." brought together titles of published works, periodicals, and anthologies that served, according to Reid-Pharr, as a "beginning for assessing the development of a black gay literary sensibility" (1991, 263). Gershun Avilez has also argued that "in constructing the history of US black writing on and about sexuality, it is crucial to consider marginal and unpublished works as well, specifically letters, diaries, and creative work that was drafted but never circulated for publication. These marginal documents often express nonconventional sexual desires and feelings that were not deemed appropriate or suitable for published work" (2014, 313). Both of these categories of print comprise institutional efforts that collect, preserve, and make this material accessible such as the African American Lesbian and Gay Print Culture Collection (as part of the Atlanta-Fulton Public Library) and the Schomburg Center's In the Life Archive (as part of the New York Public Library). Along with these and other registers of black gay print culture, *Looking for Langston* and *Brother to Brother* underscore the idea that "African Americans in every walk of life used the printed word to inform and enrich their lives and to determine their destinies in new ways" (Danky 2009, 358).

While sixteen years separate Julien's *Looking* and Evans's *Brother*, both films feature the public and private life of a black male artist during and beyond the period: Julien's "meditation" contemplates Langston Hughes, and Evans offers *Brother* as homage to Nugent. *Looking*'s visual depiction of the sojourn that Nugent's Alex has with Beauty reifies Nugent's aesthetic and ultimately positions "Smoke" as one among several cultural texts that articulate black gay desire. Julien renders that aesthetic through montage in *Looking* and argues the viability of film for recovering black gay history to (re)affirm black gay identity, especially its operations in literary and print archives. In Evans's *Brother*, "Smoke" serves as a conduit for an intergenerational collaboration that honors Nugent (portrayed by Roger Robinson) as a black gay male artist.² To reimage and reimagine "Smoke" in *Brother to Brother*, Evans contemplates Nugent's desire for the collaborations of his earlier life and, thereby, privileges homosocial rather than homoerotic bonds. Similar to how they employ other Harlem Renaissance era writing, film footage, music, and photographs, Julien and Evans also feature "Smoke, Lilies,

² I discuss this bond in more detail in "Between Black Gay Men: Artistic Collaboration and the Harlem Renaissance in *Brother to Brother*."

and Jade,” the material story itself, as a central diegetic element. Their approaches to filmmaking—locating in print the resources for stories that demand (re)telling—follows that of one of the Harlem Renaissance’s most prolific and influential filmmakers, Oscar Micheaux.

In 1915 Micheaux’s contemporary W. E. B. Du Bois helped forge a public discourse that captured many African Americans’ responses to Thomas Dixon’s *The Clansman*. Du Bois not only argued against Dixon’s vision of the “Negro represented either as an ignorant fool, a vicious rapist, a venal and unscrupulous politician or a faithful but doddering idiot,” but he also urged readers of the National Association for the Advancement of Colored People’s (NAACP) *Crisis* to understand the power that Dixon’s story gained as it extended, through adaptations, to theater and growing film audiences (1915, 33). Du Bois’s campaign called attention to such mass appeal and conveyed that countering this appeal was a major motivation for the production of creative arts among African Americans in the first decades of the twentieth century. His insights echoed many African Americans’ understanding that a challenge over the image of African America constituted the relationship between early American cinema and their wealth of broadsides, pamphlets, newspapers, journals, and anthologies—a catalogue David Levering Lewis clearly had in mind when he described the period as forging the practice of “civil rights by copyright” (1995, xxxii).

Du Bois and a host of his contemporaries became a formidable contingent a short time later when, first, they castigated and protested the film adaptation of Dixon’s *The Clansman*, the infamous *Birth of a Nation*, and then called for, produced, and celebrated as a renaissance numerous works representing several artistic genres including Micheaux’s *Within Our Gates* (1919), Noble Sissle and Eubie Blake’s *Shuffle Along* (1921), Jean Toomer’s *Cane* (1923), Bessie Smith’s “Backwater Blues” (1927), and Augusta Savage’s *Gamin* (1929). Micheaux mounted his response through film. He underscored the value of African American writers’ work including his own early foray into fiction because, as he argued, “before we expect to see ourselves featured on the silver screen as we live, hope, act, and think today, men and women must write original stories of Negro life” (Micheaux 1919, 9). While African Americans’ responses to (mis)representations of their experiences in early American cinema were not the first instance of this critical interplay (Harriet Beecher Stowe’s *Uncle Tom’s Cabin*, for example, spawned a great deal of antebellum black writing), African Americans’ burgeoning literature and visual culture in the first decades of the twentieth century coalesced as sites of redress and complex image (re)making. As a result, the New Negro era and its Harlem Renaissance offer instructive contexts for examining representations of African American identity at and as the nexus

of African Americans' print and visual cultures. Micheaux's pioneering work made use of the era's print culture to harness the potential of film as a visual technology for racial representation. A similar relationship to and understanding of African Americans' print culture operates in how Julien and Evan align their films with Nugent's "Smoke."

Along with other queer narratives from the period, "Smoke, Lilies, and Jade" forms part of the foundation for Henry Louis Gates's seminal contention that the Harlem Renaissance "was surely as gay as it was Black, not that it was exclusively either of these things" (1993, 202).³ Nugent's aim to have "Smoke, Lilies, and Jade" "shock" its contemporaneous readers turns on such clear yet complex recognition (Wirth 2002, 6). As a component of New Negro consciousness, its textual representation of fluid sexuality, specifically its intimate yet elliptical articulation of Alex's desires, amplified the approaches of similar narratives. Together, these texts troubled the heteronormative premises of the era's racial uplift discourse and practices often through strategic valences.

In their readings of Nella Larsen's *Passing* for example, several scholars make similar observations. Judith Butler writes that "in a sense, the conflict of lesbian desire in the story can be read in what is almost spoken, in what is withheld from speech, but which always threatens to stop or disrupt speech. And in this sense the muteness of homosexuality converges in the story with illegibility of Clare's blackness" (1993, 175). As Charles Scruggs similarly notes, "sexual desire in *Passing* then cannot be reduced to a simple theme" (2007, 161). To extend Scruggs' point, it is necessary to underscore that representations of sexual desire during the Harlem Renaissance, which often replicated uplift-sanctioned, middle-class, procreative, and heterosexual relations, belied the actual although difficult to document range of sexual desires that African Americans possessed and exhibited. "Smoke, Lilies and Jade" suggested the reality of this range and claimed space, literarily, for representations of black queer desires in the Harlem Renaissance's dynamic print culture.

Given Nugent's modernist influences and engagements, David Gerstner notes that "Smoke" is "not unlike the work of avant-garde filmmakers who manipulate time and space to express a wide range of erotic experiences" (2011, 45). With its brief sequence of events rendering time elusive, "Smoke" moves between the two to three days or weeks of Alex's present, the memories of his past, and his recurring dreams. Just as works such as *Passing* do, "Smoke" forges a similar relationship to Harlem, New York's physical and cultural landscape and constructs it as

³ In his treatment of the period, Simon Dickel notes that, "In addition to representations of black homosexual characters in texts by white writers [. . .] there are homosexual characters in texts by black writers, too" (88). To illustrate his point, Dickel lists novels *Home to Harlem*, *Infants of the Spring*, and *The Blacker the Berry* and "Poem [2]" by Langston Hughes.

a backdrop and catalyst for an articulation and exploration of Alex's desires—for artistry, for emotional connection, for intellectual stimulation, and as a sexual being. For the individual African American in the early twentieth century, "desire," sexual or otherwise, was caught up in and influenced, in part, by a range of external dynamics—for example, migration, war, poverty—that shaped individual and collective experiences. Equally as determining were the changes to African Americans' social position in terms of literacy, citizenship, and the ascendance of Jim Crow America, which uses of the phrase "New Negro" sought to redress. This different "status" influenced not only what it meant to have desire but also, given fewer constraints than the individual subject had under slavery, how one expressed it. Since, as Siobhan Somerville demonstrates, "the colorline was fundamentally eroticized in the early twentieth century," it not surprising that (greater) expressions of racial affinity and sexual desire occur simultaneously in the era of the New Negro (2000, 35). As a moniker, "New Negro" reflected more individual expressions of self- and racial pride and operated in what Alain Locke noted was a "vibrant . . . new psychology" and a "new spirit . . . [that was] awake in the masses" (1925, 3). As a result, formulations and celebrations of the New Negro were important expressions of desire.

Through Alex's own, New Negro projection, Harlem is not only New York, the city that he comes to at age fourteen, but it is also an artist enclave where Zora Neal Hurston and Wallace Thurman's Niggerati live, play, and create; the story makes references, in almost A-list fashion, to Alex's social circle, which includes several Harlem Renaissance luminaries such as [George Washington] "Carver," "Mr. [Paul] Robeson," "Zora" [Neale Hurston], and "Wallie" [Wallace Thurman] (Nugent 1926, 36, 38). Harlem is a (fictional) cultural arts landscape wherein Alex attends a performance of Langston Hughes and Hall Johnson's *Fy-ah Lawd*, a post-performance party at Augusta's, and then ends up at Forno's restaurant because "every one came to Forno's once maybe only once" (36). Through "Smoke, Lilies, and Jade," Harlem is also the place where Alex walks "narrow blue street[s that meet] the stars" and then experiences Beauty.

Though *Looking* and *Brother* revise Alex's encounter with Beauty as I discuss below, this rendering is only one way in which they "look back" to "Smoke." A compelling, shared element in Julien and Evans's films is death—whereas a funeral opens *Looking*, one of Nugent's final hours closes *Brother*. Such contemplations of physical loss help achieve the nostalgia that each film produces. They also function as evidence for Cobb's assertion that the Harlem Renaissance is important for: a queer literary tradition" because "it gives us a possible explanation for why so much of contemporary queer visibility is reliant and thrives on death and

unconventional forms" (2000, 347). For example, Julien extends his use of montage to juxtapose a staged funeral (his own) with footage of and voice-overs from Hughes to compel viewers to consider Hughes's life, work, and death as viable resources for imagining him as a black queer subject.

Importantly, *Looking for Langston* and *Brother to Brother* also borrow and reformulate Nugent's celebratory account of Harlem, especially as the ground upon which black artists come of age. In addition to footage of Harlem's infamous 125th Street and its black residents moving about this and other streets on foot or via the subway, both films incorporate photograph stills of portraits of Harlem Renaissance artists.⁴ Similar to the first names of Alex's coterie that "Smoke, Lilies, and Jade" notes, one scene in *Looking* catalogues members of the older and younger generations of African American artists. Timed with narration from Stuart Hall, the scene centers on the photographs of men that constitute an important network. An extension of scenes that link Hughes's voice, visage, and art to that of James Baldwin and Richard Bruce Nugent, Hall reads from Hilton Als's "Introduction to Negro Faggotry in the Harlem Renaissance:"

Langston Hughes. Friend of Countee Cullen. Friend of Bruce Nugent. Friend of Alain Locke. Friend of Wallace Thurman. Admired for their intelligence and their art, were they seeking the approval of their race or the black middle class and the white literary establishment? Langston Hughes wrote that, "the ordinary Negro never heard of the Harlem Renaissance, or, if he did, it hadn't raised his wages any." Baraka said Harlem was vicious modernism, bang clash vicious the way it was made. They could not understand such beauty so violent and transforming. But could he understand the beauty of the people with freakish ways? Homosexuality was sin against the race, so it had to be kept secret, even if it was a widely shared one. (Julien 2007)

Julien revises the interrelations of Harlem Renaissance artists that Nugent images in "Smoke" and renders more explicit the cultural politics circumscribing such social relations and, through reference to Amiri Baraka's earlier reading, subsequent efforts to historicize the period.

Similarly, through a cast of actors whose physical features remind informed viewers of the real Nugent, especially Duane Boutte as Young

⁴ As Paula J. Masood argues of recurring symbols in African American urban cinema, the "train references the related tropes of mobility and entrapment, two of the most recurrent themes in African American cultural production in the twentieth century" (200).

Bruce, and the other artists that help define the Harlem Renaissance's younger generation, Evans's *Brother* creates a montage of their coming-of-age and through Bruce's eyes. Because *Brother to Brother* depicts an older Nugent reflecting upon his youth, perhaps the most poignant moment of its reflection on Harlem as a fertile ground for black arts and artists is Bruce's contemplative reflection on Wallace Thurman's death and the loss of Niggerati Manor's vibrancy. In answer to Perry's, "Where did Langston go? And Zora, and Aaron, and the rest of them?" Bruce declaratively yet despondently replies "slowly, we all moved out" (Evans 2004). Through its nostalgia for the Harlem Renaissance, this scene functions as a viable rejoinder to "*To Be Continued*," which concludes "Smoke, Lilies, and Jade" (Nugent 1926, 39).

The foregrounding of "Smoke" that *Looking* and *Brother* do is possible, of course, because of the recovery work that precedes both films and to which they contribute. Julien notes that "obviously, trying to talk about black gay history in any way becomes problematic because of the different sequences and hidden nuances in black American history. I had to look to America because that seemed to be where most of the history was located" (Hemphill 1991, 175). Though its signal functioning as part of this history was more readily accessible for Julien when he made *Looking* because Nugent and his biographer Thomas Wirth reissued *FIRE!!* just a few years prior to Nugent's death in 1987, "Smoke" is also characteristic of the ways that the "history of African American lesbians and gays currently exists in fragments, in scattered documents, in fiction, poetry, and blues lyrics, in hearsay, and in innuendo" (Smith 1998, 83). In related ways, *Looking* and *Brother* gather these artifacts into and through film and strive, as Evans argues about *Brother to Brother*, to "acknowledge the diversity and complexity within the African American and gay and lesbian communities and to give voice to experiences that have been vastly underrepresented in cinema for far too long" (Evans 2013).

What Jacquie Jones argues about Marlon Riggs' *Tongues Untied* (1989)—to which both films are indebted—has utility for clarifying the intertextual work that *Looking* and *Brother* produce. According to Jones, "the film [*Tongues Untied*] integrates on all levels, structurally and thematically, and ultimately delineates the immediacy of situating the sexual at the core of self-definition by equalizing it with the political and social imperatives of Blackness" (Jones 1993, 256). Deployed through cinematic strategies similar to those that Riggs employs for enunciating black gay subjectivity, *Looking*'s and *Brother*'s uses of "Smoke" and other *print artifacts* fuse black literary and film histories as reciprocal and constitutive of black gay history. Both films achieve this effect through their figurative depictions of Nugent's Alex.

In *Looking*, Alex's recreation honors Nugent and "Smoke" but also serves to position both within the projections of black British and American queer subjectivities that is *Looking for Langston*. As its title suggests, these projections begin with the film's focus on Langston Hughes. An echo of David Jarraway's assertion that "the poetry of Langston Hughes repeatedly rises to the challenge of producing a discourse of the critical Other—a discourse of a differing, hence, deferred subjectivity," *Looking* is a complement to Hughes's own reflection on his identity formation such as his 1940 autobiography *The Big Sea* (829, 1995). Through *Looking*, Julien furthers the suggestion that Hughes's life and development as a writer are part of a changing but not fully changed time that could only allow an emerging artist's cautious self-representation. The editors of *Black Like Us* remind us that "notwithstanding the fact that the Harlem Renaissance enjoys a popular reputation as a period of extreme sexual permissiveness and gay-themed artistic expression, homosexuality retained an outlaw status that few blacks embraced at the time and, given the extreme racial subordination of the period, that still fewer would have championed alongside matters of race and class" (Carbado et al 2002, 3). *Looking*'s depiction of Hughes in relation to the film's explorations of black gay males' desires and actions during the Harlem Renaissance through extant letters, photographs, commentaries, and fiction such as Nugent's "Smoke, Lilies and Jade" signifies on both Hughes's self-representations and historical projections of representative blackness onto his life and work. In doing so, *Looking for Langston* counters narratives that attempt to render Hughes' homosexuality or bisexuality an historical impossibility.⁵

In an early and influential reading of *Looking*, Gates argues that "visually . . . there's a circulation of images between the filmic present and the archival past. Textually, something of the same interplay is enacted, with poetry and prose from Bruce Nugent ('Smoke, Lilies and Jade,' which receives perhaps the most elaborate and affecting *tableau vivant* in the film), Langston Hughes (including selections from "The Negro Artist and the Racial Mountain," *The Big Sea*, *Montage of a Dream Deferred*, and other works), James Baldwin (from *The Price of the Ticket*), an essay by the critic and journalist Hilton Als, and six poems by Essex Hemphill. We hear an interchange of different voices, different inflections, different accents: including Stuart Hall reading expository prose of Hilton Als, Langston Hughes reading his own work, Toni Morrison reading Baldwin, and Erick Ray Evans reading Bruce Nugent" (1993, 202). Gates's attention to the powerful effects of Julien's layered representation is instructive, especially in framing Julien's repre-

⁵ Charles Nero's "Re/membering Langston: Homophobic Textuality and Arnold Rampersad's *Life of Langston Hughes* (1997).

sensation as one that builds from what Caroline Goesser describes elsewhere as double-voiced narration (2007, ix). What interests me, too, are the ways that *Looking* employs either extant copies or artistic reproductions of the words of many of these figures, especially Hughes.

Looking achieves its first literary depiction through a voice-over from Riverside Radio's "In Memoriam: Langston Hughes" and television footage of Hughes reading from a book of poetry and reciting the lines "the sun's a settin' . . ." before he turns to the poem "Too Blue." What precedes and follows this scene are parts of the interplay that Gates describes and serves as conduit to the metaphorical journey that coheres the film. Julien's *Looking* posits that to "look for" Langston Hughes is to also uncover "Smoke." Just before *Looking*'s recreation of Nugent's short story, Julien provides one of the scenes that produce the film's montage. This staged array of articles, photographs, books and voice-over narration is equally as provocative as the suggestion that the scene makes about Harlem Renaissance print culture. As the camera pans from left to right, as though perusing this assemblage, it films contemporaneous and later responses to Harlem Renaissance print culture, which carry titles such as *FIRE!!*, "Taint Nobody Business," and "Black Gays: What can history books tell us?" (Julien 2007). This assemblage paired with Hall's voice-over also serves as useful answer to the question that comprises the subtitle of "Black Gays." In this moment, *Looking* contends that despite the initial visibility that "Smoke" experiences "history books tell" very little because they perpetuate the secrecy that Hall names. *Looking* returns to, but reimagines the Harlem Renaissance, to counter such secrecy and aligns the period with the film's contemporaneous context.

Reinterpreted in *Looking* as a signal instance of the Harlem Renaissance's tapestry, "Smoke" is decidedly about same-sex desire. Julien excerpts and fuses Alex's dream, which occurs just after Alex decides that "he would like Beauty to know Melva because he loved them both" (Nugent 1926, 37). In *Looking*, Alex's conflict is not about how to reconcile and live out his bisexuality but, rather, is over the circumscriptions that white male gaze and his internalized shame level at Alex's efforts to realize his desires and love for Beauty.

Looking's subsequent depictions of Essex Hemphill's poetry and voice further its efforts at reformulating "Smoke" into a continuum of pointed narratives of racially-inflected, same-sex desire. With a sequence of scenes visualizing Hemphill's "Where the Seed Falls," "If His Name Were Mandingo," and "Under Certain Circumstances" following *Looking*'s "Smoke," Julien positions Nugent's "Smoke" as ancestor and Hemphill's poems as descendants; thematically Hemphill's poems offer reflections on same-sex desire in the contemporary moment, especially in

the context of the late 1980s AIDS crisis and the racialized objectification that black gay men experience. In his pivotal reading of the film, Kobena Mercer has argued more specifically that Julien's "desire to unravel the hidden histories of the Harlem Renaissance serves as an emblem for an inventory of the diverse textual resources which have informed the renaissance and renewal of black artistic and cultural practices in [then] contemporary Britain" (1993, 250). Julien's recreation of "Smoke" establishes, then, the tone for the remaining print to film enactments that structure *Looking* as montage.

Evans's *Brother to Brother* similarly portrays "Smoke" through revision. Sam Park notes that "as in Julien's film, Nugent's story 'Smoke, Lilies, and Jade' serves as both narrative through-line and running motif. In *Brother to Brother*, the story binds Nugent and Perry, as each takes turns reciting or reading portions of it to the other. When Perry discovers it in the library, his epiphany resonates at multiple levels—a sense of pride at uncovering a long-lost black queer literature, the constitutive experience of having the representation create a public space for him as a black queer man, and, perhaps most importantly, a hoped-for expression of same-race, same-sex desire" (2011, 73). Though different in time (an interplay of *Brother's* present and the Harlem Renaissance) and place (in Brooklyn rather than Harlem), Perry in *Brother* and Alex in "Smoke" have related experiences as young artists. To demonstrate these connections, *Brother* reformulates Alex's desires through a fictional, intergenerational bond between Perry and Richard Bruce Nugent and, importantly, the diegetic moments that forge it.

"Smoke, Lilies, and Jade" appears frequently in *Brother* as Perry immerses himself in the short story after meeting Nugent. At school and at work, Perry not only reads from the version of it that Lewis includes in *The Portable Harlem Renaissance Reader* (1995), but he also finds an extant issue of *FIRE!* (a copy of the Nugent and Wirth reissue) among Nugent's belongings at his death. After confronting Nugent with a facsimile of "Smoke" in hand, Perry sits down with Nugent to learn more about his life and the Harlem Renaissance. Perry presses Nugent for information and explanation:

Perry: I really love ["Smoke, Lillies, and Jade."] The phrasing, the mood, everything. It's like someone of a different time and place. But it is exactly how I feel.

Bruce: Well, I hate to break it you, but I'm here and now, flesh and blood right here before your very own eyes. (Evans 2004)

As he shares his physical and emotional memories of it, Bruce conveys the idea that the Harlem Renaissance is alive and embraces Perry's curiosity about it. Perry's reaction here illustrates one component of the short

story's cultural significance as print culture, which Stephanie Foote similarly argues about lesbian pulp fiction. Across the works that she studies, Foote points out that "the characters react not only to the text, to what the books are saying to them and to others about them, they also respond to the book itself, to the artifact whose presence in the world as an embodied fact allegorizes and solidifies their own desires" (2005, 169). This is precisely what happens for Perry but also, and more importantly, *Brother's* viewers, especially those unfamiliar with "Smoke" and Nugent. Through depicting Perry's experience of reading (a literal version of) "Smoke" and befriending Nugent, Evans underscores its and Nugent's legacies both now preserved in film.⁶

Evans's choice to tell a story about a young, black gay man's personal and artistic development through his relationship with Nugent responds to Cobb's earlier assertion that "the surprisingly small mass of archival research, scholarly work, and sustained interest on Nugent also implies that racial excavations of this queer author are not a priority" (2000, 39); Nugent lives longer than most of his counterparts, including Hughes, but dies in a relative degree of obscurity despite having new found celebrity in the last decades of his life because of gay and lesbian pride movements, especially as reflected in the documentary *Before Stonewall*. If Hughes is Julien's "perfect subject" for working out the complexities of a black artist's relationships with his communities, then Nugent's experiences as a black gay artist who produces images of same-sex desire makes him the ideal subject for Evans's consideration of the isolation that such artistry incurs (Hemphill 1991, 175). In *Brother*, Perry and Nugent bond over and through such isolation. By witnessing Nugent's memories (as depicted in "Smoke" and through what the fictional Nugent relates) and the pride that this "younger generation" exudes, Perry gains a stronger sense of identity. For both characters, this relationship helps them articulate and satisfy their desires as black gay male artists.

In comparing *Looking for Langston's* and *Brother to Brother's* depictions of "Smoke, Lilies, and Jade," it is necessary to underscore the related identities that Julien and Evans share. First, Julien and Evans clearly read "Smoke" and, as black gay men, likely identified with it, especially how it visualized black gay male artistry and the fact that it did so, somewhat radically, during the Harlem Renaissance (Reid-Pharr 571). Since Julien images "Smoke" to visualize it anew and demonstrate

⁶ I read both *Looking* and *Brother* as invested in exploring and preserving "Smoke" materially and position their cultural work in this regard as a response to Leon Jackson when he reminds "book historians and scholars of African American cultures of print" that "we need to read both the outsides as well as the insides of texts and theorize the mediating connections between the two" (292 – 293).

how it links to black gay print and film cultures during the 1980s and 1990s, and Evans portrays "Smoke" to show how a similar continuity, albeit fictional, operates between Nugent and Perry, their identifications prompt reactions to "Smoke" as a usable past. Beyond sharing "Smoke" in these ways, the films are linked through *Brother's* indebtedness to *Looking*. Given the paucity of such filmmaking prior to his own, Evans is likely aware of *Looking's* primacy. Even more, the parallels between them position *Brother's* intertextual functioning as a particular instance of double-voiced narration. As Evans' *Brother* speaks back to "Smoke" (and, in some ways, for Nugent), it necessarily speaks back to *Looking* as well. Together, they share and reproduce what Foote describes as "revelatory identification," especially in provoking consideration of the ways that black gay experiences and the Harlem Renaissance share history, while celebrating a larger, black LGBTQ history as predicated on a print and visual interplay. In pointing out this dialogue and its signifying qualities, I do not mean to suggest that such excavations of print culture require examinations of film. Rather, I do so to illuminate the influence of print culture, in this case a black gay print culture, and the potential of film to document and make use of that influence. Following the history that this print culture enables, *Looking for Langston* and *Brother to Brother* (re)position "Smoke" as part of, even essential to, the configuring of African American identity that occurs throughout the twentieth century. In doing so, they convey and further an impetus to "validate versions of black identity in print" but also in film (Smith 2004, xxi).

BIBLIOGRAPHY

- Avilez, Gershun. "African American Writing until 1930." *The Cambridge History of Gay and Lesbian Literature*. Eds. E. L. McCallum and Mikko Tuhkanen. New York: Cambridge University Press, 2014.
- Brother to Brother*. Dir. Rodney Evans. Wolfe Video. 2004. Film.
- Butler, Judith. *Bodies That Matter: On the Discursive Limits of Sex*. New York: Routledge, 1993.
- Carbado, Devon, Dwight McBride, and Donald Weise, eds. *Black Like Us: A Century of Lesbian, Gay, and Bisexual African American Fiction*. San Francisco: Cleis Press, 2002.
- Christian, Shawn Anthony. "Between Black Gay Men: Artistic Collaboration and the Harlem Renaissance in *Brother to Brother*." *The Harlem Renaissance Revisited: Politics, Arts, and Letters*. Ed. Jeffrey O. G. Ogbar. Baltimore: Johns Hopkins University Press, 2010.

- Cobb, Michael L. "Insolent Racing, Rough Narrative: The Harlem Renaissance's Impolite Queers." *Callaloo* 23.1 (2000): 328-351.
- Danky, James. "Reading, Writing, and Resisting: African American Print Culture," in *A History of the Book in America: Print in Motion – The Expansion of Publishing and Reading in the United States, 1880-1940* v.4. Eds. Carl Kaestle and Janice Radway. Chapel Hill: University of North Carolina Press, 2009.
- Dickel, Simon. *Black/Gay: The Harlem Renaissance, the Protest Era, and Constructions of Black Gay Identity in the 1980s and 90s*. East Lansing: Michigan State University Press, 2012.
- Du Bois, W. E. B. Du Bois. "Editorial: The Clansman." *The Crisis* 10.1 (May 1915): 33. Print.
- Evans, Rodney. "Filmmaker's Statement." *Independent Lens*. PBS.Org. 2005. 12 December 2013. Web.
- Foote, Stephaine. "Deviant Classics: Pulp and the Making of Lesbian Print Culture." *Signs* 31.1 (Autumn 2005): 169-190. Print.
- Gates, Henry Louis. "Looking for Modernism." *Black American Cinema*. Ed. Manitha Diawara. New York: Routledge, 1993: 200-207.
- Gerstner, David. *Queer Pollen: White Seduction, Black Male Homosexuality, and the Cinematic*. Urbana: University of Illinois Press, 2011.
- Goeser, Caroline. *Picturing the New Negro: Harlem Renaissance Print Culture and Modern Black Identity*. Lawrence: University Press of Kansas, 2007.
- Hemphill, Essex. "Looking for Langston: An Interview with Isaac Julien." *Brother to Brother: New Writings by Black Gay Men*. Ed. Hemphill. Boston: Alyson Publications, 1991.
- Jackson, Leon. "The Talking Book and the Talking Book Historian: African American Cultures of Print—The State of the Discipline." *Book History* 13 (2010): 251-308.
- Jarraway, David. "Montage of an Otherness Deferred: Dreaming Subjectivity in Langston Hughes." *American Literature* 68.4 (December 1995): 819-847.
- Jones, Jacquie. "The Construction of Black Sexuality: Towards Normalizing Black Cinematic Experience." *Black American Cinema*. Ed. Manitha Diawara. New York: Routledge, 1993: 247-256.
- Lewis, David Levering. *The Portable Harlem Renaissance Reader*. New York: Penguin Books, 1995.
- Locke, Alain, ed. *The New Negro*. 1925; New York: Touchstone, 1997.
- Looking for Langston*. Dir. Isaac Julien. [1998] Strand Releasing, 2007.

- Mercer, Kobena. "Dark and Lovely Too: Black Gay Men in Independent Film." *Queer Looks: Perspectives on Lesbian and Gay Film and Video*. Eds. Martha Gerver, John Hreyson, and Pratibha Parmar. New York: Routledge, 1993.
- Micheaux, Oscar. "The Negro and the Photo-Play." *The Half-Century Magazine* (May 1919): 9, 11.
- Nero, Charles. "Re/membering Langston: Homophobic Textuality and Arnold Rampersad's *The Life of Langston Hughes*. *Queer Representations*. Ed. Martin Duberman. New York: New York University Press, 1997: 188-196.
- Nugent, Richard Bruce. "Smoke, Lilies, and Jade." *FIRE!!* (November 1926): 33-39.
- Other Countries Collective. *Other Countries: Black Gay Voices*. New York: Other Countries, 1988.
- Park, Samuel. "All the Sad Young Men: Whiteness as Melancholic Haunting in Black Queer Independent Film." *Black Camera* 2.2 (Spring 2011): 63-79.
- Reid-Pharr, Robert. "African American and African-Diasporic Writing, Post-1930." *The Cambridge History of Gay and Lesbian Literature*. Eds. E. L. McCallum and Mikko Tuhkanen. New York: Cambridge University Press, 2014.
- Robinson, Colin. Introduction. *Other Countries: Black Gay Voices*. New York: Other Countries, 1987.
- Scruggs, Charles. "Sexual desire, modernity, and modernism in the fiction of Nella Larsen and Rudolph Fisher." *The Cambridge Companion to the Harlem Renaissance* Ed. George Hutchinson. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2007: 155-169.
- Smith, Barbara. "African American Lesbian and Gay History: An Exploration." *The Truth that Never Hurts: Writings on Race, Gender, and Freedom*. Piscataway: Rutgers University Press, 1998.
- Smith, Katherine Capshaw. *Children's Literature of the Harlem Renaissance*. Indiana: Indiana University Press, 2004.
- Somerville, Siobhan B. *Queering the Color Line: Race and the Invention of Homosexuality in American Culture*. Durham: Duke University Press, 2000.
- Wirth, Thomas. *Gay Rebel of the Harlem Renaissance: Selections from the Work of Richard Bruce Nugent*. Durham: Duke University Press, 2002.

CLOSING THE GAP: A RESEARCH AGENDA FOR THE STUDY OF HEALTH NEEDS AMONG AMERICAN INDIAN/NATIVE HAWAIIAN TRANSGENDER INDIVIDUALS

Irene S Vernon
Colorado State University

Trudie Jackson
University of Arizona

Despite treaty agreements and Native focused health efforts, health disparities among American Indians and Native Hawaiians (AI/NH) have persisted for decades as federal, state, and tribal efforts to address them have waxed and waned. These disparities are even more pronounced among lesbian, gay, bisexual, and transgender (LGBT) individuals. The National Institutes of Health (NIH) has established that LGBT people experience, over a lifetime, an array of health issues such as victimization, violence, anxiety disorders, substance abuse, HIV, stigma, and discrimination and have recommended that an agenda be enacted that will “assist NIH in enhancing its research efforts in the area of LGBT health . . . and advance understanding of LGBT health” (National Institute of Medicine [NIM], 2011, p. 6). The need to understand the variation found among LGBT people is vital and many have made a call to address this lack of information and to help close the health disparity gap (Lombardi, 2010; NIM, 2011). In an effort to add to the literature and, more importantly, to provide information on how to better serve and improve the health of American Indian and Native Hawaiian transgender people, this study identified key health research needs.

The term transgender is complex and has a number of meanings but generally it describes “people who have gender identities, expressions, or behaviors not traditionally associated with their birth sex” (Mayer et al, 2008, p. 990) and may include cross-dressers, transvestites, transgenderists, drag queens/kings and other gender variant identities. Among AI/NH people there are regionally specific terms for transgender that may include cultural terms such as mahu, mahuwahine, mahukane, winkte, heyoka, nádleehí, ditbah, and the contemporary term two-spirit (Roscoe, 1998). It is important to note that the transgender term is evolving and varies by region and individual.

To obtain basic information on the current health status of AI/NH transgender individuals an exploration of AI/NH and transgender populations had to be explored independently, given the dearth of scholarship specifically focused on AI/NH transgender individuals.

In the United States the collection of health data on racial/ethnic minorities and sexual minorities has been fraught with problems. For AIs, the collection, analysis, interpretation and dissemination of their health data have led to many questions. Questions about AI health data have arisen due to the findings of racial and/or ethnic misclassification, poor data management, and inept coordination of health data between states and tribes (Vernon, 2012, p. 173, 174). As well, problems with the collection of LGBT health data have a long history of challenges and includes concerns such as: “(1) operationally defining and measuring sexual orientation and gender identity, (2) overcoming the reluctance of some LGBT individuals to identify themselves to researchers, and (3) obtaining high-quality samples of relatively small populations” (NIM, 2011, p. 89). One of the intentions of the Affordable Care Act, however, is the mission that health data collection will be improved and better coordinated. The Act requires data collection standards for key demographic variables such as race, ethnicity, sex, language and disability status (Dorsey et al., 2014). The United States Department of Health and Human Services’ (HHS) decision to limit its question on sex/gender to merely male and female categories on its National Health Survey is problematic, and though the HHS survey has included questions on sexual orientation in their National Health Interview Survey (Dorsey et al., 2014, p. 130), categorization should be further expanded.

Although limited health literature exists on transgender populations a recent article on LGBT health disparities and the Health Equity Promotion Model, by Fredriksen-Goldsen et al. (2014), reports that in two of the most current studies with large national samples of transgender individuals the “rates of depression, anxiety, and overall psychological distress were disproportionately higher for this population than for non-transgender women and men” (p. 654). Another national study that focused on transgender people and discrimination found that “41% of respondents reported attempting suicide compared to 1.6% of the general population, 19% were refused medical care due to their transgender status, 28% postponed medical care due to discrimination or inability to afford it (48%), and those who expressed their transgender identity in grades K-12 reported alarming rates of harassment (78%), physical assault (35%) and sexual violence (12%) (Grant, Mottet, Tanis, 2011, p 2, 3). Other smaller studies have focused on HIV, substance abuse, violence, mental health, and hormone usage (Feldman & Safer, 2009; Operario, 2011; Operario & Nemoto, 2005; Testa et al, 2012; Shipherd, et al,

2010.). The National Institute of Medicine's book *The Health of Lesbian, Gay, Bisexual, and Transgender People* (2011), a leading text, confirms that over their lifetime LGBT individuals encounter a number of health issues including HIV, suicide, violence, stigma, discrimination, substance abuse, homelessness, and mental health disorders.

Literature on AI/NH transgender people is extremely limited but it has been well established that they have a high prevalence of HIV, high rates of abuse and trauma, are medically underserved, and experience discrimination, violence, and traumas that are linked to adverse health outcomes. Specific to NH transgender populations there are only two prominent articles in the field (Ellingson & Odo, 2008; Odo & Hawelu, 2001). Odo & Hawelu (2001) found that compared to the general NH population; NH transgender individuals had substantially higher rates of HIV, smoking cigarettes, drug use, and no medical insurance, and were more exposed to violence (p. 332). A later study noted that NH transgender individuals were at heightened risk of HIV infection from engaging in unprotected receptive anal intercourse, sex work, and having sex while high, and illicit substance use (Ellingson & Odo, 2008, p. 562).

Literature on AI transgender health is equally as limited as NH. When searching for AI transgender health only one article appears that is focused on sexual partner concurrency and sexual risk among GLBT AI/Alaska Natives. The findings of this article recommend more attention paid to this population given its high rates of HIV and sexual partner concurrency (Cassels, Pearson, Walters, Simoni, & Morris, 2010, p. 277). A few more articles can be found when searching "two-spirit," which is a contemporary term, adopted in 1990 at the International Native Gay & Lesbian Gathering in Canada, used to describe Native American, Alaska Native, lesbian, gay, bisexual, and transgender (LGBT) individuals. This term however is not used by all Native people and will have different meanings in different communities.

An early study of two-spirits found that compared to heterosexuals they reported twice the rate of childhood exposure to physical abuse from their caretakers, significantly more "native specific historical trauma occurring in the lives of their parents, grandparents, and great grandparents," and "significantly higher rates of lifetime illicit drug use" (Balsam, Bu, Fieland, Simoni, & Walters, 2004, p. 297). Other studies have found that their higher reports of discrimination were associated with significantly greater odds of reporting physical pain and impairment (Chae & Walters, 2009, p. S149); greater victimization with more lifetime HIV risk behaviors and riskier sexual partners than their heterosexual counterparts (Simoni, Walters, Balsam, & Meyers, 2006, p. 3); and high alcohol misuse (Yuan, Duran, Walters, Pearson, & Evans-Campbell, 2014, p. 10470). Given this limitation of the research an exploration

of health perception within the AI/NH and transgender population independently provides a more complete picture of their health status and health needs.

Currently, AIs/NHs suffer disproportionately from a number of diseases and illnesses (i.e. diabetes, mental health disorders, cardiovascular disease, etc.), and health disparities that have persisted for over 500 years (Jones, 2006; U.S. Commission on Civil Rights, 2004). Likewise, over their life span, transgender people also report higher risk for suicidal ideation, high rates of smoking and substance abuse, and frequent experience of violence, discrimination and stigma (NIM, 2011, p. 4, 5). It is significant that the poor health outcomes for AI/NH and transgender populations are rooted in histories of oppression, discrimination, and stigma (Jones, 2006; NIM, 2011, p. 32-48; U.S. Commission on Civil Rights, 2004) and it is imperative that this fact be understood and acknowledged in order to develop effective health care services for AI/NH transgender individuals. When the independent health data on AI/NH and transgender individuals are combined, it is notably relevant that AI/NH transgender people encounter serious health challenges that have been overlooked or ignored by health and government officials as well as the research community. Certainly, there is a serious need for more scholarship and better-informed and comprehensive services.

This study explores the health and research needs of AI/NH individuals using their voices to help identify deprivations and deficiencies in their access to quality mental and physical healthcare and in existent research programs in this area. Given the lack of theory generated in this health domain, a grounded approach is used here.

METHODS

Background. This project began by the principal investigator being approached by a nádleehí¹ who works in the field of HIV/AIDS suggesting that the principle investigator examine the research needs of AI transgender individuals given their high rates of health disparities. The principal investigator has worked in the field of AIs and HIV/AIDS for several decades but not specifically with the transgender population. To familiarize herself with their health needs and issues the principle investigator had an informal meeting with seven AI transgender individuals in Los Angeles, CA. From that meeting she formulated an exploratory project on the research needs of AI/NH transgender individuals utilizing a

¹ Nádleehí is a Navajo term that describe a biological born male that shows feminine characteristics such as dressing up in female clothing, wearing make up, assisting with ceremonies by taking leads as head cook and helping dress ceremonial patient. In Navajo Creation Stories, the nádleehí were once revered among the Navajo people by showing feminine/masculine characteristics in taking on various roles as needed within communities and households.

qualitative CBPR process. Following the precepts of CBPR it was important to recognize and value health research priorities identified by the community understudy.

Participants and Recruitment. Of the forty-two participants in this project all self-identified as transgender and AI or NH. Forty-one identified as male to female and one identified as female to male. This study is somewhat national in scope in that qualitative data were collected in Los Angeles, CA, Chicago, IL, Albuquerque, NM, Phoenix, AZ, and Honolulu, HI, between 2011 and 2012. The original meeting that took place in Los Angeles, CA and was coordinated through the Red Circle Project, at AIDS Project Los Angeles, that provides services to Native Gay/Two-Spirit men and Native male to female transgender individuals. At that meeting the principle investigator met with seven AI transgender people to elicit thoughts and ideas of a project to gather information on the health and research needs of AI transgender individuals.

From the Los Angeles meeting a project was developed to examine both the current health milieu and the health needs for AI/NH transgender populations. Four two and one half hour focus groups were conducted. One was conducted at the United States Conference on AIDS, two at LGBT community centers, and another at an HIV/AIDS organization. The coordinators who helped with the project chose the focus group sites based on their networks and connections to AI/NH transgender populations. To keep the research participant names and identifying information confidential, Colorado State University's institutional review board (IRB) approved the use of cover letters instead of the use of a signed consent form. Once participants indicated a willingness to participate a cover letter email was sent to them by the principal investigator. The letter informed participants of the confidentiality, the risks, the benefits, and highlighted the overall goals of the project: (1) to develop a research agenda/proposal and (2) to develop articles based on the identified needs of AI/NH transgender populations. It also provided the following: title of the project, principal investigator contact information, procedures, eligibility criteria, compensation, and voluntary participation clause. The same letter was given to participants again at the beginning of the focus group. The principle investigator then reviewed the letter and reiterated to the participants their right to withdraw their consent and cease participation at any time without penalty or loss of benefits to which they were otherwise entitled.

For recruitment one nádleehí and three AI/NH transgender individuals were hired to recruit participants and assist in the coordination of activities. Coordinators were paid to locate focus group facilities, determine the appropriate compensation for participants, and, in some cases, determine the culturally appropriate food to be provided to ensure partic-

ipation. Incentives such as gifts, food, and money are commonly used and recommended in research with AI populations (Strickland, 1999) and in this project all focus groups ended with an informal meal for participants. The principal investigator employed a note taker or facilitator at each site. All note takers or facilitators, with the exception of one, were AI or NH and had established experience with focus group activities. All were oriented to both the confidentiality issues and the goals of this project prior to the focus group. All focus groups were conducted in English.

Sampling and Data Collection. For this hard-to-reach population, snowball sampling was used knowing that a “degree of trust is needed to initiate study subjects’ recruiting” (Shaghaghi, Bhopat, & Sheikh, 2011, p. 4). AI/NH gay or transgender coordinators helped recruit participants for the *Structuring an American Indian/Native Hawaiian Transgender Research Project*. All coordinators worked in the field of health and/or in transgender communities. Criteria for participation in the project included being (1) over the age of 18 and (2) self-identified as an AI/NH transgender person. The principal investigator or the coordinator contacted potential participants by phone, email, or in person and described the project in an effort to determine their willingness to participate and ensure confidentiality. When a potential participant indicated a willingness to engage in the focus group, the principal investigator emailed a cover letter to them.

Data Collection. Qualitative inquiry was selected for this project because it allows for “a more detailed account of individuals’ experiences as members of LGBT populations” (NIM, 2011, p. 120). Focus groups were conducted in an effort to better understand the experiences of the health issues facing AI/NH transgender persons building on the interaction within the group. In conjunction with the qualitative method, the process of community based participatory research (CBPR) provided the foundation to collection information that may improve health equity, give a voice to AI/NH transgender individuals, and most importantly, create trust between researcher and AI/NHs (Wallerstein & Duran, 2010). Mistrust between AIs and researchers has a long and valid history based on unethical encounters. The implementation of CBPR has been used to break this cycle given its collaborative approach. It equitably involves and honors all partners, allows for the building of community capacity and trust, and ensures that the research benefits the participants (Pachecho et al., 2013; Thomas, Rosa, Forechimes, & Donovan, 2011).

Instrumentation. Focus group questions were developed by the principal investigator and shared with three AI LGBT individuals. Utilizing that input, an additional question (RQ6) was added to further expand on the definition of “identity.” The facilitator schedule included the following research questions:

RQ1. What do you think are the most significant health related issues for transgenders?

RQ2. What do you think are the most significant barriers to health care for transgenders?

RQ3. What do you think are the strengths and resiliencies of transgenders?

RQ4. Tell me the way in which the care environment could be improved for transgenders?

RQ5. What would you recommend that a health research on transgenders focus on?

RQ6. What are your thoughts on the term Two-Spirit or your own tribal word?

RQ7. Is there anything you would like to add?

Data Analysis. The approach to the data analysis utilized a combination of grounded theory analysis and the principles of CBPR. Data for analysis included transcripts, field notes, and memos. Utilizing a grounded theory approach the principal investigator allowed the themes and theory to grow out of the data rather than analyzing the data with a theory already in place (Charmaz, 2006). The principal investigator engaged in four levels of analysis beginning with initial and open coding, labeling each line, focused coding and category development, axial and thematic coding. The resulting theories emerged from the categories and themes. The principal investigator utilized memos throughout the process to provide a record of her analytical process, thoughts, feelings, and insights into the project. Another researcher familiar with grounded theory and AI health also coded the data utilizing grounded theory. Both researchers approached the data inductively with no priority hypotheses and throughout the process made constant and consistent comparisons. Finally, the principal investigator compared and contrasted the data analyses by further refining the theories and major themes and then shared the results with a transgender community advisory board (CAB) that consisted of three AI transgender individuals. Given the lack of funding for this project, member checks were not done with all participants but instead only with CAB members. The CAB members reflected the community, "sharing a common interest, identity, experiences, history, language and culture" (Newman, et al., 2011, p. 1) and were drawn from project participants. CABs have been found to be an important factor in discussions of community perceptions and priorities in the development of a research agenda/process. In this project the advisory board members were invited to review the focus group transcripts and the investigator's findings and share their insights and thoughts on the data. The members assisted with interpretation of the data and related the results to larger cultural and social contexts. All advisory board members were compen-

sated for their contributions of time and expertise. Follow-up questions were asked as well of several other focus group participants about the composition of a proposed “transgender health care package,” and they too were compensated for their time.

RESULTS

Two main themes emerged from this project, healthcare and resiliency, and within each were a number of subcategories.

Healthcare

In this study most of the participants reported receiving poor quality healthcare stemming from health professionals’ attitudes and treatment, quality care unique to their transgender status and age, along with inaccessibility to hormones.

Health Professionals’ Attitudes and Treatment. A consistent comment from participants was that they did not receive quality care due to treatment by the health professionals. As one participant commented, they need to “treat us as human beings, not like a freak.” Participants expressed that health professionals were insensitive and rude to their identity through the use of their birth names and inappropriate pronouns. They shared, “the nurse practitioner was unable to understand or accept [my] transgender identity” and “she called me by my other name which I do not prefer . . . some do it intentionally just to be mean.” Participants described various encounters with health care workers who stared and gawked at them, “sometimes nurses look at me differently,” “when one sees a male name they are like wow and then like I’ll see people popping into the room just to look, like am I supposed to have another leg or something,” and “they came in to gawk at me in the medical room.” On a positive side, there were some health professionals who they indicated helped them get what they needed by “adjusting their hours for them,” and helping them complete insurance forms and if needed, “doing it under the table because he understood that we needed certain things for our hormone regimen.”

Access to Care that is Unique to Their Transgender Status. Given their transgender status many participants noted the lack of access to transgender specific health needs including qualified medical professionals, transitional care/services, and specific concerns related to hormones. All participants noted the difficulty of finding a doctor knowledgeable about transgender issues and how they had to do “lots of doctor shopping, at least six” because “there is not much to pick from.” Many remarked how doctors ignored their transgender status and either focused on male or female issues independently not providing the holistic care/services they needed and desired. They said, “they are going to do a

physical for male instead of like a woman because I have breasts, I want to talk about mammogram, I want to talk about breast cancer, I want to talk about upper body women's issues." Another spoke, "for me I still have the parts I was born with, there is still a concern about prostate cancer and even though I am a woman, I neglect to get health care for checkup for male genitalia."

Poor Elder Transgender Care. Older participants spoke of their unique needs considering their many years of medical treatment and growing age. They not only talked about lack of services but of their mental health and of loneliness and invisibility. "We are suffering" was the statement of one participant who reflected many voices. "When looking at other women with full surgery you do not see them living past 60 years," "Where is our older generation?" and "When you feel that no one cares then you do not care for yourself." Participants noted how their loneliness and invisibility was not only created by society at large but within their own group, suggesting that the older they became the less support they had from other AI/NH transgender individuals. Families also rejected them, "One gets married and has children, then later on in life decides this is who I am and transitions. Then his or her own children disown them. . . they are older and they worked all their life supporting this family unit. . . in my culture the young take care of the old. But, they are stuck by themselves, they are not invited to family functions they are. . . very lonely." Elder participants expressed additional needs as they aged and how "because of our needs it becomes hard to be a woman, many of us revert to being a man again." Many mentioned the need for medical professionals to address their unique transgender status along with their aging needs.

Hormones. Many participants sought hormone replacement therapy (HRT) to align their appearance with their gender identity and this study found HRT to be a dominant subcategory within transgender specific needs. Participants obtained hormones from traditional and nontraditional sources. Individuals with "good" insurance accessed hormones through their physicians, medical centers, health clinics and Indian Health Service. For participants who had no insurance or had insufficient resources to purchase hormones found cheaper (and riskier) venues such as acquiring them from Mexico, Thailand, Canada, the Internet, friends, medical office staff, and the black market. Some participants reported that they had engaged in sex work and stolen doctor's prescription pads to obtain hormones. Participants, and at times even the doctors, "worked" the health care system to obtain hormones. From the statements documented, participants were savvy about ways to get what they needed. They reported that they had lied to their doctors to get a full hormone shot while some doctors gave them shots "under the table" or

charged them less. Obtaining services/care that one needed could vary by costs and by the relationships between health care providers and the transgender individuals. For example, to address the problem associated with the monitoring of hormone treatment, those who were perceived as caring doctors found ways to charge insurance companies, generally categorizing it as another procedure. One participant shared that her doctor “did not want testing or lab work to hinder her from accessing treatment, therefore, if she was unable to do the lab work, he would still give her treatment but require that she return for monitoring.” Another doctor also worked with insurance claims by filing them in a way to provide what the patient needed, “if you have insurance he doesn’t say I am going to give this male patient a female hormone replacement therapy. He just says ‘I am testing them for whatever’ but what he is looking for are the levels in the liver. He does the whole thing so he can charge the insurance for the lab work if you have insurance. . . if he says that he is doing it for hormones it is not covered by the insurance.”

Participants were aware of the possible harmful effects of long-term use of hormones as well as the lack of medical training on the use and management of hormones. They willingly shared their experiences, “I knew someone who took those [black market hormones] and they made her breasts grow really weird,” “I have been taking them since I was 19 years old. We all get them but who maintains them? We are putting ourselves at risk. I once shot into a muscle and one time I shot myself and could not walk for days.” Concerns expressed over the risk of long-term use were plentiful and participants noted, “there are risks and side effects of hormones, like cancer risk, thyroid, and liver enzymes” and “Hormones change you.” Many noticed the lack of hormone management, “Some girls take them like skittles” and they self-medicate not knowing how much to take. Many individuals reported that they saw changes when they stopped abruptly so they tried to self-manage, “you learn to be able to judge your levels of hormones.”

Persistent through all focus groups was a concern related to the purchase and use of “bad hormones/street drugs.” Participants noted how most did not know what they were buying and at times it was a combination of drugs and hormones. They commented, “black market hormones are putting me at risk,” “many hormones are not approved, it is horse piss,” and “some have died.” One particularly telling comment regarding risk was made related to the quality of the black market hormones, “When I was living in L.A. a girl was selling vials. I was thinking of using it but then found that there was no expiration date on it. Then it hit me, how long have those been out? It scared me. If I didn’t think of that I probably would have taken it. I even got the syringe for it too.” Even though many know the risk of non-prescribed hormones they seek them

out anyway because as many spoke, it “fulfilled who I am, it completes me.”

Resiliency

Resiliency, the ability to bounce back, in the face of adversity, was a major theme that included the subtopics of how it was built through their lived experiences, culture, and history.

Lived Experiences. Participants in all sites repeatedly expressed how their life experiences contributed to their resiliencies and enhanced their ability to bounce back. They stated that the neglect and ostracism that they experienced built strength. “As a whole you have to be pretty resilient to be. When you are in the world and your parents, family, church, and community are telling you ‘what the hell are you wearing girls clothes for? Are you fucking crazy? What is wrong with you?’ You have to be pretty strong to defy the odds, to defy your family and society.” Another participant expressed similar sentiments, “I think the strength is because we have so much against us and you have to be strong or else. You have no choice. Like myself, I have no family, so I have to stand on my own two feet and fight for myself. And I think that is why trans people are so strong.” Participants indicated that it was the daily pressures that helped many build fortitude. “Our strength comes from what we have to deal with on a daily basis. What makes us stronger is a lot of that experience, of that negativity that we grew up with, we had over and over again, made us stronger” and “how much we go through on an everyday basis. Life is hard but we always find a way to get through it, each day – inner strength.”

In addition to lived experiences, the transgender participants spoke of their culture and histories as contributing to their resiliencies.

Culture. Many participants found “culture to be a big strength” and were able to distinguish key core cultural elements that helped build their tenacity. A number of AI/NH transgender people found meaning and purpose in their lives by helping and supporting others. Participants shared that their community was suffering and this became the impetus to help others. They spoke of advocacy and unity, “we need to stand together, that is the only way it will change.” They stated that being or having role models/mentors were important to help guide, lead, and build a sense of hope and “to maneuver my way to get things done.” Depending on their needs, participants had a variety of mentors/role models. The role models/mentors were American Indians, Native Hawaiians, non-Natives, Native spiritual leaders, Christians, men, transgender individuals, queens, performers, and family members. Participants commented that helping others was a core cultural value that they were taught and followed. Participants spoke, “Our spirit is that I would not let them be on

the streets although much has been lost, it is in our life to help take care of kids and be peacemakers, this is cultural,” “we are caretakers of babies and elders and still this continues to be our roles today” and “in my culture, the young take care of the old.”

AI/NH transgender individuals also spoke of how “Culture gives you an answer as to why there is a place for you.” Participants further commented “in Native Hawaiian and Native American culture there is a place there for people like me” and “Our cultures and our traditions, what we heard in our stories in class made us stronger and for me, I can say that learning my culture and my traditions . . . has helped me a lot.” Another participant spoke of how they “need that place in society . . . in my culture” to survive. Culture was also seen as a means to facilitate transition, “culture . . . this is the strength behind those who are transitioning.” It was noted, “Native Americans are more supported by their culture and from the time they are young they recognize the difference in someone who is going to transition . . . they recognize it and value it.”

History. Historically, AI/NH histories included the acceptance of alternative genders and participants in all focus groups indicated that they wanted to preserve that history, learn more about it, and teach it to others. One participant spoke of their tribal traditions and how “Knowing the role of *nádleehí* can save the culture and increase self-esteem.” A NH noted that in “Hawaiian culture, we are caretakers of babies and elder and still this continues to be our roles today, I would be a caretaker of my mother, the strength of our *mahana*.” They expressed that they wanted younger transgender individuals to know that “back in the old days gender was not determined by what was between your legs it was determined by the chores that you do and the role that you played.” AI/NH individuals spoke of the cultural importance of family and, although not all Native families were accepting, participants expressed that they felt they were given a place and relied upon as a source of advice for others. They were also thankful that the elders who knew their history would “speak to extended family who were not immediately accepting” of them. History provided many of the participants with a sense of belonging and grounding. As one participant spoke, “remembering our history is important to make it a better day today.”

DISCUSSION

While it is true that many of the health research needs found in this study are similar in nature to the needs of other transgender people, they also reinforce research areas that the Institute of Medicine consider “essential for building a solid evidence base in LGBT health” (NIM, 2011, p. 7). NIM found that “LGBT individuals face barriers to equitable health care that can have profound impact on their overall wellbeing”

and strongly encourage more research to “provide a solid basis from which to address these inequities” (p. 297). The data in this study certainly support the concept that there are unique research areas that need further exploration if the United States is to close the health care gap found among AI/NH transgender people.

Current research has established that LGBT individuals will not seek care or disclose personal information when receiving care because of discrimination, stigma, and lack of provider knowledge (Clark, Landers, Linde, & Sperber, 2001; Grant et al., 2011). Discriminatory actions by medical providers are found to be commonplace for transgender individuals who are denied equal treatment and sometimes denied services completely (Grant et al., p. 5). The *National Transgender Discrimination Survey Report on Health and Health Care* (2010) noted that many transgender individuals postponed their care because they could not afford it while others did so because of the “discrimination and disrespect from providers” (p. 7). The current study corroborates that research.

It is critical that health providers and agencies begin to develop and adhere to better-informed standards of care and related services. Participants spoke often of negative and discriminatory attitudes exhibited by health professionals, the lack of access and training, and the extent to which these factors have been found to “contribute to disparities in LGBT health” (Potter, Goldhammer, & Makadon, 2008, p. 3). In another qualitative study, physicians spoke about the lack of transgender specific medical knowledge, lack of available resources, inadequate referral networks, and the challenges that arise from a health system that is “two-gendered” (Snelgrove, Jasudavisius, Rowe, Head, & Bauer, 2012). In many cases the quality care of AI/NH transgender people by medical professionals depended upon their relationship with individual transgender individuals and this should not be the case. The quality of care should be based upon the training of the medical professionals. Many have noted the need for more training and education. The need is further expressed through the limited and varied quality of instruction found in medical curricula. In a recent study it was found that “the median time reported dedicated to LGBT-related content in medical school in 2009-2010 was 5 hours” (Obedin-Maliver et al, 2011, p. 976). Several of the AI/NH transgender individuals who participated in this study, worked in the health field and utilizing their knowledge to guide the curricula in these trainings would be advantageous given their knowledge of the health field, transgender issues, and AI/NH cultural issues.

The Redfern and Sinclair article (2014) provided sound recommendations for improving health care encounters, suggesting changes be made to the office environment that includes gender-neutral bathrooms, the use of correct pronouns in all medical documentation, personnel

training be increased, and that a network of health providers, that provide transgender health care and services, be established for advice and referrals. These suggestions should be extended to the Indian Health Service too. Attesting to the discrimination AIs encounter in the health care system, the National Center for Transgender Equity and National Gay and Lesbian Task Force indicated in their discrimination survey that 34% of AIs refused medical care due to bias and 64% postponed care when they were sick or injured due to fear of discrimination (Harrison-Quitana, Fitzgerald, & Grant, 2012).

Data themes related to health challenges from older transgender individuals were often alarming and consistently demonstrated how the combined stigma of being elderly and transgender is fraught with serious health impact. Adding to this is the powerful impact of internalized oppression, given the findings in this study that elderly felt marginalized even in their own communities. The facts learned related to accessing health for older participants in this study was profound but not unlike the findings among many aging transgender individuals who have expressed fear of accessing health service due to discrimination and stigma (Fredriksen-Goldsen et al., 2014).

Given the many identities found among AI/NH people there is a need for a more nuanced research projects among them to delve deeply into their needs. An intersectional research approach has been promoted by the NIM (295, 296) as well as by other scholars. Orel (2014) recommends, “future research needs to focus on understanding the implication of differences in race, ethnicity, cultural environments, socioeconomic status and age among LGBT older adults, utilizing the intersectionality perspective that examines multiple identities and the way in which they interact” (p. 70). Scholars Chae and Walters (2009) suggested that the negative influences of discrimination on the health of two-spirit AI/NH people calls for additional research on the intersections of both race and sexual orientation (Chae & Walters, 2009). The current study also supports the need for this type of examination.

Our findings indicate discriminatory actions toward AI/NH people expand beyond health professionals to include encounters throughout their lifetime in the workplace, schools, and in everyday living. This, too, must be addressed given the outcomes that result from it. It is also important to acknowledge that the discrimination our participants talked about are in addition to a long history of violence against AI/NH people that began at colonization, with the destruction to their lands, language, culture and communities, and continues today. This violence, hate, and discrimination toward AIs/NHs have resulted in higher rates of posttraumatic stress disorder (PTSD) than their White counterparts along with increased vulnerabilities to a number of health and mental health issues

(Bassett, Buchwald, & Mason, 2014, p. 431. Particularly alarming, the Harrison-Quitana, et al. study found that in the national transgender discrimination survey 56% (565) of AI participants reported having attempt suicide compared to 41% of all other participants and 1.6% of the general U.S. population (p. 1). Given the daily negative discriminatory and anti-transgender bias encounters faced by AI/NH transgender individuals it is vital that education and training of health professionals and others is given high priority.

Our data extend the previous research findings that voice concerns and highlight the need for specific and unique transgender care. The need for a holistic approach is equally important given that male to female participants should have both the breasts and prostates checked. Participants in this study noted the lack of attention to breast health during medical visits; this is especially concerning given the fact that MTF individuals are found to have higher risk for breast cancer due to hormone therapy. It is recommended that they receive the same screening given to biological women along with screening for prostatic disease and prostate cancer (Roberts & Fantz, 2014, p. 986).

The transgender specific health care need of access to hormones must be addressed immediately given its health risks to many transgender individuals. Access to hormones was the largest subtheme identified and certainly brings to focus a major health concern noted by many transgender individuals. This study found that cost and lack of insurance was a barrier to obtaining hormones and if individuals could not afford them, they strategically found ways to obtain them even if the hormones were non-prescribed. This study concurs with the findings of a study of transgender people in Ontario, Canada, which found that individuals obtained non-prescribed hormones when they didn't find them available (Rotondi, 2013). It is fairly certain that these types of behaviors are driven by financial and lack of health care service considerations. Clearly, it is evident that more research is needed to understand health impacts and factors that contribute to the use of non-prescribed hormones and that we must find ways to make the hormonal transition safe and affordable or people will continue to put themselves at risk for health complications.

It was encouraging to learn that in May 2013 the Indian Health Service (IHS) National Pharmacy and Therapeutics Committee hosted a discussion on the management of patients treated with hormone therapy for gender dysphoria. Following the protocols created by the Veterans administration, they "determined that the most appropriate estrogen agent for male to female transgender therapy is Estradiol." It is unclear however if all IHS facilities adhere to this recommendation given that one

participant in this study noted, “IHS on the reservation gives premarin . . . she advocates for them to try to get estradiol because it is healthier.”

It is still unclear what the impact, if any, that the Affordable Care Act will have on accessing healthcare, specifically quality hormones. Hopefully, it may provide a means for better access and less risk for this population. What remains evident however, is that transgender individuals will continue to strategize and do what is necessary to access transition related care for it is essential to their basic health and wellbeing.

While participants in this study described the constant negative encounters in their lives, they also spoke of their ability to rebound and recover. This capacity and the ensuing strength should be further explored and utilized as resiliency factors in health interventions if we are to decrease the health disparities. It has been argued that understanding resilience among transgender populations is important for reducing their stress (Bockting et al., 2013), building their strength and strategies to cope with adversity (Singh, et al, 2011), and for practitioners who work with them (Singh & McKleroy, 2011; Singh, Hays, & Watson, 2011).

This study supports recent research enumerating how activism, role models, and engagement with other like individuals may contribute to the resiliency and positive health outcomes (Singh, et al., 2011; Testa, Jimenez, & Rankin, 2014; Singh & McKleroy, 2011). Unique to the population in the current study was the role that culture and history played in building resiliency. Further research on resilience would have great value and could potentially lead to more effective avenues for intervention and thereby, a reduction in the health disparity gaps for AI/NH transgender individuals. However, this author concurs with researchers Luthar, Cicchetti and Becker (2000) that studies for the transgender population must pay careful attention to conceptual and methodological factors for the outcomes to be useful. The population of study must be involved in every aspect of the research that is conducted.

Patient-provider communication with health officials is clearly in a state of disparity for the transgender individuals in this study, excluding some perhaps rare instances where doctors appear helpful and understanding regarding hormone treatment and insurance issues. Besides a need for better patient-provider communication, several other areas of communication seem deficit both with regard to the health needs and wants of AI/NH transgender individuals and research programs. Investigating and correcting the stigma of AI/NH transgender individuals in the larger population social institutions and media portrayals is an important beginning. Thus, research and educational efforts to the larger non-transgender population is needed as well, beginning with educational programs from K-12 to medical school and beyond, about these various cultures and the intersectionality of these varied cultural identities. Re-

search to further understand and assist AI/NH transgender peoples is critically needed, but so is research on the media and other social institutional hegemony that perpetuates the health disparities addressed in this study.

CONCLUSION

A major implication of this study focuses on the resiliency of the AI/NH transgender population and the factors that contribute to building that resiliency. These findings serve as a starting point for more in depth studies as well as the development of effective health interventions. Building AI/NH resiliency using a cultural foundation will provide additional benefits to aging AI/NH transgender people who have expressed loneliness and experience a lack of support and community. If the gaps in health disparities are to be closed, then special consideration must be given to the importance of culture in building resiliency in this population. It is suggested that the 'Indigenist' stress-coping model be used as a conceptual research framework, given its emphasis on cultural strengths (Walters, Simoni, & Evans-Campbell, 2002). If it is grounded firmly in the CBPR process, the research design, recruitment, development of culturally appropriate measures and assurance of cultural centeredness is ensured. Most importantly, research within this population must consider the environment in which the individuals live for there are layers of influence that impact health and health seeking behavior.

It is acknowledged that this study has some limitations. It was limited in size and gender diversity therefore cannot be generalized to all AI/NH transgender individuals. The sample was homogeneous with few female to male transgender individuals. The inclusion of more female to male individuals may have provided different perspectives on the issues under study. Although there are many commonalities found among AI/NH populations there are also important differences such as health care systems and sovereign status that may have significant impact, hence it is recommended that researchers who build upon this study do so by examining AI and NH populations independently since regional differences were found in the data. Not having a NH in the CAB reviews presented a bias CAB committee. This study may have also been strengthened through the development of more questions on impact and influences of culture given its importance on the attitudes, beliefs, and practices of AI/NH transgender individuals.

This exploratory study provides valuable insight into the lives, health needs, and health seeking behaviors of transgender AI/NH individuals. It examines commonalities with other transgender populations as well as differences. For this specific population, a major research focus should be on health care access with a closer examination of AI/NH en-

counters with health professionals, quality of care particularly as it relates to hormones, and the factors that contribute to resiliency. Elder needs should also be examined given the concerns noted. Foremost, AI/NH cultures and histories should be studied in the context of the social determinates of health given how they influence life choices, opportunities, and challenges, and ultimately health outcomes and health seeking behaviors.

REFERENCES

- Balsam, K.F., Bu, H., Fieland, K.C., Simoni, J.M., & Walters, K.L. (2004). Culture, trauma, and wellness: a comparison of heterosexual and lesbian, gay, bisexual and two-spirit Native Americans. *Cultural Diversity and Ethnic Minority Psychology*, 10(3),287-301.
- Barnes, P.M., Adams, P.F., Powell-Griner, E. (2010). Health characteristics of the American Indian or Alaska Native adult population: United States, 2004-2009. *National Health Statistics Reports*; 20. Hyattsville, MD: National Center for Health Statistics.
- Bassett, D., Buchwald, D., & Mason, S. (2014). Posttraumatic stress disorder and symptoms among American Indians and Alaska Natives: a review of the literature. *Social Psychiatry and Psychiatric Epidemiology*, 49,417-433.
- Bockting, W.O., Miner, M.H., Swinburne Romine, R.E., Hamilton, A., & Coleman, E. (2013). Stigma, mental health, and resilience in an online sample of the US transgender population. *American Journal of Public Health*, e1-e9, online publication, e1-e9. doi:10.2105/AJPH.2013.301241.
- Cassels, S., Pearson, C.R., Walters, K., Simoni, J.M., & Morris, M. (2010). Sexual partner concurrency and sexual risk among gay, lesbian, bisexual, and transgender American Indian/Alaska Natives. *Sexually Transmitted Diseases*, 37(4),272-278.
- Chae, D.H., & Walters, K.L. (2009). Racial discrimination and racial identity attitudes in relation to self-rated health and physical pain and impairment among two-spirit American Indians/Alaska Natives. *American Journal of Public Health*, 99(S1), S144-S151.
- Charmaz, K. (2006). *Constructing grounded theory: a practical guide through qualitative analysis*. Los Angeles, CA: Sage Publications.
- Clark, M.E., Landers, S., Linde, R., & Sperber, J. (2001). The GLBT Health Access Project: a state-funded effort to improve access to care. *American Journal of Public Health*, 91(6),895-896.
- Dorsey, R., Graham, G., Glied, S., Meyers, D., Clancy, C., & Koh, H. (2014). Implementing health reform: improved data collection and

- the monitoring of health disparities. *Annual Review of Public Health*, 25,123-38.
- Ellingson, L., & Odo, C. (2008). HIV risk behaviors among Mahuwahine (Native Hawaiian transgender women). *AIDS Education and Prevention*, 20(6),558-569.
- Feldman, J., & Safer, J. (2009). Hormone therapy in adults: suggested revision to the sixth version of the standards of care. *International Journal of Transgenderism*, 11(3),146-182.
- Fredriksen-Goldsen, K.I., Cook-Daniels, L., Kim, H., Erosheva, E.A., Emlet, C.A., Hoy-Ellis, C.P., Goldsen, J., & Muraco, A. (2014). Physical and mental health of transgender older adults: an at-risk and underserved population. *The Gerontologist*, 54(3),488-500.
- Grant, J.M., Mottet, L.A., & Tanis, J. (2011). *Injustice at Every Turn: A Report of The National Transgender Discrimination Survey*. Washington, DC: National Center for Transgender Equality and National Gay and Lesbian Task Force.
- Harrison-Quitana, J., Fitzgerald, E, & Grant J. (2012). *Injustice at Every Turn: A look at American Indian and Alaskan Native respondents in the National Transgender discrimination survey*. Washington, DC: National Center for Transgender Equality and National Gay and Lesbian Task Force.
- Indian Health Services. (June 2013). NPTC formulary brief – gender dysphoria. *IHS National Pharmacy and Therapeutics Committee Gender Dysphoria, Gender Identity Disorder*. Clinical Guidance. Indian Health Services website. Retrieved January 20, 2016 from <https://www.ihs.gov/nptc/clinicalguidance/>.
- Jones, D.A. (2006). The persistence of American Indian health disparities. *American Journal of Public Health*, 96(12),2122-2134.
- Lombardi, E. (2010). Transgender health: A review and guidance for future research – proceedings from the summer institute at the Center for Research on Health and Sexual Orientation, University of Pittsburgh. *International Journal of Transgenderism*, 12(4),211-229.
- Luthar, S.S., Cicchetti, D., & Becker, B. (2000). The construct of resilience: a critical evaluation and guidelines for future work. *Child Development*, 71(3),543-562.
- Mayer, K.H., Bradford, J.B., Makadon, H.J., Stall, R., Goldhammer, H., & Landers, S. (2008). Sexual and gender minority health: what we know and what needs to be done. *American Journal of Public Health*, 98(6),989-995.

- National Institute of Medicine. (2011). *The Health of Lesbian, Gay, Bisexual, and Transgender People: Building a Foundation For Better Understanding*. Washington, DC: The National Academies Press.
- Newman, S.D., Andrews, J.O., Magwood, G.S., Jenkins, C., Cox, M.J., & Williamson, D.C. (2011). Community advisory boards in community-based participatory research: a synthesis of best processes. *Preventing Chronic Disease*, 8(3), A70. Retrieved September 19, 2014, from http://www.cdc.gov/pcd/issues/2011/may/10_0045.htm.
- Obedin-Maliver, J., Goldsmith, E.S., Stewart, L., White, W., Tran, E., Brenman, S., Wells, M., Fetterman, D.M., Garcia, G., & Lunn, M.R. (2011). Lesbian, gay, bisexual, and transgender-related content in undergraduate medical education. *Journal of American Medical Association*, 306(9),971-977.
- Odo C., & Hawelu, A. (2001). Eo na Māhū o Hawai'i: the extraordinary health needs of Hawai'i's Māhū. *Pacific Health Dialog*, 8(2),327-334.
- Operario, D., & Nemoto T. (2005). Sexual risk behavior and substance use among sample of Asian Pacific Islander transgendered women. *AIDS Education and Prevention*, 17(5),430-443.
- Operario, D., Nemoto, T., Iwamoto, M. & Moore T. (2011). Risk for HIV and unprotected sexual behavior in male primary partners of transgender women. *Archives of Sexual Behavior*, 40,1255-1261.
- Orel, N.A. (2014). Investigating the needs and concerns of lesbian, gay, bisexual, and transgender older adults: the use of qualitative and quantitative methodology. *Journal of Homosexuality*, 61(1),523-78.
- Pachecho, C.M., Daley, S.M., Brown, T., Flippi, M., Greiner, K.A., & Daley, C.M. (2013). Moving forward: breaking the cycle of mistrust between American Indians and researchers. *American Journal of Public Health*, 103(12),2152-2159.
- Potter, J., Goldhammer, H., & Makadon, H.J. (2008). Clinicians and the care of sexual minorities. In H.J. Makadon, K.H. Mayer, J. Potter, & H. Goldhammer (Eds.), *Fenway: Guide to Lesbian, Gay, Bisexual, and Transgender Health*, 3-24. Philadelphia: American College of Physicians.
- Redfern, J.S., & Sinclair, B. (2014). Improving health care encounters and communication with transgender patients. *Journal of Communication in Healthcare*, 7(1),25-40.
- Roberts, T.K. & Fantz, C.R. (2014). Barriers to quality health care for transgender population. *Clinical Biochemistry*, 47,983-987.

- Roscoe, W. (1998). *Changing Ones: Third and Fourth Genders in Native North America*. New York, NY: St. Martin's Press.
- Rotondi, N.K., Bauer, G.R., Scanlon, K., Kaay, M., Travers, R., & Travers, A. (2013). Nonprescribed hormone use and self-performed surgeries: "do-it-yourself" transition in transgender communities in Ontario, Canada. *American Journal of Public Health*, 103(10),1830-1836.
- Shaghghi, A., Bhopat, R.S., & Sheikh, A. (2011). Approaches to recruiting "hard-to-reach" populations into research: a review of literature. *Health Promotion Perspectives*, 1(2),1-9.
- Shipherd, J.C., Green, K.E., & Abramovitz. (2010). Transgender clients: Identifying and minimizing barrier to mental health treatment. *Journal of Gay & Lesbian Mental Health*, 14,94-108.
- Simoni, J.M., Walters, K.L., Balsam, K.F., & Meyers, S.B. (2006). Victimization, substance use, and HIV risk behaviors among gay/bisexual/2-spirit and heterosexual American Indian men in New York City. *American Journal of Public Health*, 96(12),2240-2245.
- Singh, A.A., Hays, D.G., & Watson, L.S. (2011). Strength in the face of diversity: resilience strategies of transgender individuals. *Journal of Counseling and Development*, 89(1),20-27.
- Singh, A.A., & McKleroy, V.S. (2011). "Just getting out of bed is a revolutionary act": the resilience of transgender people of color who have survived traumatic life events. *Traumatology*, 17(2),34-44.
- Snelgrove, J.W., Jasudavisius, A.M., Rowe, B.W., Head, E.M., & Bauer, G.R. (2012). "Completely out-at-seas" with "two-gender medicine": a qualitative analysis of physician-side barriers to providing health-care for transgender patients. *BMC Health Services Research* 12:110.
- Strickland, J.C. Conducting focus groups cross-culturally: experiences with pacific northwest Indian people. *Public Health Nursing*, 16(3),190-197.
- Testa, R.J., Jimenez, C.L., & Rankin, S. (2014). Risk and resilience during transgender identity development: the effects of awareness and engagement with other transgender people on affect. *Journal of Gay & Lesbian Mental Health*, 18(1),31-46.
- Testa, R.J., Sciacca, L.M., Wang, F., Hendricks, M.L., Goldblum, P., Bradford, J., & Bongar B. (2012). Effects of violence on transgender people, *Professional Psychology: Research and Practice* 43(5),452-459.

- Thomas, L.R., Rosa, C., Forcehimes, A., & Donovan, D.M. (2011). Research partnerships between academic institutions and American Indian and Alaska Native tribes and organizations: effective strategies and lessons learned in a multisite CTN study. *American Journal of Drug and Alcohol Abuse*, 37(5),333-338.
- U.S. Commission on Civil Rights. (2004). *Broken Promises: Evaluating the Native American Health Care System*. Washington, DC: U.S. Commission on Civil Rights.
- Vernon, I.S. (2012). HIV/AIDS issues for Native women. In J.R. Joe, & F.C. Gachupin (Eds.), *Health and Sociocultural Issues of Native American Women*, 169-190. Connecticut: Praeger Press.
- Wallerstein, N., & Duran, B. (2010). Community-based participatory research contributions to intervention research; the intersection of science and practice to help improve health equity. *American Journal of Public Health*, Suppl1(100),S40-S46.
- Walters, K.L., Simoni, J.M., & Evans-Campbell, T. (2002). Substance use among American Indians and Alaska Natives: incorporating culture in an "Indigenist" stress-coping paradigm. *Public Health Reports*, 117(S1),S104-S117.
- Yuan, N.P., Duran, B.M., Walters, K.L., Pearson, C.R., & Evans-Campbell, T.A. 2014. Alcohol misuse and associations with childhood maltreatment and out-of-home placement among urban two-spirit American Indian and Alaska Native people. *International Journal of Environmental Research and Public Health*, 11,10461-1047.

EXAMINING THE IMPACT OF PARENTAL SOCIALIZATION ON THE COPING STYLES OF BLACK GRADUATE STUDENTS FACED WITH MICROAGGRESSIONS

Robert D. Colbert, Kai M. Perry and Marcia Anderson
University of Connecticut

In recent years, colleges and universities have experienced an increase in the number of Black students who enroll (U.S. Department of Education 2015). Navigating the college adjustment process for many Black students is met with a unique variety of challenges. Social scientists have examined various stressors experienced by Black students in an attempt to explain unfavorable college outcomes such as low grade point average and decreased academic motivation. Factors such as poor academic preparedness and financial difficulties are the most commonly cited predictors of poor college adjustment (Allen 1992; Fleming 1984). However, many studies suggest that stressors within the college environment itself also contribute to the college adjustment of Black students (Allen 1992; Banks 2010; Smedley, Myers, and Harrell 1993). On predominantly White college and university (PWCU) campuses, Black students may experience minority status stress, a psychosocial form of stress related to one's racial and ethnic background. Examples of such stressors may include exposure to racial discrimination (and/or microaggressions), racial and ethnic underrepresentation, being a first generation college student, and strained relationships with professors of a different race and ethnic group (Greer 2008; Greer and Chwalisz 2007).

This article provides an intimate perspective on the experiences of two Black female doctoral students enrolled in a math course at a public, White university (PWU) in the northeast region of the U.S. Both students share personal accounts of the microaggressions they experienced from a math professor of a different racial and ethnic background. Divergent coping strategies are explored as well as how each of their unique racial socialization processes facilitated different behaviors in response to the professor's discriminatory behavior. The experiences shared here have implications for staff of college counseling centers, college admission offices, etc. Recommendations for diversity awareness programs that attempt to improve the racial climate on college campuses are also discussed.

MICROAGGRESSIONS

Colleges and universities have an array of departments, programs, directors, centers and even strategic plans all aimed at insuring students from traditionally underrepresented groups receive quality education unencumbered by any forms of discrimination. Despite such efforts to promote equity and inclusion, Black students attending PWCUs still endure racial discrimination on these campuses. The stories of the two Black doctoral students will add another layer to this growing phenomenon. The type of discrimination experienced by the second and third author of this manuscript is termed microaggressions. According to Sue and Sue (2013), microaggressions are “brief and commonplace, daily, verbal or behavioral indignities, whether intentional or unintentional, that communicate hostile, derogatory, or negative racial slights and insults that potentially have a harmful or unpleasant psychological impact on the target person or group” (153).

The university in this story is one with ongoing endeavors to eliminate microaggressions. For example, all faculty and staff in the university must undergo periodic diversity training, which is delivered by staff members from the Office of Diversity and Equity and all university Cultural Centers. Additionally, the school in which these doctoral students engage in their program of studies, has its diversity Action Plan in which activities are undertaken to make sure the environment of the school, i.e. student to student interaction, professor to students interactions are free from microaggressions and any such forms of discrimination.

CASE EXAMPLES

Student M: As I began to finish up a particular math class for the fall semester, I had made up my mind that I wanted to keep the same professor for part two the following semester. At this point in the class, I was feeling content that I had made a connection with my professor. Further, I felt good about the time and energy I had put into the class, which was rewarding since the lowest grade of all my assignments was 85. Staying with the same professor for the following semester’s class was a decision that felt right, knowing that I had adapted to this professor’s teaching style as well as being very familiar with homework assignments and other course expectations. Further, I had formed connections with classmates and had joined a study group, which was very helpful to me when preparing homework assignments. These same classmates had also decided to take part two of this class with the same professor for the following semester. So, my natural instinct was to stay connected to the group so we could study together for part two of the class.

Upon the opening for registration, I immediately registered for the class, knowing that the class was going to fill up quickly. After I com-

pleted registration, it felt good knowing that I got in and was looking forward to continuing part two of this class the following semester.

I can recall the moment that changed everything, when feelings of anger, frustration and discrimination came to my mind. I was staying up late after typing up an assignment for this class, and after a few hours into the assignment, I received an email from the professor. The email implied that I was having difficulties in the class and the professor recommended that I take another class instead for the following semester. My immediate reaction was disappointment in the professor's approach to tell me that she did not want me in his class for the following semester. As I stopped working on her assignment, and with a deep-sinking feeling in my stomach, I sat and read this same email over and over, about four or five times, trying to read "between the lines" of what the professor was really trying to say to me. Some immediate questions came to my mind: "Is it because I am black that this professor immediately jumped to a conclusion that I would not make it in part two of her class next semester?" "Why couldn't she email me to request a meeting to discuss her recommendation face to face, so she could at least hear my feedback?" "Did others in the class get this same email?" "Why did she pre-judge that I would not make it in her following semester class, knowing that my lowest grade was 85 in her current class?" "Is it because I am Black that she has categorized me to be a person of color who struggles in math?" "Is she correct and should I believe that I am not capable of making it in her class next semester?" "Maybe I should follow her advice and take another class next semester instead of hers."

Student K: With confidence and pride, I eagerly enrolled in the first semester of my doctoral program at a reputable, public university in the northeast region of the U.S. I felt elated to be finally entering into the ultimate phase of my educational pursuits. The confidence I felt derived from reflecting on my ability to face and overcome systemic challenges throughout my educational journey. In a way, being admitted for doctoral study confirmed my belief that I was indeed smart enough to become a scholar and expert in my field. The pride I felt was the same remarkable feeling I had experienced each time I accomplished an academic goal in spite of naysayers. I felt like I had finally arrived! I assured myself that with a few more years of hard work my dream of earning my doctorate would inevitably come true.

A few weeks into the semester, those confident feelings I had inside began to slowly dissipate as I attended my math class each week. I believed that because I had finally earned A's in my Master's level math courses, after a lifetime of feeling incompetent about my math skills that I was prepared to excel in my current math course. I thought I had dispelled the irrational belief that I was not smart enough to understand

doctoral level math. However, a pesky inkling of self-doubt was trying to resurface.

Refusing to allow self-doubt to reenter my consciousness, I spent long hours studying alone, and with peers, to make sure I met the learning objectives and earned a decent grade. I did not attempt to address the reasons my professor doubted me. After all, throughout the first half of the semester, I had no evidence that she held me to a lower standard than other students in the class. It was just a gut feeling that because I was Black that she expected me to struggle with the content of her course. I was not sure if this feeling was warranted or not so I decided to ignore it and focused on learning the material. However, as the course progressed, my professor revealed hints of racial bias. It wasn't until I spoke with the one other Black student in my class, and yet another Black colleague who was trying to obtain our professor's permission to register for the next math course in our sequence the following semester, that I was able to "connect the dots." Our math professor unfairly grouped the three of us Black students together based on our individual requests and made the bold assumption that we were "struggling" in her class. Further, she tried to convince us that we would not need to enroll in the next level of math because we wouldn't need it for our program.

MICROAGGRESSION MESSAGES AND THEMES

Examining the reported experiences of the microaggressions for both students will reveal the common message and impact. What is very important to understand about microaggressions is the internal impact and potential for psychological and/or emotional harm to the receiver. Recall, microaggressions are "brief and commonplace daily verbal or behavioral indignities, whether intentional or unintentional, that communicate hostile, derogatory, or negative racial slights and insults that potentially have a harmful or unpleasant psychological impact on the target person or group" (Sue et al. 2007, 273). There are three types of microaggressions: micro-assaults, micro-insults, and micro-invalidations. For purposes of this paper, micro-insults will be the focus. Accordingly, "micro-insults are unintended behaviors or verbal comments that convey rudeness or insensitivity or demeans a person's racial heritage identity, gender identity or sexual orientation, outside prep's level of awareness—consciousness, characterized by insulting hidden messages" (Sue et al. 2007, 275). For example, the Chair for a university faculty position search committee states to the committee that includes one Black woman and seven White men, I believe the most qualified person should get the job. The underlying message suggests that people of color are given extra, unfair benefits because of their race. The theme associated with this

example is that of the *myth of meritocracy*, i.e. statements implying race or gender does not play a role in life successes.

MICROAGGRESSION IMPACT

The first author spoke with the professor of the math courses to inquire about making room in her class for student K, which was followed with her (math professor) submitting the email to student M. Once the email was forwarded to student M, she responded as mentioned above, followed by student K responding as noted as well. The first point in these two cases is that the professor didn't intend to commit a microaggression, she didn't set out to purposely insult the two students. The two students in this case began (when professor communicated her belief they couldn't succeed in her advanced class) at two different "mindsets," yet upon thinking about or processing the professor's communication, ended up in the similar state of mind. This state of mind, which is common to receivers of microaggressions, is one of self-doubt characterized by internal negative self-talk regarding the situation. In this case, the negative self-talk concerned beliefs about one's ability to succeed in a more advanced math course. For example, student M, who began with much self-confidence, soon after receiving the professor's email reflected, "Is she correct and should I believe that I am not capable of making it in her class next semester?" "Maybe I should follow her advice and take another class next semester instead of hers." Next, a comparison of the two students experience of the professor's class prior to and after the microaggression will be presented.

Recall, student M expressed much confidence up to the point of the professor's suggestion that she not enroll in the next class of the sequence. In fact, student M identified specific experiences within the context of the first course with the professor as evidence to support her self-confidence. Student K first experienced self doubt prior to hearing about the email from the professor and her recommendation that she not take the next course, as she wrote, "A few weeks into the semester, those confident feelings I had inside began to slowly dissipate as I attended my math class each week." How can these two cases be placed into this discussion about the professor having committed a microaggression toward the Black students when they were in different places in terms of their levels of expressed confidence to succeed in the first math course? The impact of the microaggression for both students was similar in that their sense of academic self-confidence began to deteriorate. Victims of microaggressions become at risk for emotional and psychological harm (depression, anxiety and such) that occurs from internalizing the feelings from the experience, as did the students in this situation (Franklin 1999).

The common message for the students in this microaggression situation was “Blacks are not smart enough for advanced graduate course work.” Additionally, the theme associated with this microaggression was that of *the myth of Black intellectual inferiority*. At the time of writing this manuscript both students had successfully completed the second math course with the same professor and were feeling quite confident about their academic abilities. How were both students able to advance from a place of risk to their well being as aforementioned? Triple Quandary theory (Boykin and Toms 1985) will be used as a conceptual frame for understanding how the two doctoral students were able to successfully meet the challenge of the microaggression discussed above.

TRIPLE QUANDARY THEORY

Triple Quandary theory helps explain the nature and content of the racial socialization process for Black children. Racial socialization is considered one of the most pressing responsibilities for Black parents (McAdoo 2002) because it equips youth with the capacity to be psychologically and physically healthy in the context of an oppressive society (Marshall 1995). Triple Quandary, as defined by Boykin and Toms (1985), is a three-part frame guiding Black parents in important aspects of the socialization process for their children. The three areas in which parents must teach their Black children are (1) the American dream, (2) their African heritage, and (3) what it means to live as a member of a marginalized group in the United States. According to Triple Quandary, Black parents know the importance of teaching their children about race and all its implications toward obtaining a quality education in order to “better” oneself. Black parents give their children a foundation for their racial identity’s development when they teach Triple Quandary’s three principles. These teachings will be highlighted through a further look into the two doctoral students’ experience the following semester when entering and participating in the professor’s advanced class.

STUDENT K’S TRIPLE QUANDARY TEACHINGS

Student K comes from an upper middle class background in which both parents were highly educated and pillars of the community. Consistent with tenants of Triple Quandary her parents provided direct teachings for each of the three components of Triple Quandary. Central to their teachings was the notion that education was the key to equalizing the playing field for Blacks and Whites. To ensure their children obtained the type of K-12 education necessary for their children to have even a better life than they did, student K and her siblings mostly attended private schools during their K-12 schooling. African heritage was central to her learning process given that both parents were academics in

the subject matter. Thus, Student K received a scholarly approach to her African and Afro-American ancestry, one in which she and her family was its embodiment. Student K experienced a good deal of stress associated with the goals and teachings of her parents and the “racialized” reality experienced from other Blacks and Whites. While Student K’s parents’ Triple Quandary teachings gave her insight and ability to see racism and oppression their teachings were intertwined with the stress to succeed for herself, her parents, and her race.

STUDENT M’S TRIPLE QUANDARY TEACHINGS

Student M grew up in London with parents who had migrated from the West Indies. Although separated by an ocean from the United States, Student M’s parents also instilled in her and her siblings all components of Triple Quandary. Relief from the racism experienced in London came from a focus on someday moving to America and obtaining the American dream. During Student M’s middle school years, she and her family moved to the U.S. Upon arriving M soon learned that the American dream would not be easily attained and she would have to move through barriers of racism and oppression even worse than those in London. Similar to Student K, Student M’s parents held education as the key to overcoming challenges to racism and a means to a better life than her parents who both dropped out of high school. Teachings of her African ancestry ran deep, with family ties back to slavery in the U.S. and other parts of the “Americas”. The teachings Student M received were a source of strength and motivation for her to move forward toward her goal of becoming highly educated so that she could help “uplift” herself and her People.

COPING

With help from their faculty advisor, both doctoral students proceeded to engage in the second math course with similar feelings and reminders from earlier life experiences. Recall, Student K identified a threat to her academic confidence, the resurfacing of that “pesky inkling of self-doubt,” early on in the first course by stating, “reflecting on my fifth grade math experience helped me to recognize that my doctoral level math professor did not seem to hold high expectations for me to excel in math.” In the university math course and in her private school’s fifth grade math class, Student K was experiencing racial discrimination. Looking at Student K’s expressions of oppression in conjunction with her parents’ teachings reveals how she developed coping strategies that protected her even today in her doctoral level math class. Student K recalled, “At Montessori, I was one of three Black students in the entire K-8 school. Although some students and teachers were kind to me, I

remember feeling like they thought I didn't deserve to be there; like they were waiting for me to fail. My parents confidently reminded me that they themselves were more educated than my teachers and that I was getting a better education due to the small classes and individualized attention." Her parents' words here reflect an important message and coping strategy to strive toward greater education even in the face of racism. Student K's parents taught her to anticipate racism as she strived for success. They told her that people, even some Black people, would maintain low expectations for her academic success. However, as she recalls, "every greeting card or note from my father includes his favorite saying, "keep your eye on the prize." The prize, in his estimation, I believe was education, the only way to level the playing field between Blacks and Whites." The coping strategy that Student K took away was that even when you're experiencing racism, despite how bad it makes you feel, you must be reminded of your privilege (the opportunity of higher education), and because that privilege is not afforded to most Blacks, it is your duty to succeed against all odds.

Student M gained and used the teachings of her parents to effectively cope with the microaggression and succeed in the class the following semester. Upon experiencing racism in the United States for the first time Student M said she felt intense feelings of frustration and anger and immediately took those feelings home and confronted her parents as found in the following words: "Just when I thought I had fled racism when I moved out of London to America, I was foolishly mistaken, as I encountered the same racial oppression not only in my school, but also in my community. It was then that I had questioned my parents on their choice to move since things were not racially better in America. It was at this point in my life where my parents enforced the importance of a quality education, in order to conquer some of the racial inequalities and injustices that are prevalent in society." While both students' (M and K) parents taught that education was the way to counter the racism of life in America, for student M, this core principle of life was taught within the context of her experiencing excruciating feelings associated with being "welcomed" to United States minority status. "Through my years of being educated in high school, undergraduate/graduate College and now my Doctorate, I find myself leaning on the lessons my parents taught me in order to feel empowered, strong and confident as a black female, in a racially unjust society. Student M's coping strategy when there is threat to her achieving the American dream is to stop and confront whomever she believes is responsible. In fact, Student M speaks with much confidence in her ability to confront people in situations deemed racist or oppressive.

STRATEGIES IN SECOND COURSE

Student M: Just prior to the start of the second class, Student M contacted the professor asking for a meeting to talk about the email she sent her stating she thought she should take a different class the following semester. “The day came for us to meet and I felt full confidence to express my thoughts and reaction to her email. I also knew that I had to keep in mind that I needed to be careful in my choice of words when expressing my thoughts, since I did not want to out-right accuse her of something or pre-judge her, just like she had pre-judged me.” This meeting ended with the professor apologizing to Student M for including her in her generalization of the Black students wanting to take her second class.

Once the second class began, Student M did not retreat from her vigilance pertaining to being treated unfairly by the professor, as she notes; “As the new semester began in part two of this class, I already had my guard up with defense mechanisms in place. The feeling of anxiousness was upon me, knowing that I now had to prove that I was worthy and capable of being in her class. As the class progressed, I noticed that I was now putting in more time, energy and hours to complete assignments and achieve a high grade. By mid-semester my lowest grade was 90. Also, by mid-semester I had approached the Professor on two occasions, in order to discuss concerns I had regarding her point-system, comments or discrepancies I found on my returned assignments. A feeling of disappointment would again arise within me, when I noticed that I had the same answer as another group member, but yet my answer was marked wrong and theirs correct. During my discussions, it was apparent that the professor knew what she was doing and she made it obvious that I was being given a difficult time in order to push me to do better. This type of teaching style did not feel comfortable with me, since my feelings of underlying racism was my perception for her motivation.

As the class progressed, I would put my feelings aside and make an extra effort to be nice to the professor. I was now staying a little later at the end of each class, in order to make small-talk and wish her a good afternoon. Once again, another surprise came when she approached me after one of my assignment was returned, and stated that I was doing well in the course. My thoughts were; “did my comments provoke the professor to think about herself and how she was treating me?” “Will she now change her teaching style towards me now that she knows that I will bring my concerns to her attention once I notice discrepancies?” As the class came to a close for that semester, a final thought came to mind; “was there a lesson learned from student to teacher?”

Student K: After experiencing the microaggressions in math the first semester, I responded by disengaging with the professor. I had lost

some respect for her on a personal level and was only concerned about earning a good grade in the course. I no longer felt safe talking to her about my challenges with the material. I wanted to avoid asking her for help or extra time to work on assignments out of concern that she would mistake such requests as symptoms of weakness. I felt that the professor's biases toward me were deeply embedded in her consciousness and that there was nothing I could do to change her perceptions of me. I believed that no matter how hard I tried, no matter how well I performed on assignments, I would not impress her, nor did I care to try. If I did well on the assignments, I expected that she would attribute my good work to something other than my intelligence, like cheating or getting help from classmates. In fact, in her first semester course, she quizzed me about how I arrived at a certain answer on an assignment while insinuating that I was cheating by getting help from students who took her class prior semesters. Paradoxically, all students in my class were working in small groups to complete the lengthy, difficult assignments. My focus second semester was to simply do my best work while avoiding personal interactions with her. Avoiding her would protect me from "losing my cool" as I feared that if I spoke with her, her implicit racist attitudes would become too apparent for me to ignore or to address politely. If I had to confront her, I feared that she would use her power to punish me by giving me a lower grade than I deserved. Thus, I focused on the course material, and tried my best to ignore her racist ideals, in effort to avoid confrontation and make a good grade in the course. I did what my father had taught me and "kept my eye on the prize."

DISCUSSION

Microaggressions offer a framework for enhancing the understanding of Black's experiences of minority status stress (Greer and Brown 2011). Moreover, probing the impacts of microaggressions can reveal the nature of the stress for the individual, i.e. depression, anxiety. Further, by adding Triple Quandary to an exploration of microaggressions, more dimensions of importance emerge (i.e. coping strategies) that might contribute to the growing knowledge base of minority status stress. Two dimensions that have emerged when considering Triple Quandary in this paper are parental teachings function to provide a foundation for Black students to move successfully through the United States schooling system and beyond, and the continuity in processes associated with minority status stress between early (K-12) and later post secondary racial discrimination in the educational setting.

PARENTAL TEACHINGS

The way in which a microaggression situation is addressed, i.e. do students' lived experience become validated or invalidated, is important for understanding minority status stress. Parents of the two students in this paper validated their racial discriminatory experiences during their K-12 educational years, thus provided protection against their potential harmful effects and future coping capacities. However, stating that parents gave their children protection does not mean such children no longer require further support in addressing microaggressions. Even with early parental protection in the form of validating of oppressive experiences both students remained vulnerable to the harmful impacts of microaggressions. More on students' vulnerabilities is presented below in addressing the notion of continuity of educational experiences, but first greater details regarding parental teaching resumes. As the students' advisor reflected on the microaggression, he recalled:

When the professor communicated her concerns regarding all three Black students in her class, I did not question the professor. I hadn't been in communication with the students about their experience in the professor's class, thus, I didn't have any basis to counter the professor's claims. However, when I sat face to face with the doctoral students listening to their expressions of sadness, disappointment, frustration, as they related how the professor's actions had "landed" on them – their lived experience, I immediately provided my full support by validating what they had experienced. The moment I validated the students' lived experiences, I "stepped in" for their parents [in loco parentis] in protecting them from further harm from the microaggression.

Further harm could have occurred in the form of a more permanent loss of academic self-esteem, and in the faculty advisor as a trusting supporter. Support from the advisor protected the students from further harm so both could implement coping strategies learned from their parents' teachings (Johnson-Bailey, Valentine, Cervero, and Bowles 2008).

The parental teachings of both students demonstrate that Blacks continue to share a common bond when it comes to racism. First, both experienced the microaggression as yet another challenge to reaching their greater goal of higher education or the American dream (Boykin and Toms 1985). Additionally, both students' parents taught them that to achieve their American dream they would need to be able to effectively navigate through structural barriers of racism. For Blacks, achieving the American dream is more than just advancing in life as an individual and

perhaps reaching middle class status. It also means if one succeeds in reaching this Dream, one's "people" (Blacks as a collective group) are uplifted. Academic success, therefore, is both an individual and collective goal as a result of the racialized teachings these students received from their parents (Carter 2008).

COPING STRATEGIES

Silver and Wortman (1980) define coping as "any and all responses made by an individual who encounters a potentially harmful outcome" (281). Carter (2008) asserts that successful Black "students develop adaptive strategies. . . for overcoming racism that allow them to maintain high academic achievement and strong racial/ethnic self-definitions" (489). Coping with racial microaggressions in an academic environment can be demonstrated in varying degrees of resistance to stressors (Carter Andrews 2012). In this case, the source of stress for Students K and M stemmed from the microaggression that inaccurately and unfairly attributed their race as an indicator of their academic abilities. While both graduate students demonstrated different coping strategies, both styles protected them from internalizing a victimization mentality and allowed these students to maintain their positive achievement ideologies in order to reach their American dreams.

Roth and Cohen (1986) describe two coping strategies: approach and avoidant. With approach coping strategies, the individual makes an attempt to confront or resolve the stressor. Whereas with avoidant strategies, the individual distances herself from the stressor or reframes her thinking about the problem. Student K employed an "avoidant coping strategy" by deciding not to confront the professor about the microaggression, which according to Carter (2008) could be a survival strategy that "protects her emotional and mental health in the classroom environment (491)." If Student K had chosen to confront the professor, the professor could have revealed even more racist notions which could have potentially threatened Student K's race/achievement identity. For Student K, that threat was not worth risking her academic success, especially at the Ph.D. level. By "avoiding" confrontation, Student K was able to simultaneously maintain her positive Black identity and academic self-confidence. Alternatively, Student M employed an "approach coping strategy" by confronting the professor in attempt to resolve her concerns about the racial microaggression. Student M's problem solving approach, although quite different than Student K's, similarly enabled her to persist in the class and maintain her Black identity despite the perceived denigration (Carter Andrews 2012).

RESPONSE CONTINUITY

Response continuity of racial discriminatory experiences refers to a child's initial and/or early experiences, the adults' response(s) to the experience(s) (validated or not validated) and whether adults/parents are able to attach meaningful (racially based) learning to the experience. As children and adolescents progress through their formal schooling discriminatory situations can occur one after another. Individuals from marginalized groups (including school-age children) can experience multiple microaggressions on a daily basis. Black children can enter the schooling process with their "smart selves" intact, only to be challenged by the kinds of racially based experiences described by the two doctoral students in this paper. In a research study on Black parental involvement in their children's education, a consistent theme reported by parents, was their puzzlement pertaining to the difficulties of their children's academic self-esteem remaining intact upon entering the public school setting (Colbert 1991). As shown in the case examples in this article, racial discrimination experienced in early educational settings can continue throughout higher education. Thus, it is important to their well being and academic self esteem that some trusted "adult" continue to validate the experiences and provide meaning that is consistent with early parental teachings.

IMPLICATIONS

K-12 Education

For children and adolescents in grades K-12, we would need to take a closer look at what they are experiencing during this stage of their lives. Specifically, for children of color, those who might externalize their coping skills when dealing with microaggression could be perceived as defiant, unruly and combative. Research showing that students of color are issued disproportionately more disciplinary sanctions when compared to White students supports our contention here that if students of color attempt to communicate their experiences of racism within the school setting, their behavior might be misread as discipline issues (Gregory, Skiba, and Noguera 2010). Even though their intentions may be to communicate a basic learning need (feel positive about themselves and other members of their reference group) their behavior could be misinterpreted as disruptive and out of control. It is perhaps unreasonable to expect children and even adolescents to have skills needed to effectively communicate their perceptions of microaggressions to adults who might have been the deliverers of those negative behaviors. Colbert (in press) recommends that school counselors advocate for students by conducting analyses of interactions among teachers and students using Helms' Ra-

cial Identity Interaction Model (Helms 2003). Data collected of teacher-student interactions over a period of time could determine whether regressive relationships exist, meaning that the teacher is at lower level of racial identity development than student(s), making it highly improbable student needs would be met. Further, such analyses would provide specific and relevant information for developing staff development on meeting the needs of all students. Observation and analysis of interactions could be extended to other school personnel and students in order to provide material for ongoing staff development. Trainings could occur on a yearly basis, so all staff members are well informed on cultural competencies (Vera, Buhin, and Isacco 2009).

HIGHER EDUCATION

Training for professors working with students from different cultural backgrounds at the university level is also an important component for cultural competencies. Specifically, training focusing on self-awareness of one's own biases is the beginning stage for recognizing microaggressions. The university where the microaggression experiences were presented in this article provides staff and faculty with diversity training in the form of knowledge of various aspects of diversity. However, there is no university or institutional level training for personnel regarding self-awareness of personal bias and how these can be expressed outside an individuals' awareness as in the case of microaggressions. No matter how self-aware professors might become with training to fight microaggression there is always the chance one could commit another microaggression. Further training would be needed on how to effectively engage with a student who might bring a microaggression concern to a professor. In such cases it is important to validate the "lived experienced" of the person communicating a microaggression. Sue and Sue (2013) consider the decision victims of microaggressions are faced with as one of the more perplexing ones related to minority status stress.

Catch twenty-two is the term used to denote the added stress one might experience when deciding whether to confront someone about their lived experience of a microaggression. Specifically, when the person to be confronted holds power over the other as in the case of the professor and the two doctoral students in this article, the potential for stress is even more probable than when the accused does not hold power over the victim(s). Accordingly, victims' thinking process goes something like: "if I confront the professor, she might get upset and think I'm accusing her of being a racist or something, and worst yet she might punish me by lowering my course grade or even giving me a failing grade." If the victim does not confront the professor (in this case) and she does not have another trusting supporting person to share the experi-

ence with and receive validation of her lived experience, she will likely internalize the experience and might doubt her own reality of what she experienced.

This potential for turning the microaggression inward is illustrated when upon receiving the email for her professor student M states, "Is she correct and should I believe that I am not capable of making it in her class next semester?" "Maybe I should follow her advice and take another class next semester instead of hers." Similarly, Student K recalled racial bias from the professor prior to the microaggression reported here when she asserted, "I thought I had dispelled the irrational belief that I was not smart enough to understand doctoral level math. However, a pesky inkling of self-doubt was trying to resurface. Refusing to allow self-doubt to reenter my consciousness, I spent long hours studying alone, and with peers, to make sure I met the learning objectives and earned a decent grade. I did not attempt to address the reasons my professor doubted me." Internalizing microaggressions results in symptoms such as depression, anxiety, high blood pressure, hopelessness, lower achievement and success (Franklin and Boyd-Franklin 2000).

CONCLUSION

The concept microaggressions has gained recognition in the psychology and counseling fields for its utility in understanding and addressing racism and other forms of discrimination/oppression experienced by individuals from marginalized groups. In article, microaggressions were used as the primary concept for understanding two female doctoral students experience with a university professor. Additionally, the concepts minority stress and Triple-Quandary provided context to the students' experience of microaggressions. Evaluating the microaggression of the students in this manuscript demonstrated three noteworthy findings: (1) both received similar teachings from parents that were consistent with Triple Quandary, (2) both developed different styles of coping with racism, and (3) the importance of consistency in response by trusted adults throughout a person's educational journey. The outcome for the students in this manuscript was positive due to the initial teachings by their parents and the advocacy on their behalf by their Black advisor. However, far too many students of color in United States schools from kindergarten through university terminal degree levels are "derailed" from achieving their American dream because of educators who oftentimes have very good intentions yet lack knowledge and training to effectively respond to microaggressions. With proper training teachers at all levels of education can become adept at eliminating the negative consequences of microaggressions from the lives of far too many students.

REFERENCES

- Allen, Walter R. 1992. "The Color of Success: African-American College Student Outcomes at Predominantly White and Historically Black Public Colleges and Universities." *Harvard Educational Review* 62 (1): 26-45.
- Banks, Kira Hudson. 2010. "African American College Students' Experience of Racial Discrimination and the Role of College Hassles." *Journal of College Student Development* 51 (1): 23-34.
- Barr, Simone C., and Helen A. Neville. 2008. "Examination of the Link Between Parental Racial Socialization Messages and Racial Ideology Among Black College Students." *Journal of Black Psychology* 34 (2): 131-155.
- Boykin, A. Wade, and Forrest D. Toms. 1985. "Black Child Socialization: A Conceptual Framework." "In *Black Children: Social, Educational, and Parental Environments*, edited by Harriette Pipes McAdoo and John Lewis McAdoo, 33-51. Beverly Hills, CA: Sage.
- Carter, Dorinda J. 2008. "Achievement as Resistance: The Development of a Critical Race Achievement Ideology among Black Achievers." *Harvard Educational Review* 78 (3): 466-497.
- Carter Andrews, Dorinda J. 2012. "Black Achievers' Experiences With Racial Spotlighting and Ignoring in a Predominantly White High School." *Teachers College Record* 114, 1-46.
- Colbert, Robert, D. in press. "From Jim Crow South to Academia: One Brother's Counternarrative for School Counselor Social Advocacy." *National Journal of Urban Education and Practice*.
- Colbert, Robert, D. 1991. "Untapped Resource: African American Parental Perceptions." *Elementary School Guidance & Counseling* 26 (2): 96-105.
- Fleming, Jacqueline. 1984. *Blacks in College*. San Francisco: Jossey-Bass.
- Franklin, Anderson J., and Nancy Boyd-Franklin. 2000. "Invisibility Syndrome: A Clinical Model of the Effects of Racism on African-American Males." *American Journal of Orthopsychiatry* 70: 33-41.
- Franklin, Anderson J. 1999. "Invisibility Syndrome and Racial Identity Development in Psychotherapy and Counseling African American Men." *The Counseling Psychologist* 27: 761-793.
- Greer, Tawanda M. 2008. "Racial and Ethnic-related Stressors as Predictors of Perceived Stress and Academic Performance for Afri-

- can American students at a Historically Black College and University." *The Journal of Negro Education* 77: 60-71.
- Greer, Tawanda M., and Porschia Brown. 2011. "Minority Status Stress and Coping Processes Among African American College Students." *Journal of Diversity in Higher Education* 4: 26-38.
- Greer, Tawanda M., and Kathleen Chwalisz. 2007. "Minority-related Stressors and Coping Processes Among African American College Students." *Journal of College Student Development* 48 (4): 388-404.
- Gregory, Anne, Russell J. Skiba, and Pedro A. Noguera. 2010. "The Achievement Gap and the Discipline Gap Two Sides of the Same Coin?." *Educational Researcher* 39 (1): 59-68.
- Helms, Janet, E. 2003. "Racial Identity on the Social Environment." In *Multicultural Counseling in Schools; A Practical Handbook*, edited by Paul B. Pedersen and John C. Carey, 44-58. Boston, MA: Allyn and Bacon.
- Johnson-Bailey, Juanita, Thomas S. Valentine, Ronald M. Cervero, and Tuere A. Bowles. 2008. "Lean On Me: The Support Experiences of Black Graduate Students." *The Journal of Negro Education* 77 (4): 365-381.
- Marshall, Sheree. 1995. "Ethnic Socialization of African American Children: Implications for Parenting, Identity Development, and Academic Achievement." *Journal of Youth and Adolescence* 24 (4): 377-396.
- McAdoo, Harriette Pipes. 2002. *Black Children: Social, Educational, and Parental Environments*. Sage.
- Roth, Susan, and Lawrence J. Cohen. 1986. "Approach, Avoidance, and Coping with Stress." *American Psychologist* 41 (7): 813-819.
- Silver, Roxane L., and Camille B. Wortman. 1980. "Coping with Undesirable Life Events." In *Human Helplessness: Theory and Applications* edited by J. Garber & M. EP Seligman, 279-340. New York: Academic Press.
- Smedley, Brian D., Hector F. Myers, and Shelly P. Harrell. 1993. "Minority-Status Stresses and the College Adjustment of Ethnic Minority Freshmen." *Journal of Higher Education* 64 (4): 434-452.
- Sue, Derald Wing, and David Sue. 2013. *Counseling the Culturally Diverse: Theory and Practice*. New York, NY: John Wiley.
- Sue, Derald Wing, Christina M. Capodilupo, Gina C. Torino, Jennifer M. Bucceri, Aisha Holder, Kevin L. Nadal, and Marta Esquilin. 2007. "Racial Microaggressions in Everyday Life: Implications for Clinical Practice." *American Psychologist* 62 (4): 271-286.

- U.S. Department of Education, National Center for Education Statistics
2015. *Digest of Education Statistics, 2013* (NCES 2015-011),
(nces.ed.gov).
- Vera, Elizabeth M., Larisa Buhin, and Anthony Isacco. 2009. "The Role
of Prevention in Psychology's Social Justice Agenda." In *Realizing
Social Justice: The Challenge of Preventive Interventions*, edited
by Maureen E. Kenny, Arthur M. Horne, Pamela. Orpinas, and
Le'Roy E. Reese, 79-96. American Psychological Association.

DISCURSIVE AND PROCESSUAL SOCIALIZATION OF THE MASS INTO ACTS OF VIOLENCE: THE CASE OF RWANDAN GENOCIDE

Jeylan Wolyie Hussein
Haramaya University, Dire Dawa, Ethiopia.

The Rwandan genocide that led to the death of 800, 000 Tutsi and 50,000 moderate Hutu is one of the most horrendous atrocities in human history. The genocide was the outcome of human's negatively orchestrated agency. It is of course 'ultra-genocidal' as it was extended to moderate Hutu who refused to cooperate with the ultra-nationalist ideology (Dutton, Boyanowsky & Bond 2005; Campbell 2010). It was a planned, systemic and methodical massacring. It was the genocide in which ethnic extremists mobilized resources including the linguistic and cultural resources of the country to get the public incitement into mass slaughtering. The genocide was fundamentally rooted in the politics of hatred that spotlighted the better future of the Hutu in indiscriminately exterminating the Tutsi. The anti-Tutsi propaganda heightened Tutsiphobia and scapegoated them for the entire predicaments which the Hutu suffered throughout their history. When the genocide began, it seemed as if every Hutu, except some, was fulfilling their obligation to weed out the enemy.

The aim of this article is to recast the nature of the genocide and illustrate how destructive ideologies instigated people's social psychology and moral preparation for destructive fulfilment. Discourses of dehumanization (Hackett 2003) and other systems of ethnic devaluation were used to deepen xenophobia and ethnic hostility among the Hutu and the Tutsi. The genocidal activations were media-supported. The role of *Radio Télévision Libre des Mille Collines* (RTL) was significantly high in particular. In addition to the radio, *Kangura*, a French-language newspaper, served as a powerful instrument to stoke ethnic hatred and prime appalling savagery and aggression against all Rwandans of Tutsi ethnicity (Stanton 2004; Winton 2008).

HISTORICAL BACKGROUND TO ETHNIC DEHUMANIZATION AND THE GENOCIDE

The Hutu and the Tutsi lived together in the country for hundreds of years without any genocidal turn against one another. The Hutu are numerically the majority by far while the Tutsi are the minority. The former

are agriculturalists whereas the latter are pastoralists. The Tutsi had also a sophisticated hereditary monarchic system. However, a significant difference in their social status and asymmetrical access to power and influence emerged with colonialism. The Belgian colonists applied a strict divide and rule system in the country to tear the groups asunder. This is the system in which one group is favoured and the other is disfavoured for colonial end.

Myths of the ethnic groups' diametrical differences were constructed and reconstructed to set off and solidify distinctions between them. The other colonial strategy of differentiation was identifying the functioning system, sophisticating or elevating its function so that it would fit the colonial goal. For instance, the Tutsi's monarchical history was taken as a reference to justify their continued domination in the political and socio-cultural offices of the colonial period. However, the major racialized myth of ethnic differentiation used to marginalize the Hutu and to accelerate the power and influence of the Tutsi was the well known Hamitic Hypothesis. The Hamitic Hypothesis is a racist hypothesis created to deprive the African people of the value of humanity and make them vulnerable to racialized dehumanization. It concludes that every footprint of material and spiritual civilization in Africa came with 'the Caucasoid', white race in black skin (Hamites) which are portrayed in the hypothesis as well civilized and quicker witted groups. The African people were depicted, on the other hand, as unsophisticated and passive recipients of civilization.

The hypothesis is a discourse of dehumanization created to justify the subjugation of groups on mere physical characteristics. Observable physical variations were used to essentialize the existence of deeper racial differences between the Hutu and the Tutsi. The Hutu were denigrated as sub-humans while the Tutsi (based on their Nilo-hamitic physiognomy) were praised as a racially superior group. The Belgian colonists monopolized important political offices for the Tutsi on the basis of the Hamitic hypothesis. They uplifted the Tutsi as good allies in the colonial rule and as a group whose active participation in the colonial system could not be forfeited (Reyntjens 1987). Thus, the colonial rule laid a strong cultural and psychological foundation for the politics of exclusion by preferring the Tutsi and relegating the Hutu, the allegedly racially inferior group, to a secondary position. The system dehumanized the Hutu by labelling them as people who are not capable of holding offices because of their racial defects.

One fundamental step towards discourse of ethnic dehumanization applied in Rwanda was the removal of the Hutu chiefs from their traditional power on the basis of mere sense of racial inferiority. However, the racially based ethnic categorization between the two was strongly

sealed in 1933 when the colonists 'distributed ethnic identity cards to systematise the restriction of administrative jobs and higher education to Tutsis' (Kamola 2007, 578). In his eight stages of genocide, Stanton (2004) defines this type of racialized ethnic identification as symbolization of differences. It should be noted, however, that the process of symbolization itself was based on original racialized dehumanization and hyper-differentiation of the ethnic groups to dilacerate them for colonial end. Racialized ethnic categorization served as a weapon in the colonists' process of dehumanization. It was a discursive production and consolidation of racialized distinction to frame the divide-and-rule policy's underlying politics of exclusion and de-legitimization. The colonists intentionally issued identity cards that symbolize their colonial de-historicization, objectification, demonization and ultimate de-legitimization of the Hutu.

On the basis of racial explanations and to cement the racial differences between the Hutu and the Tutsi, the colonists also arranged a separate schooling system for Hutu and Tutsi sons. The aim was to give the Tutsi sons high standard education to equip them with the competence required to effectively function in colonial offices and in business activities. The Hamitic Hypothesis of ethnic superiority of Tutsi and inferiority of the Hutu was taught in schools and reiterated on other forums to perpetuate the racialized narratives. By depriving the Hutu access to better education and other capacity-building structures of modernization, the colonial system had set a solid normative barrier to hinder their process of becoming. The dehumanization project set a hard ground for ethnic vulnerability of the Hutu and superiority of the Tutsi. It also laid the psychosocial foundation for the Hutu's later vengeful and organized violence waged against the Tutsi (Woolf and Hulsizer 2005). As would be made clear later, out of deep ethnic animosity, the Hutu reinvented the discourse of originality and attacked the Tutsi by categorically depicting them as tricky foreign invaders who should be expunged out of a Rwanda that belongs, according to them, only to the Hutu.

The Hutu's extremist discourse is suggestive of the Nazi discourse about Jews in which Hitler and his compatriots wanted to ensure the health, purity, and growth of German by persecuting the Jews (Linke 2002; Afflitto 2000; Stanton 2004). By and large, there were two types of oppressive discourses in colonial Rwanda that solidified and maintained the myths of ethnic dissimilarity between the Hutu and the Tutsi. The first one was day-to-day verbal reiteration of the Hutu's inferiority and the Tutsi's superiority. The second form of discursive disadvantage was practical occupational, economic and political dominance which the Tutsi assumed and used to deepen the predicament of the Hutu. The two discursive mechanisms of social oppression reinforced each other and

deepened injustices in the country. As time passed, dominance of the Tutsi and subordination of Hutu became the day to day reality. The discourses of ethnic inferiority and superiority caused an identity crisis that could lead to ethnic self-denigration and search for better category of self-identification.

The ethnic hostility between the two groups continued until 1959 when the Hutu revolted against the Tutsi. When the colonial rule ended in 1962, independent Rwanda was led by Hutu-dominated leaders. From 1962-1994, the Hutu-dominated government became explicitly prejudiced and brutal against the Tutsi. Thousands of people from the Tutsi ethnicity were massacred in this period. Instead of establishing a system ethnic equality and co-existence, the ruling system exercised open revenge by oppressing the oppressor. None of the perpetrators in the massacres were taken to court for trial and were instead valorised for their deeds. The political environment created a high climate of revenge and granted the perpetrators impunity for the crimes they had committed against humanity. In the early period of independence, hundreds and thousands of Tutsi fled the atrocities and took asylum in neighbouring countries such as Burundi, Uganda, the Democratic Republic of Congo, and Tanzania. Those in the country lived enduring discriminations waged against them by the heavy-handed government. Throughout 1980's, the country suffered severe economic failures. Rural as well as urban poverty, youth unemployment, and fall in the values of agricultural products in the international markets were the major economic conundrums in the country that created general public discontent (Fujii, 2004). However, no matter how undemocratic and suppressive it was against the Tutsi, the Hutu government did not reach the stage of maximum brutality in which it mobilized the entire Hutu to participate in a genocide meant to erase the Tutsi from the planet.

News of invasion by the Rwandan Patriotic Front (RPF), however, worsened the government's attitude towards the Tutsi. RPF was a rebel force organized largely from the Tutsi refugees and exiles who were compelled to flee the country by the gruesome ethnic massacres imposed on them by the Hutu dominated government. The Hutu government expressed its wrath against the Tutsi's plan to recast their power and hegemony in the country. The Hutu-led government and RPF entered into an armed struggle that threw the country into a devastating civil war. The civil war was different from other civil wars in Africa in that it gradually evolved into an ideology of ethnic power in which resources and institutions were mobilized to eradicate the Tutsi through relentless genocide. The Hutu extremists used media to disseminate a propaganda of hatred and to prepare the people's social psychology for resolute revenge. Within few hours of the mysterious crashing of the plane that carried

President Juvenal Habyarimana, the paramilitary blocked roads and pathways to start mass killings. The promptness of the genocidal action clearly indicated that the genocide was not a spontaneous eruption and the plane crash became just a pretext to enact a thoroughly planned and organized massacre. The extremists' social psychology for mass killing was moulded well so that from April 1994 onwards one would see ordinary Hutu side by side with the *Interahamwe* (the murder squads) slaughtering every Tutsi irrespective of age, sex, social class and religious category. It was the event in which the government mobilized resources and institutions and organized armed groups, unemployed youth and the ordinary people into a huge force of violence (Staub et al. 2005). To soften the massacring of the perceived enemy, the Hutu extremists used communal work as one of the imageries in their genocidal symbolism.

THE GENOCIDAL INCITEMENTS WAGED AGAINST THE TUTSI

One outstanding circumstantial factor that pulled the Hutu into genocide was the extremists' systematic and methodical mobilization of institutions to win the hearts of the masses into the genocidal project. The extremists used language to dehumanize and demonize the Tutsi as a cancerous swelling that should be removed. They used language in the same way as the architects of genocide used language to incite public hatred against the Jews and Gypsies during the Second World War.

Dehumanization in whatever form it appears is an intentional process of imposing degrading attributes on individuals as well as the groups to which they belong to justify the remorseless destruction of the group (Hagan and Rymond-Richmond 2008). In Rwanda, the extremists intentionally created a hateful climate through extreme propagation of hatred and by instigating the Hutu to actively participate in brutal and destructive acts of genocide, rape, and other inhuman acts. The way the ordinary people participated in the brutalization of their fellow citizens suggest that difficult ethno-political circumstances drive innocent people to develop destructive motives. Post-genocidal researchers who interviewed the perpetrators indicated the perpetrators' view that they were moved into the atrocities by the overwhelming propaganda of hatred and suspicion that ripped them of their moral and emotional restraints. However, situational pressures may not necessarily create a brand new trait for destructive and brutal acts and shape a collective moral disengagement or moral vacuum required to act brutally. One can say that situational pressure can reinforce or boost up latent feelings of hostility. One good speculation is that the history of hostility was already underway in the country and had been feeding into intergenerational animosity. The history of the country in general and the post-1959 revolution in particu-

lar reveals that one of the conditions for mass involvement in the genocidal acts was a sharp decline in humanistic values and the concurrent tolerance for impunity in the political scheme of the country. Throughout 1960s, 1970s, and 1980s, the Tutsi suffered several hate-driven atrocities. The RPF's insurgency in 1990 exacerbated the government's prejudice against the Tutsi and gave the extremists the ground for genocide.

Plagued by poverty and being aware that overall socio-economic conundrums had already caused huge frustration in the country, the government looked for something that would help it redirect the masses out of frustration and into vengeance. The government told the Hutu that they had throughout history been victims of the Tutsi's systematic and brutal oppression and that they would heal their wounds of oppression only through waging genocide against the enemy who, according to the propaganda, was still working against them. In one of the Hutu Ten Commandments published in *Kangura* No. 6 in December 1990, the Hutu men were told that Tutsi women were enemies clandestinely working to facilitate conditions for Tutsi dominance, power, and hegemony. It vehemently opposed the idea of Hutu men having Tutsi women as wives, secretaries, or concubines since this was seen as compliance. The print media drew red lights between the two ethnic groups in order to polarize ethnic divisions and justify indiscriminate eviction of the targeted group. It warned the Hutu against business partnership with the Tutsi. In a way that tears asunder the social fabric of the society, the publication advised the Hutu to exclude the Tutsi and advised them to strengthen their solidarity and stand firmly against their enemy (Kabanda 2007).

THE DISCURSIVE AND METAPHORICAL DIMENSION OF ETHNIC VIOLENCE IN RWANDA

The mass involvement into the genocide is the outcome of a huge frustration among the Hutu extremists due to poverty, unemployment, and misery. The extremists manipulated the phenomenon and made their equally frustrated masses scapegoat the Tutsi for their predicament which turned into bitter animosity against them. As Schimmel (2011) eloquently puts, the Rwandan genocide was 'a meticulously planned and executed project of extermination of all Tutsis in Rwanda by the government, army, militias and Hutu civilians' (1126). No single theory can fully explain the causes and dynamics of the extreme atrocities the country had undergone. Therefore, one should look for multiple mutually reinforcing and complementing theories. This situation is explained partially by frustration-aggression-displacement theory. The theory has it that the frustrating external event (. e.g. the war waged by RPF) creates an instigation to impulsive aggression and self-defensive. The purpose in

frustration-aggression displacement is to forge shared understanding that the scapegoat is responsible for unhappy encounters. According to Dutton et al (2004), the public 'desperation enhances the ability of leaders to generate compliance with genocidal commands' and in the case of Rwanda, conformity to those commands was framed in terms of communal labour obligations. The killing was euphemized as 'doing the work,' and weapons as 'tools' (454). The Hutu extremists' pre-occupation with metaphors and other nuances of symbolism will be discussed later in the article.

It should be clear, though, that frustration leads to aggression only when they are manipulated through and mediated by ideology. In Rwanda, the extremists manipulated the frustration for their own political or genocidal ends. That is why it is said that 'the proximal cause of organized aggression in response to shared frustrations is ideological rather than the result of a direct frustration-aggression link' (Glick 2002, 137).

Another factor that instigated the mass to act violently was the government's systematic achievement in terrorizing the Hutu by exaggerating the Tutsi's insurgency as a massive threat that devastates not only hard-won gains of the 1959 revolution, but the very survival of the ethnic Hutu in Rwanda. The theory that explains how the perceived threat by one's historical enemy drives people into massive violence is psychocultural interpretation theory (Staub 2002). In its explanation about the causes for people's engagement in extreme acts of violence such as genocide, psychocultural interpretation theory shares a lot of points with symbolic political theory. This theory asserts that violence and other extraordinary cruelties are caused by 'group myths that justify hostility, fears of group extinction, and a symbolic politics of chauvinist mobilization. The hostile myths produce emotion-laden symbols that make mass hostility easy for chauvinist elites to provoke and make extremist policies popular' (Kaufman 2006, 47). Writing of the Rwandan case, Kaufman (2006) states that 'Rwanda's genocide must have been motivated by an exceptionally hostile, eliminationist Hutu mythology aimed against the Tutsi.' He argues that the 'extreme mass hostility against Tutsi, and chauvinist mobilization based on manipulating ethnic symbols-all resulting in predation-driven security dilemma' (70). How the Hutu extremists used symbols to mobilize the mass into violence will be explained later through analysis of the metaphorical instruments mobilized for semantic effect in the context of the conflict.

At the onset of the genocide, most of the Hutu Rwandese carried out the massacre as an aspect of maintaining obedience to their ethnic identity by joining others who during the period claimed to have been protecting their ethnicity from its plotted demise. The theory that explains why and how this identity-based self-commitment to atrocity oc-

curs is social identity theory. In Rwanda, ordinary Hutu joined the atrocious campaign perplexed by the phobia which the genocidal propaganda created. They engaged themselves in the crimes not only to protect their survival, but also to reassert their positive social identity. However, this theory does not explain why all Hutus were not threatened and driven by the propaganda that created a high climate of fear among the Hutu. One can conclude only that the Hutu were subjected differently to the factors that shaped inter-group thinking and collaboration towards violence. There are theories that explain the reasons why attitudinal differences between individuals occur in aberrant conditions where 'habitually lawful social relations degenerate into unrestrained violence' (Akhavan 2001, 11). For example, Waller's four-pronged model developed to explain causes of human's extraordinary evils suggests that the individuals' psych-moral domains and sub-culture and psycho-social domain within the broader culture and psycho-social domain to which individuals and groups belong may affect their reaction and position. He classifies these two major domains into four levels of contributing factors. The first prong in the model is *the distal forces of human nature* which shape individuals' responses to authority such as ethnocentrism, xenophobia, and an innate craving for power and dominance. This factor largely involves a far-reaching impact of primordial forces and the pressure exerted on them by situational forces. The second one is *identities of the perpetrator* as shaped by cultural belief systems, ideological indoctrination, propaganda, moral disconnection, and the development of a moral imperative towards the victimization of others.

The third prong that influences individuals' responses to authority is *defining the victims as the 'other'* with the aim to exclude and inflict harm. Exclusion of victims as others and their ideological/genocidal dehumanization through euphemistic labels like "bacilli," "parasites," "vermin," "demons" and a "plague" used by the Nazi exterminators to target the Jews during the Second World War shape the perpetrators' negative perceptions of the victims and cause them to develop a strong propensity to reduce their value. The fourth prong in the model is *the power of the situation* that influences individuals' thoughts, feelings and behaviours. Situations include the process of brutalization (including gradual desensitization or habituation to atrocities), the binding factors of the group (influences of group dynamics that hold one accountable to the group and its activities) and the power differentials between the perpetrators and the victims (Waller 2001, 17-20; Dutton et al 2004, 268). In general, the individuals' degree of exposure to and influence by the psychology, history, evolution, and culture of atrocity influences their inclination towards or revulsion from the violence. The article would show how in Rwanda the psychological processes of brutalization desensitized the

youth recruited into the paramilitary and made them to carry out killings without repulsion.

The factors for mass involvement in genocide can also be evaluated through two other lenses or approaches: the intentionalist and functionalist approaches (Gellately and Kiernan 2003).

Scholars who belong to the intentionalist paradigm posit that political leaders and other top-echelon functionaries design the genocidal project and mobilize resources including human beings to accomplish their plans. Most of the modern genocides including the Holocaust were orchestrated from the top. The supporters of this paradigm think that dictators such as Hitler scapegoated the groups they wanted to exterminate and mobilized the masses to exterminate them. All state-sponsored mass terrorism, slaughter, and dislocation that occurred in the world fall into this paradigm. In the Rwandan case, the Hutu-dominated government intentionally created the climate for genocide and mobilized the material and the spiritual resources necessary to carry it out. Machetes and clubs were imported and distributed to peasants to get them to kill their enemies. The youth were organized into paramilitary groups to become instruments of violence (Staub 2002; Jones 2002). The media became the channel through which the leaders instructed their people to kill the enemy. The media communicated to the masses the extremists' inflammatory rhetoric based in primordial ethnic passions and hatred in order to incite the Hutu to butcher the Tutsi who became scapegoats or dangerous enemies. The extremists underlined that annihilating the Tutsi meant elevating the Hutu.

The functionalist paradigm explains that genocidal ideologies are translated into reality when the perpetrators obey authorities and respond to the genocidal guidelines by engaging themselves in destructive measures. The leaders may instigate the ordinary killers to kill the enemy, but may not have control on the day-to-day practices of killing and that the ordinary people may fulfil their obligation by doing the killings in their own way. However, the architects of the genocide and the perpetrators share *cultural-societal tilt*. They belong to the same culture and live in a similar existential dilemma. In Rwanda, the ordinary perpetrators shared with the leaders 'the inclination for the same potentially destructive modes of fulfilment' (Staub 2002, 21). In this pre-planned and well-resourced genocide, the ordinary people participated in the killing, raping and mutilating body. By so doing, they fulfilled the extremists' genocidal intents. The ordinary Hutu were whipped into the massacre out of sense of imminent destruction which the Tutsi allegedly threatening.

As Fujii clearly puts it, 'By exploiting the situation to its fullest, the *génocidaires* were able to use fear as the mechanism for making genocide appear not only normal and legitimate but indeed imperative given

the circumstances' (2004, 112). It was the genocide that manipulated the public attention and concern by creating a heightened climate of irrational fear by disseminating false propaganda and reports. The main intention was to draw the whole Hutu population into the ethnic extinction of the Tutsi. The eliminationist ideology made Tutsi's annihilation a choiceness choice. The extremists directly told the Hutu 'kill or you will be killed'. Such a terrorization lends a 'script that justified a belief system for engaging in violent behavior found in the defiance stage of the violentization process' (Winton and Unlu 2007, 50). It is clear, however, that there was interaction between the top leadership of the genocide and the genocidal atrocities on the ground. The virulent acts on the ground gave the extremists the practical hope that the masses were in support of their annihilationist agenda. Ordinary people also felt that their government was sponsoring and leading the genocide to rescue them from clandestinely arranged brutality at the hands of the Tutsi. Arguably, it is only when the needs and inclination of the masses have congruence with that of the leaders that a high risk for massive involvement in genocide is created (Straub 2002).

In general, the Rwandan genocide was based in the massive diffusion of desperation, hatred, fear based on polarized ethnic differences. The genocide revealed that in such situations ordinary people are easily manipulated and driven into destructive actions. Paul Lederach reasons out well the reason behind the masses rush into destructive violence and how it is connected to the leaders' systematic manipulation of the perpetrators psychology. According to Lederach, "where there is deep, long-term fear and direct experience of violence that sustain an image of enmity, people are extremely vulnerable and easily manipulated." The reason is that "the fears in subgroup identities are often created, reinforced, and used by leaders to solidify their position and the internal cohesion of the group behind them." Lederach convincingly argues that "deep polarization and sharp divisions are, in fact, functional for increasing cohesion, reducing ambiguity, and decreasing internal criticisms of leaders." As in Rwanda, "a clearly defined and immediately present enemy and the perception that the group's survival is at stake inspire uncritical support of the group's leadership" (1997, 15). In Rwanda, the extremists fanned the flame of ethnic hatred and activated memories of systematic discrimination and subjugation in the past. By so doing, they caused divisive ethnic myths, stereotypes, hatred, and fears which permeated the fabric of society. When the genocide commenced, the crisis mentality had already developed into collective aggression which resonated with ordinary people.

In the genocide, a group's irrational fear of the retaliation of another group, staunch hatred of the allegedly threatening group, and the individuals' desire to quench their deep-set and multi-dimensional-based dispo-

sition towards cruelty combined to effect destruction. This can be explained through violentization theory.

ANALYSIS OF DISCURSIVE PREOCCUPATION IN THE VIOLENTIZATION PROCESSES

The violentization theory discussed above has revealed that the Hutu-dominated government directed the propaganda of hatred against the Tutsi from the top and mobilized strategic resources to demonize them. Among the resources mobilized by the anti-Tutsi campaigners were symbols. The language of hatred used in the government controlled media regenerated a reification of socio-cultural and moral orientations in which ethnic categorization and dehumanization were encouraged. One of the linguistic tools used to propagate genocide was metaphor. Metaphors were used as instruments in discourses of dehumanization to achieve a vast and violent mobilization of the masses in support of the extremists' atrocious agenda.

Let us see what metaphors are and why they are used in communication before we see their application to the discourses of dehumanization in a genocidal setting. Metaphors have been defined in different ways by different scholars. In this paper, Charteris-Black's (2004, 21) definition is used: that a metaphor is 'a linguistic representation that results from the shift in the use of a word or phrase from the context or domain in which it is expected to occur to another context or domain where it is not expected to occur, thereby causing semantic tension'. On their part, Lakoff and Johnson (1980) stressed that the metaphorical use of language involves grasping and experiencing one thing in terms of another thing and that the process involves creating perceptual connections between the well-known thing and the thing to be known. For instance, through metaphorical thinking we come to know an abstract concept or phenomenon in light of a familiar one. According to Lakoff and Johnson (1980), metaphors structure how we understand one conceptual domain of our experience in light of another by projecting our knowledge of the familiar domain onto the unknown or less known domain. In other words, metaphors are tools that enable us to understand and describe what is otherwise difficult to grasp and describe. Cognition of the nature of the familiar domain draws to our mind frame of the new concept or phenomenon. Again, through metaphor we develop a new understanding of the things we already know.

In this article, the key metaphors used in the genocide will be identified. Then their meanings will be analysed by placing them within the ethno-political tension and the dynamics of conflict prior to and during the genocide. The metaphors and their ideological intentions, particularly their function in the process of othering, will be analysed and supported

by post-genocidal texts and by witnesses to the genocide. The role of the metaphors in imposing the ideological and totalitarian view of ethnicity and their role in structuring metanarratives of differences and embodying ideological discourses of hatred will also be assessed. Attempts will be made in particular to indicate the metaphors' role in structuring hegemonic myths of ethnicity and in drawing conditions for reification that legitimize and normalize horrific violence toward others. The interaction between the top-down rhetorical campaign of ethnic elimination, ideological apprehension, intolerance, and detestation and the accomplishment of the genocide on the ground will also be examined. Finally, the genocide will be assessed through the lens of violentization theory.

A critical analysis of the expressions selected by Hutu extremists against the RPF and its supporters reveals that during the genocide, inflammatory rhetoric was used to foment genocidal violence. The extremists used common words such as river, work, machete, trees, roots and bushes for negative metaphoric effects. Below are shown metaphors with their discursive meaning, ideological underpinnings, or the shared social frame of reference intended in using them as well as the genocidal texts and post-genocidal witnesses which reveal the impact of the metaphor-based dehumanization. The genocidal metaphors were of three types: *word-based*, *action-based* and *cosmological metaphors*. Word-based metaphors were use of cockroach and other dehumanizing languages to indignify, denigrate and dehumanize the Tutsi. These are similar to *untermensch* (German for under-human or sub-human) which Hitler and his compatriots used to degrade the Jews and other victims of European racisms during the Second World War. Action-based metaphors were physical atrocities such as brutal sexual abuse. Cosmological metaphors are situations in which the physical surroundings, as structured and organized entity were given symbolic meanings based on the day to day observations of the features of the cosmos.

The cosmos' discursive values had deep cultural roots and drew their meaning from the society's thinking about the metaphysical and structural attributes of the physical surrounding.

WORD-BASED METAPHORS

1. *Inyenzi* (cockroaches): this was the principal word in the Hutu extremists' discourse of dehumanization that equated the Tutsi with the difficult and plaguing insects that raid at night under cover of darkness (Fujii 2004). The ideological goal or shared social frame of reference it was intended to convey was dehumanization of the Tutsi in the eyes of the Hutu and validation of the mass violence to crush them out of hate. The metaphor was used to make easy the Tutsi's elimination. One genocidal text

revealed that ‘the cruelty of the *inyenzi* can be cured only by their total extermination’ (Chrétien et al. 1995 cited in De Forges 2007, 48). On the whole, *inyenzi* represented the infestation metaphor, comfort-wrecking plague and a fatal havoc. However, this metaphor hides one true reality. Given their small number, the Tutsi should not have been caricatured as cockroaches whose infestation covers all places. However, if the word was used to represent the ubiquitousness of the minority group’s power and influence, the metaphor could be closer to reality. *Kangura* set intertextuality between Tutsi as night time raiders and Tutsi as uncontrolled controllers of all opportunities. To awaken the Hutu from their state of unconsciousness and to show how beleaguered they were by the Tutsi, *Kangura* exaggerated that the country had already been taken by the Tutsi. ‘The Tutsi became those ‘who took everything’, ‘who are everywhere’, who control the business sector, who govern despite appearances, who constitute the majority in the school system, both in terms of teachers and students, in the church and within all spheres that symbolize progress’ (Kabanda 2007, 63). The aim of such statements was to fan flames of bitterness and rage. In general, the Hutu government’s hate media transferred cockroach’s physical and biological behaviours onto the Tutsi insurgents. The extremists used the term to dehumanize and demonize the targeted group as night-time invaders, infesters, and lifetime plagues (Fujii 2004; White 2009). The metaphor carried multiple interrelated meanings. One was its use to signify the negative, underhanded, and elusive movement of the group. The second was the triviality and crushability of the group as a troublemaking force. The other inherent meaning of the metaphor was that the Tutsi, like cockroaches, raid surreptitiously. Most importantly was the devaluative impact of the metaphorical meaning of cockroach as a discourse of dehumanization. The cruelty and barbaric nature of the genocidal acts revealed that the ultimately brutal killings of human beings became as simple as crushing a cockroach. It seems that the demonization process gradually made the perpetrators triumph over the psychological and normative inhibitions against the ferocious and wild rush into killing. The portrayal of Hutu women as spies who clandestinely work for the Tutsi and the depiction of RPF as cockroaches have an axis of intertextuality (synchronization) since both construct negative framing of the Tutsi and their movement as deceptive and destructive.

2. *Eaters of our sweat and burden up on our back*: these metaphors with closer meanings were used to depict the Tutsi as burdens

that were unfairly loaded on the Hutu, the producers and feeders of parasites whose heavy dependence has now become insufferable (Taylor, 2002). The metaphors synchronize also with the other metaphors which embody the meaning that the Tutsi are cunning, bloodthirsty, untrustworthy, and natural power-mongers. These metaphors were actively used to oppose RPF's insurgency and to create public apprehension that the enemy came to roll back the gains of the revolution and to re-enslave the Hutu (Higiro 2007).

3. *Hamatic invaders from the north*: the phrase was used to portray the Tutsi as a group that is bent on devastating and subjugating the Hutu. The ideological goal behind use of this phrase was myth-making meant to pit the Hutu against the Tutsi and send their bodies back to Ethiopia through the rivers that flow into Lake Victoria. The hate radio in the country depicted the Tutsi as 'nomads and invaders who came to Rwanda in search of pasture, but because of their cunning and malicious nature, they managed to stay and rule. The Hutu were terrified that if they allow the Tutsi-Hamites to come back, they would see be subjugated by them in Rwanda, and also give the enemy an unfettered sphere of influence in other parts of the Great Lakes Region' (RTLM, 2 December 1993, cited in Mironko 2007, 127). 'Hamites' was used to signify that the Tutsi had no natural kinship with the Hutu majority who are the true descendents of the Bantu. Hamatizing the Tutsi was also a myth-making agenda meant to evoke in the Hutu the sense that the Tutsi should not belong to the region just as a poisonous weed does not deserve to flourish in a soil meant only for millet to prosper. In its February 1992, the *Kangura* publication stated: 'The Tutsi ethnic group is descended from the large family which we call 'Nilotic' or 'Hamite'. It is a family known for their propensity for war to the point that those countries of which they are members find themselves in a state of perpetual conflict. See what has happened in Somalia. You understand therefore what to expect in Rwanda (see Eltringham 2004, 37). The whole process involved blatant ethnic de-legitimization and exclusion.
4. *Umuganda* (communal work): the word represented a social obligation that every member of the society is expected to accomplish and use during the genocide as euphemism for killing the Tutsi. The ideological intention in using the word was to require that every Hutu take part in the ritual work of purifying the land of the enemy. One of the anti-Tutsi journalists broadcasted to his people: 'Mobilize yourself. Work you the youth, everywhere in

the country, come to work with your army. Come to work with your government to defend your country' (*animateur* Georges Ruggiu's message to his RTLM listeners in June 5 1994, cited in Li 2007, 96). According to Taylor (2002), genocide actually became an engaging work for the unemployed and desperate Hutu youth for whom the government paid money because they had taken active role in enacting its genocidal agenda.

5. *Weeds and roots*: the entire Tutsi were depicted as invading weeds that should be removed together with their roots. The extremists' intention in depicting the Tutsi as 'weeds' was exhorting the Hutu to weed them out in order to clean the garden. Some perpetrators gave the testimony of how the media dehumanized the Tutsi as poisonous weeds that should be uprooted: 'The radio told us to clear the bushes. There was no person who did not hear that! RTLM said to 'separate the grass from the millet' [i.e., weed out the Tutsi]. Bikindi told people 'to pull out the poison ivy together with its roots (see Mironko 2007, 133). Similarly, a leaflet distributed in Ruhengeri *préfecture* in early 1991 stated: 'Go do a special *umuganda*. Destroy all the bushes and the *Inkotanyi* who are hiding there. And don't forget that those who are destroying the weeds must also get rid of the roots [women and children]' (see in Eltringham 2004, 191).
6. *Ibyitso* (traitors): the word was used to portray the Tutsi as the invisible enemy who harbours murderous intentions against the Hutu. All of Tutsi were categorized as a dangerous enemy that deceptively stays in the society waiting only for the right time and condition to turn murderous. The ideological intention in utilizing the metaphor was exhorting the Hutu to act before they are acted upon. For example, an article in *Kangura* in December 1990 stated "The enemy is always there, among us, and only waiting for the right moment to try and liquidate us" (Chrétien 1991, cited in Eltringham 2004, 23). In his rhetoric of exclusion and extermination made in November 22, 1992, Leon Mugesera addressed his comrades with the following statements about the Tutsi who he portrayed as traitors. He clearly indicated in his statements that the Hutu should not hesitate in their action and that their action should be the fast and quick annihilation of their enemy. According to him, "they [the Tutsi in the country] have plotted to undermine our armed forces. . . . The law is quite clear on this point: 'Any person who is guilty of acts aiming at sapping the morale of the armed forces will be condemned to death.' What are we waiting for? . . . And what about those accomplices (*ibytso*) here who are sending their children to the RPF? Why

are we waiting to get rid of these families? . . . We have to take responsibility into our own hands and wipe out these hoodlums. . . . The fatal mistake we made in 1959 was to let them [the Tutsis] get out. . . .” (cited in Taylor, 2002, 159). The word *ibyitsa* makes symbolic and ideological synchronization with other words of similar ideological tone such as cunning, malicious, and manipulators used to disparage all persons of Tutsi ethnicity.

ACTION-BASED METAPHORS

The Hutu perpetrators participated in the dehumanization and brutalization process through a physical cruelty that spoke louder than words.

1. *Mutilating and disfiguring of reproductive organs*: the atrocity involved among other things emasculating Tutsi men and slashing off the breast of Tutsi women to disrupt their social reproduction. Reproductive organs were mutilated to show not only hatred, but also dominance. It was a harsh measure that corroborated well with the generic goal of genocide. It was taken as a way of stopping the Tutsi's ontological continuity. Asked what he observed, Roméo Dallaire, the commander of the United Nations peacekeeping force during the Rwanda genocide, had to testify before the ICTR that ‘young girls, young women, would be laid out with their dresses over their heads, the legs spread and bent. You could see what seemed to be semen drying or dried. And it all indicated to me that these women were raped. And then a variety of material were crushed or implanted into their vaginas; their breasts were cut off’ (cited in Nowrojee 2007, 363). Disembowelling pregnant women (Straus 2004) also belongs to the same metaphor of brutality.
2. *Obstructing the natural and normal flow of sexuality*: one of the atrocities committed during the genocide was forcing persons to make sexual intercourse with their own children, the process that obliged blood and semen to flow in-ward and wrongly instead of flowing outward and rightly. In the country's sexuality taboo, doing sex with one's children is an aspect of misdirected and ontologically wrong and self-destructive performance of reproduction. According to Taylor (2002), the victims were forced into a calamitous process of causing their own ‘blood and semen to flow backward upon one another in a closed circuit within the family rather than in an open circuit between families.’ In addition to being brutalized and dehumanized, the bodies of the Tutsi ‘were transformed into icons of asociality, for incest constitutes the preemption of any possible alliance or exchange relation that

might have resulted from the union of one's son or daughter with the son or daughter of another family' (169). Inherently, this form of brutalization and dehumanization is an aspect of making the Tutsi become causes of their own destruction. The gratuitous brutality was harm-doing to the entire group and was deliberately imposed with clear knowledge and understanding of the physical and psycho-social destructions it causes to the victims. It shows also that genocide is more than killing a person or group of persons bodily, but it also involves atrocities committed to cause psycho-social devastation.

3. *Brutalizing rape*: this involved imposition of dehumanizing treatment in the form of forced insemination. The ideological goal of the action was encouraging the Hutu to dominate the Tutsi and break their hegemony by coercing them into anomalous and self-humiliating sexual subjugation and by imposing enforced impregnation. Asked what he observed in female corpses, Major Brent Beardsley who was an assistant to Dallaire gave the following horrifying account: "Yes, two things, really. One, when they killed women it appeared that the blows that had killed them were aimed at sexual organs, either breasts or vagina; they had been deliberately swiped or slashed in those areas. And, secondly, there was a great deal of what we came to believe was rape, where the women's bodies or clothes would be ripped off their bodies, they would be lying back in a back position, their legs spread, especially in the case of very young girls. I'm talking girls as young as six, seven years of age, their vaginas would be split and swollen from obviously multiple gang rape, and then they would have been killed in that position. So they were laying in a position they had been raped; that's the position they were in" (cited in Nowrojee 2007, 364).
4. *Road-blocking*: roadblocks symbolized the Hutu's determination to obstruct those by whom they were obstructed throughout history. Like a peasant who furiously blocks and kills a porcupine that had destroyed his corn farm, the Hutu Interahamwe and other organized youths blocked the Tutsi and slashed them down remorselessly. The genocidal media advised every Hutu to systematically and methodically hunt down the Tutsi (symbolized as obstructers of the Hutu's identity, prosperity and growth). One perpetrator who was interviewed by RTL M at one of the roadblocks explained how he trapped the Tutsi. He indicated, "When testing if people like a radio station, you ask the following question: who are the speakers of that radio whom you know? Who

are the RTL M speakers you know? If you do not know them that means that you do not like this radio” (cited in Li 2007, 99).

COSMOLOGICAL METAPHOR

1. *Rivers*: rivers are signifiers of flow in the Rwandan cosmology and served during the genocide as organs through which one’s hated internal Other was cleaned or eliminated. The use of rivers as metaphor of purification and smooth flow instigated the Hutu to kill the Tutsi and dump them in the rivers. The act was a ritual of purifying ‘the Hutuland’ from the filth with which they were long contaminated. The slain bodies were thrown in the rivers as a message to send the invaders back to their Nilo-hamitic origin. Taylor (2002) stated that “Rwanda’s rivers became part of the genocide by acting as the body politic’s organs of elimination, in a sense of excreting its hated internal other. In his rhetoric of exclusion, expunging and extermination made in November 22, 1992, Leon Mugesera tellingly remarked: ‘They belong in Ethiopia and we are going to find them a shortcut to get there by throwing them into the Nyabarongo River [which flows northward]. I must insist on this point. We have to act. Wipe them all out!’” (cited in Taylor, 2002, 159). It is believed that soldiers in the Rwandan Patriotic Army (RPA) executed the Hutu persons and threw their bodies in Kager River, the same river where the Hutu extremists threw the bodies of Tutsi victims. The Tutsi-killed floating bodies, with hands and feet tied together, were recovered from this river. It is not clear, however, if RPF’s similar acts of throwing the dead bodies of Hutu into rivers bears the same cosmological meaning (Moghalu 2005).
2. *Excrement*: excrement was used to refer to the Tutsi and hence as a dirt that should be removed from the body. The bodies of the Tutsi were thrown in the latrine as excrement.

All of these metaphorical structures emphasized Tutsi’s sub-humanity to simplify and justify their annihilation from the land. The killings were made virtuous and every Hutu was called to participate in the ritual purification of the land by removing the obstructing beings that had long blocked the normal flow of the Hutu’s identity, integrity and growth (Taylor 2002). The plan worked well and was thus visibly evinced in neighbours’ barbarous killings of their own neighbours and in the family members’ turn against one another for bloodshed. The genocide, as some may assume, was not the result of an impulsive outburst of aggression that occurred overnight, but the outcome of a politico-militarily orchestrated ideological campaign designed to engender destructive urge in the Hutu mass so that they would get rid of the Tutsi and moderate Hutu.

The stuff of paranoia and suspicion which the hate media created embedded into the collective consciousness of the majority of the Hutu not only hatred, but also lust and the urge for revenge.

It is implied in the analysis made above that one serious limitation of metaphorical language is its failure to provide a full representation of the reality in the process of transferring thoughts between cognition. Especially when metaphors are used for manipulative purpose or as a propaganda tool, they may hide realities and evoke biases. Oversimplification, overestimations, stereotypical and biased judgements are common in metaphorical systems (Kruglanski et al. 2008). The metaphors usually conceal the other aspects of the domain that are inconsistent with or contradictory to the metaphor. This limitation is ubiquitous in the metaphors that form the basis of genocidal propaganda and wars on terrorism. The Rwandan experience suggests that in divided societies that have history of ethnic and racial hostility, extremists may metaphorically portray the target groups as blood suckers, flesh eaters, filth, and cancerous cell to demonize the group and foment genocidal violence. Such groups unfortunately become scapegoats for predicaments and frustrations experienced both at the political leadership and grassroots levels and are targeted for extermination.

EXPLAINING THE GENOCIDE THROUGH VIOLENTIZATION THEORY

All of the theories used to explain the genocide in Rwanda commonly suggest that genocidal action is a process of becoming and involves the perpetrators in the process of learning by doing and doing in order to learn. Staub (2002) argues that “mass killing or genocide is usually the outcome of an evolution that starts with discrimination and limited acts of harm-doing. Harming people changes the perpetrators (and the whole society) and prepares them for more harmful acts” (22). The Rwanda genocide and the way the masses participated in it can be understood through various psychological theories of crime causation. One of these theories is the violentization theory which explains genocide as an evolutionary and escalating phenomenon. This theory, developed by Lonnie Athens, identified fundamental stages in the socialization of ordinary human beings into heinous violence. It advances the argument that a full-scale genocide is the extraordinarily worst stage of violence preceded by other stages of violence. The stages are brutalization, belligerency, violent performance, and virulency. This section of the article will attempt to show how each of the stages of violentization was passed prior to and during the genocide.

A). *Brutalization*: this is the stage at which a person is acclimatized with brutal acts or measures by undergoing brutal experiences, observing the brutalized experiences of others, and teaching or training others on

how to engage in brutal practices such as torturing and horrifying others. Following the anti-Tutsi campaign that started in response to the RPF's insurgency in 1990, the Hutu had the chance to observe the brutalization of the Tutsi when the latter's massacres were carried out in October 1990, January 1991, February 1991, March 1992, August 1992, January 1993, March 1993 and February 1994. In connection to this, James Waller also adds that the process of brutalization (socialization into brutal acts) "includes a gradual desensitization or habituation to atrocities in which initial, relatively inconsequential, evil actions make later evil-doing easier" (2001, 20). According to Duttan et. al. (2004), in the Rwandan context, "desensitization occurred through brutalizing boys who were to be militia by forcing them to kill their own villagers. This practice desensitized the boy, probably traumatized him, and made him an unattached outcast from his own people" (465).

B). *Belligerency*: this is the stage at which violence becomes a normal and appropriate way of protecting oneself against one's enemy and ensuring one's unthreatened and legitimate existence. In Rwanda, the extremists recalled the populist resistance movement of 1959 and how it enabled the Hutu to gain control over the Tutsi and accordingly reminded people to rise up with similar determination to protect the gains of their revolution. The bloodbath of December 1963 was vaporized as a phenomenal action that broke the backbone of the enemy. It was stressed that such actions are "to protect the Hutu from the permanent threat of feudal bondage" (Kabanda 2007, 68). Prior to and during the genocide, the extremists created a climate for genocide through multiple forms of genocidal priming (Hinton 2002) in order to prepare the Hutu for the mass killing. Phrases that evoke virulency were used in the hate media. Among such expressions was the phrase '*tubatsembasembe*' or "let's exterminate them." Weapons were imported and distributed to people for killing. Violent announcements were made that urged the Hutu to act violently. Killing the Tutsi was called self-defence.

C). *Violent performance*: this stage requires more direct and violent involvement in atrocious killings and brutalization. At this stage, the perpetrators internalize the belief system that violence is right and should be done. Violent behaviours and mad involvement in the genocidal actions are applauded, while failing to overcome psychological inhibitions and revulsions are ridiculed. Those who are expected to be brutal, remorseless, and murderous may be punished and even violently eliminated if they fail to meet the standard of brutality. In Rwanda, both before and during the genocide, innocent Tutsi were horrifically hacked to death with clubs and machetes and their bodies mutilated and thrown in rivers. In addition to gruesome killings, the Rwandan genocide involved sexual violation in the most sadistic and violent manner imaginable. In addition

to rape, the perpetrators 'sodomized women, raping them with sharp objects and held them in sexual slavery for a number of days and weeks. They used raping as a weapon of domination and subjugation. The perpetrators used penis as weapon of destruction in the same way as they used machetes and tire chains and grenade launchers (Rittner 2009).

D). *Virulency*: this is the stage at which the individuals and groups involved in violent crimes fully identify themselves as murderously violent. For them, violence is just a way of life and as simple as day-to-day engagement in normal and productive activities. Violence becomes the legitimate means through which they ensure their existence and their ability to put others under their control. Violence becomes the weapon through which the virulent attackers and groups obtain respect and recognition from others. Resistance to violence or an attempt to reverse it is ridiculed and remorselessly punished. In Rwanda, through its fear-mongering and hate propaganda, the genocidal media imposed sense of a looming attack on the ordinary Hutu and whipped them into a killing frenzy. In the country, journalism became the powerful weapon of genocide and exhorted the listeners to become virulently violent. It warned them that "the person whose neck you do not cut is the one who will cut yours" (Biju-Duval 2007, 350). Throughout the genocide time, the Tutsi suffered massive dehumanization through violent rape, sexual abuse, and mutilation of body parts that have reproductive and discursive power in the cultural cosmology of the group. Virulency is the most atrocious stage of the violentization process. At this stage, crimes are committed without restraint and people are exceedingly subjected to cruel punishments. They are killed recklessly, tortured terrifyingly, raped indiscriminately and mutilated horrendously. In Rwanda, outrageous killings, brutal rapes, sexual mutilation, raping to death, raping followed by killing and insertion of sharp objects into women's sexual organs were rampant examples of high virulency.

In support of these stages of violentization and on the basis of other empirical works, Staub (2002) reminds us that "People learn and change as a result of their own actions. When they harm other people, a number of consequences are likely to follow. First, they come to devalue the victims more. While in the real world devaluation normally precedes harm-doing, additional devaluation makes greater mistreatment and violence possible" (p. 22). Staub makes another important point that violentization is not only a multi-staged process, but also a self-perpetuating, self-modernizing and self-renewing process. According to him: "As a whole society moves along the continuum of destruction, there is a *resocialization* in beliefs, values, and standards of conduct. New institutions emerge that serve repression, discrimination, and the mistreatment of identified victims" (2002, p. 24). In the Rwandan case, the govern-

ment established new media, new styles of communication with the people, and new ideologies to legitimize the annihilation of the vilified group. RTLM, the hate-mongering powerhouse of genocidal incitement, for example, adopted a western radio talk show format and communicated to the people all issues regarding Hutu-Tutsi enmity and conditioned their minds for genocide. The radio broadcasted anti-Hutu songs as entertainment with the aim to indoctrinate the importance of the assault (Fujii 2004).

Instead of always heightening the state of fear and the hugeness of the problem, the Hutu government's hate media sometimes disdained the power of Tutsi and the characteristics of their existence. "The denigration of Tutsi ethnicity was augmented by the visceral scorn coming out of the airwaves the transmitted 'the ridiculing laugh and the nasty sneer. These elements greatly amplified the impact of RTLM broadcasts'" (Kimani 2007, 112). In general, a violentization process is an aspect of socialization through causing perpetrators to learn brutalization. The process includes among other things gradual desensitization or habituation into atrocities. Persistent engagement in the brutalization process desensitizes the actors' normal and healthy feelings towards acting cruelly even though that action initially becomes abhorrent (Waller 2001, 20). This suggests that the process of violentization involves overcoming internal repulsions that hinder the courage to act violently and shamelessly. It is the process of desensitizing the mind to violence. The desensitization process suggests that a disgusting act of injuring a human being gradually changes into an enjoyable practice. In Rwanda, the process caused rational human beings to rush into barbarism in which killing the perceived enemy was interpreted as virtuous and heroic. Commenting on human savagery and brutality embedded in modern culture and civilisation, Henry Giroux (2012) strongly puts that "brutalizing psychology of desensitization, emotional hardness and the freezing of moral responsibility. . .grows out of a formative culture in which war, violence and the dehumanization of others becomes routine, commonplace and removed from any sense of ethical accountability."

In general, the Rwanda genocide shows that the connection between discourses of dehumanization and practical imposition of atrocious brutality was not linear. Rather, the two interacted well since the dehumanization paved the way for physical cruelty. The extremists used the term cockroach so that the Hutu would buy into the image of the Tutsi as despicable and worthy of extinction. This shows how linguistic symbols were selected to dehumanize ethnic groups and validate their annihilation. However, physical mistreatments and violence on its part aggravated devaluation by providing evidence of the crushability, reducibility and eradicability of the enemy. This interactive relation is true to all sys-

tems of suppression and the discursive system upon which they are founded.

CONCLUDING REMARKS

The article does not fully answer, but gives reasonable insights into the question of why an ethnic group sets out to eradicate another group from the face of the earth and insight into the interwoven processes involved in the annihilation of a group. One important issue implied in this article is the reproduction of colonial ideology in the Hutu-Tutsi rivalry and the impact of the hamitic myth in this type of rivalry, particularly its role in shaping inter-ethnic 'othering' and marginalization. According to Taylor (2001) the colonial system that shaped the rivalry also "essentializes ethnic difference, justifies political domination by a single group, and nurtures a profound thirst for redress and vengeance on the part of the defavourized group" (2001, 57). The Hutu extremists justified the genocide as a battle between the forces of good and evil. This is the way eliminationists throughout the history of genocide have orchestrated and carried out a group's destruction.

This article has suggested that deployment of discourses of dehumanization plays key role in genocidal violence. This is clear mainly in the symbolized fantasies of violence such as the denigration of the Tutsi as 'cockroaches' with the aim to prime the listeners to crush them. The article has tried to point out the various ways in which discourses of dehumanization shaped the colonial and genocidal history of Rwanda. It has also implied the stages and processes through which the genocidal processes passed. It has also indicated the role linguistic and ethno-cultural symbols played in fuelling ethnic hatred and in enticing the innocent people into active involvement in mass killings. This article has divided discourses of dehumanization into two categories. One obvious form of discursive dehumanization is verbal violence and diminution against an ethnic group. This involves naming and framing an ethnic group through dismissive language such as equating an ethnic group with a hated animal. The metaphorical use of cockroaches to represent the Tutsi is suggestive of the Hutu's supremacist caricature of the Tutsi.

The other discursive mechanism is the direct or practical assault on the basis of ethnic prejudice. In the colonial period, the Belgian colonists imposed discursive dehumanization on the Hutu through their brutal racism that denigrated the Hutu as a sub-human that should be ruled by an allegedly better informed and naturally equipped Tutsi. This caused the Hutu not only to suffer colonially founded and racially guided subjugation, but also to harbour deep bitterness which later came to be melted into vengeful genocide. Even before the 1994 genocide, the Hutu subjected the Tutsi to ranges of assaults.

The implication of this article for other African states where there is ethnic competition for political and economic positions is that ethnic differences should be resolved peacefully and dialogically instead of falling to calamities that come as a result of polarized differences. The Rwandan experience is a powerful lesson that irremovably polarized ethno-political positions lead to ethnic hostility and exclusion. The genocide could have been prevented had the concerned national and international bodies intervened in the scorching processes of genocidal priming and stimulation. The genocide had profound discursive foundations that finally led to mass slaughter. This article has attempted to stress that genocide is a destructive process that “emerges from a variety of factors, or ‘primes,’ and that always involves impetus and organization from above, what I call ‘genocidal activation’” (Hinton 2002, 36). The article has underlined that among other things the Hutu extremists led the process of ‘othering’ the Tutsi through rationalizing their eviction and by using dehumanizing rhetoric to demonize them as a threatening and hazardous group.

There is no guarantee that genocide will never come back to Africa if the continent does not develop a constructive process of preventing, managing, and resolving conflicts. One of the things that should be reversed in Africa is the extremist leadership that frames itself on the false propaganda of blocking challenges posed against its rule in the name of protecting its people from snatchers. Instead, a political opportunity must be created for representatives of ethnic groups to discuss issues of common concern to shake together the historical, psychological, and geopolitical causes of their differences. Protecting the fate of one’s ethnic group through darkening the fate of other ethnic group cannot be a healthy and civilized choice for political action. However, such a trend seems to persist in Africa unless we go for a political transformation in which leaders assume high responsibility to protect the entire people they govern irrespective of ethnicity, religion, and socio-economic background. The African people’s ethnic and political consciousness should also be developed through education. Education fosters a people’s rational understanding about the politics of ethnicity and protects them from blindly subscribing to the egoistic interests of their own undemocratic leaders who, like the Hutu-dominated leaders, socialize public compliance for a destructive goal.

REFERENCES

- Afflitto, F.M. (2000). Victimization, survival and the impunity of forced exile: a case study from the Rwandan genocide. *Crime, Law & Social Change* 34, 77-97.

- Akhavan, P. (2001). Beyond impunity: can international criminal justice prevent future atrocities? *The American Journal of International Law* 95, 7-31.
- Bhavnani, R. (2006). Ethnic norms and interethnic violence: accounting for mass participation in the Rwandan genocide. *Journal of Peace Research* 43, 651-669.
- Biju-Duval, J. (2007). Hate media- crimes against humanity and genocide: opportunities missed by international criminal tribunal for Rwanda. In *The media and the Rwanda genocide*, edited by Allan Thomson, 343-361. London: Pluto Press.
- Campbell, B. (2010). Contradictory behaviour during genocides. *Sociological Forum* 25: 296-314.
- Charteris-Black, J. (2004). *Corpus approaches to critical metaphor analysis*. Basingstoke: Palgrave Macmillan.
- Des Forges, A. (2007). Call to genocide: radio in Rwanda, 1994. In *The media and the Rwanda genocide*, edited by Allan. Thomson, 41-54. London: Pluto Press.
- Lakoff, G & Johnson, M. (1980). *Metaphors we live by*, Chicago: University of Chicago Press.
- Dutton, D.G. Boyanowsky, E.O. & Bond, MH . (2005). Extreme mass homicide: from military massacre to genocide. *Aggression and Violent Behaviour* 10, 435-473.
- Eltringham, N. (2004). *Accounting for horror: post-genocide debates in Rwanda*. London: Pluto Press.
- Fujii, L.A .(2004). Transforming the moral landscape: the diffusion of a genocidal norm in Rwanda. *Journal of Genocide Research* 6, 99-114.
- Gellately, R & Kiernan, B. (2003). The study of mass murder and genocide. In *The spectre of genocide: mass murder in historical perspective*, edited by Robert Gellately and Ben Kiernan, 3-27. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Glick, P. (2002). Sacrificial lambs dressed in wolves' clothing: envious prejudice, ideology, and the scapegoating of Jews. In *Understanding genocide: the social psychology of Holocaust*, edited by Leonard S. Newman and Ralph Erber, 113-142. Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- Giroux, H. (2012). Violence, USA: The warfare state and the brutalizing of everyday life. Truthout. Accessed June 3, 2012 at <http://truthout.org/opinion/item/8859-violence-usa-the-warfare-state-and-the-brutalizing-of-everyday-life>.

- Hackett, R.J. (2003). Discourses of dehumanization in Africa and beyond. *Diogenes* 50, 61-75.
- Hagan, J & Rymond-Richmond, W. 2008. The collective dynamics of racial dehumanization and genocidal victimization in Darfur. *American Sociological Review* 73, 875-902.
- Higiro, J.V. (2007). Rwandan private print media on the eve of the genocide. In *The media and the Rwanda genocide*, edited by Allan Thomson, 73-89. London: Pluto Press.
- Hinton, A.L. (2002). The dark side of modernity: Toward anthropology of genocide. In *Annihilating difference: the anthropology of genocide*, edited by Alexander L. Hinton, 1-40. Berkley: University of California Press.
- Jones, A. (2002). Gender and genocide in Rwanda. *Journal of Genocide Research* 4, 65-94.
- Kabanda, M. (2007). Kangura: The triumph of propaganda refined. In *The media and the Rwanda genocide*, edited by Allan Thomson, 62-72. London: Pluto Press.
- Kamola, I.A. (2007). The global coffee economy and the production of genocide in Rwanda. *Third World Quarterly* 28, 571-592.
- Kaufman, S.I. (2006). Symbolic politics or rational choice/ testing theories of extreme ethnic violence. *International Security* 30, 45-86.
- Kimani, M. (2007). RTLM: the medium that became a tool for mass murder. In *The media and the Rwanda genocide*, edited by Allan Thomson, 110-124. London: Pluto Press.
- Kruglanski, A.W., Crenshaw, M, Post, JM & Victoroff, J. (2008). What should this fight be called? Metaphors of counterterrorism and their implications. *Psychological Science in the Public Interest* 8, 97-133.
- Lederach, P. (1997). *Building peace: sustainable reconciliation in divided societies*. Washington, D.C. United states Institute of Peace Press.
- Li, D. (2007). RTLM: the medium that became a tool for mass murder. In *The media and the Rwanda genocide*, edited by Allan Thomson, 90-109. London: Pluto Press.
- Linke, U. (2002). Archives of violence: The holocaust and the German politics of memory. In *Annihilating difference: the anthropology of genocide*, edited by Alexander L. Hinton, 229-271. Berkley: University of California Press.

- Mironko, C. (2007). The effect of RTLM's rhetoric of ethnic hatred in rural Rwanda. In *The media and the Rwanda genocide*, edited by Allan Thomson, 110-124. London: Pluto Press.
- Moghalu, K.C. (2005). *Rwanda's genocide: the politics of global justice*. New York: Palgrave.
- Nowrojee, B. (2007). A lost opportunity for justice: why did the ICTR not prosecute gender propaganda. In *The media and the Rwanda genocide*, edited by Allan Thomson, 362-372. London: Pluto Press.
- Reyntjens, F. (1987). Chiefs and burgomasters in Rwanda: the unfinished quest for a bureaucracy. *Journal of Legal Pluralism* 25, 71-97.
- Rittner, C. (2009). Rape, religion, and genocide: an unholy silence. In *Confronting genocide: Judaism, Christianity, Islam*, edited by Steven L. Jacobs, 291-306. Lanham: Lexington Books.
- Schimmel, N. (2011). An invisible genocide: how the western media failed to report the 1994 rwandan genocide of the Tutsi and why. *The International Journal of Human Rights*, 15, 1125-1135.
- Stanton, G.H. (2004). Could the Rwandan genocide have been prevented? *Journal of Genocide Research* 6, 211-228.
- Staub, E. (2002). The psychology of bystanders, perpetrators and heroic helpers. *Understanding genocide: the social psychology of the Holocaust*, edited by L. S. Newman & R. Erber, 11-42. Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- Staub, E., Pearlman, L.A., Gubin, A., Hagengimana, A. (2005). Healing, reconciliation, forgiving and the prevention of violence after genocide or mass killings: an intervention and its experimental evaluation in Rwanda. *Journal of Social and Clinical Psychology* 24, 297-334.
- Straus, S. (2004). How many perpetrators were there in the Rwandan genocide? An estimate. *Journal of Genocide Research* 6, 85-98.
- Taylor, C.C. (2001). *Sacrifice as terror: The Rwandan genocide of 1994*. Oxford: Berg Publishers.
- Taylor, C.C. (2002). The cultural face of terror in the Rwandan genocide. In A.L. Hinton (Ed.). *Annihilating difference: the anthropology of genocide* (p. 137-178). Berkley: University of California Press.
- Waller, J. (2001). Perpetrators of genocide: an explanatory model of extraordinary human evil. *Journal of Hate Studies* 1, 5-22.
- White, K.R. (2009). Scourge of racism: genocide in Rwanda. *Journal of Black Studies* 39, 471-481.

- Winton, M.A. (2008). Dimensions of genocide: the circumflex model meets violentization theory. *The Qualitative Report* 13, 605-629.
- Winton, M.A. (2011). Violentization theory and genocide. *Homicide Studies* 15, 363-381.
- Winton, M.A., & Unlu, A. (2007). Micro-macro dimensions of the Bosnian genocides: the circumplex model and violentization theory. *Aggression and Violent Behavior*, 13, 45-59.
- Woolf, L. M. & Hulsizer, M. R. (2005). Psychosocial roots of genocide: risk, prevention, and intervention. *Journal of Genocide Research* 7, 101-128.

EXPLORING THE DYNAMICS OF IDENTITY BASED CONFLICT AND THE POSSIBILITY FOR ITS SUSTAINABLE MANAGEMENT: A STUDY OF THE PERSISTENT ETHNO-RELIGIOUS CONFLICT IN WUKARI AREA OF TARABA STATE, NIGERIA

Jude A. Momodu, G.I. Matudi, and Abiodun L. Momodu
Federal University of Technology
(now Modibbo Adama University of Technology)
Yola- Adamawa State, Nigeria

INTRODUCTION

Nigeria is a multi-cultural society with over 250 ethnic groups as well as three major religious groups namely Christianity, Islam and African Traditional Religion (ATR). With an estimated population of about 200 million people, “the Hausa-Fulani, the Yoruba and the Igbo account for almost half of Nigeria’s population, and many smaller groups tend to cluster around these three, creating a tri-polar ethnic structure around which competition strategies intensify” (CRISE Working Paper 44, March 2007). The Human Rights Watch report also observes that, “the country is divided along religious lines, with the boundaries between Muslim and Christian often overlapping with some of the most important ethnic and cultural divides” (Human Rights Watch, 2006).

The cultural diversity of the Nigerian state naturally creates a platform for competitive struggles between and among the existing interest groups. For instance, since the return to democratic governance on May 29, 1999, the country has witnessed very violent and turbulent ethnic and religiously induced conflicts, some of which have seriously shaken its political, economic and social foundations to the extent that the country’s ‘hard earned’ Fourth Republic has been on the brink of collapse. This ominous trajectory currently facing the Nigerian state has made Professor Isaac Olawale Albert argue that:

Since Nigeria transited from military dictatorship to multi-party democracy on 29 May, 1999. The country has been bedeviled by various forms of violent social conflicts. Thousands of people lost their lives, were maimed or displaced from their communities as a result of these problems. While some of the conflicts had their

roots in the past historical circumstances of the concerned communities, some others were “manufactured” by the elites, seeking to stretch the liberty inherent in the new democratic process in Nigeria to a breaking, if not absurd point (Albert, 2001).

The reality of this situation is that the Nigerian elites often find it very convenient to employ ethnicity and religion as tools in order to manipulate Nigerians in their power play game, owing to the hypnotic and manipulative power of ethnicity and religion on Nigerians. As Momodu rightly observes:

Religious and ethnic manipulations hold sway between and among ethnic groups with large number of illiterate populations and high incidence of poverty. This situation makes it possible for ethnic or religious entrepreneurs to assume the role of ‘*messiahs*’ or ‘*freedom fighters*’ for their ethnic or religious groups. In actual fact, the goals and interests that they seek to achieve are disguised as those of their ethnic or religious groups, which they claim to represent. Whenever these goals and interests appear to be threatened, they fan the embers of ethnic or religious hatred and conflict between their own ethnic or religious groups against the ethnic or religious group they perceive to be threatening their goals, using them as ‘*ethnic or religious sacrificial lambs*’ for the sole purpose of achieving their own selfish ends (Momodu, 2014-emphasis added).

Ethnicity and religion play a very important role both in the private and public lives of Nigerians and this is affirmed by an authoritative survey carried out in 2000 on *Attitudes to Democracy and Markets in Nigeria*, which notes that ethnicity “is demonstrably the most conspicuous group identity in Nigeria” (Lewis and Bratton 2000). Thus, the survey found out that almost one-half (48.2%) of Nigerians chose to label themselves with an ethnic (including linguistic and local-regional) identity, compared to almost one-third (28.4%) who opted for class identities, and 21.0 percent who chose a religious identity (Lewis and Bratton 2000). The study specifically indicated that “Nigerians tend to cluster more readily around the cultural solidarities of kin than the class solidarities of the workplace” (Lewis and Bratton 2000).

The findings of the above scholars point to the fact that most Nigerians, about two-thirds of the country’s population, show more loyalty to their ethnic and religious constituencies. This places both ethnicity and religion in a serious competition for the soul of the Nigerian state, just as

God and the devil are competing for the soul of humanity. This dangerous competition has often bred violent ethno-religious conflicts in the country. Salawu (2010) observed that “about 40% of ethno- religious conflicts are credited to the fourth Republic of Nigeria, while observers have equally described the situation as a permanent feature of the Nigeria state,” ethno-religious conflicts tend to always stretch the bounds of unity to a potential snapping point (Jega, 2002).

Inter-group relations in Nigeria are largely determined by ethnic, religious, economic and cultural factors thus creating fault-lines in most Nigerian communities. In particular, inter-group relations between and among ethnic and religious groups in Nigeria are characterized frequently by mutual suspicion and hatred to the extent that at the slightest provocation conflict is inevitable between communities; in most cases assuming very violent dimensions. This is the reason for instance why Okwueze (1995) rightly observed that, “Nigeria is one of the countries where religion and ethnic conflicts have wrecked much havoc on the advancement, unity and prosperity of her citizens and the development of the nation as a whole.”

Nigeria is also one of the African countries most severely affected by violence. It is ranked 148 out of 162 countries worldwide in the Global Peace Index (Vision for Humanity, Global Peace Index, 2013). It has the third largest number of political violence events in Armed Conflict Location & Event Dataset (ACLED), and it is ranked 16th in the Fund for Peace Failed States Index 2013 (Fund for Peace, 2013). A 2012 survey of Nigerians on crime and victimization by the CLEEN Foundation found that, on average, 5% of respondents had personally been victims of armed violence (CLEEN Foundation, 2012).

There are many ethno-religious conflicts that have occurred in Nigeria. For instance, Mohammed (2005) contends that before the present democratic dispensation in Nigeria, there were ethno-religious conflicts that claimed so many lives and property. Some examples of such crises include: the Maitatsine religious disturbances that ravaged parts of Kano, Bauchi, and Maiduguri in the early 1980s, which also spilled over to Jimeta-Yola 1984; the Zango Kataf crises in Kaduna State 1992; and the Kafanchan College of Education Muslim-Christian riots and Kaduna Polytechnic Muslim-Christian skirmishes 1981 and 1982. There are also other incidents of ethno-religious conflicts including: the Bulum kutu Christian-Muslim riots 1982; Usman Danfodio University Sokoto 1982; and the Muslim-Christian clash during a Christian procession at Easter in Ilorin, Kwara State 1986. Other examples are the ethno -religious conflict of July 18, 1999 between the Oodua people congress and Hausa traders at Shagamu in Ogun State; the February ethno-religious crisis between Zagon and Kataf communities in Kaduna State between 1999-

2001; and the protracted ethno-religious conflict in Jos, plateau State in 2001, 2002, 2008, 2010 and 2011. And of course, the protracted ethno-religious conflicts in Wukari Local Government Area of Taraba State which started from 2000 to date, which is the central focus of this paper. The following thematic areas form the basis for discussion in this paper:

- Literature review, conceptual clarifications and theoretical framework,
- Origin and causes of ethno-religious conflicts in Wukari Local Government Area of Taraba State,
- Costs of ethno-religious conflicts on inter-group relations in Wukari Local Government Area of Taraba State,
- Suggested solutions to the management of ethno-religious conflicts on inter-group relations in Wukari Local Government Area of Taraba State, and
- Conclusion.

LITERATURE REVIEW, CONCEPTUAL CLARIFICATIONS AND THEORETICAL FRAMEWORK

CONCEPTUAL CLARIFICATIONS

RELIGION

Religion, according to Adeniyi (1993), refers to a body of truths, laws and rites by which man is subordinated to the transcendent being. This implies that religion deals with norms and rules that emanated from God and which must be followed by the believers. Ejizu (1993) provides another definition of religion. According to him, religion is man's intuition of the sacred and ultimate reality and his expression of that awareness in concrete life. In essence, religion can be defined as the belief system held by a group of people towards a supreme being which they revere and believe can guarantee their security and welfare and their existence here on earth and in the hereafter.

ETHNIC GROUP

The term "ethnic" is derived from a Greek adjective *ethnikos*, meaning "national, foreign, gentile." The adjective is derived from the noun *ethnos*, "people, nation, foreign people," that in the plural phrase *ta ethn* meaning "foreign nations" (*The American Heritage Dictionary of the English Language, Fourth Edition, 2000*). However, the task of defining ethnic group is somewhat difficult. Hence, many scholars believe that definitions of what constitutes an ethnic group or an ethnic minority are subject to much discussion (see Coleman and Salt, 1996; Bulmer, 1996; Ballard, 1996; Solomos and Black, 1996).

The variations in the definitions of ethnic group and the lack of agreement among scholars on what should constitute the meaning of an ethnic group is responsible for the multiplicity of definitions on the concept by various scholars in ethnic studies, ethnic conflict, sociology, political science and related disciplines. However, the common denominators in the many descriptions that have been given to ethnic group are: people residing within the same geographical territory, people who share the same historical memories, common origins, common identity, language, culture, and aspirations. What really is an ethnic group? Modood; Berthoud; Lakey; Nazroo; Smith; Virdee and Beishon (1997) define an ethnic group as a community whose heritage offers important characteristics in common between its members and which makes them distinct from other communities. There is a boundary, which separates 'us' from 'them', and the distinction would probably be recognized on both sides of that boundary. Quaker-Dokubo (2001) also perceives ethnic group as pertaining to organized activities by persons linked by a consciousness of a special identity, who jointly seek to maximize their corporate political, economic and social interest. Willigenburg (1995) refers to ethnic group as "cultural nations which are bound together in the first place by a common culture and which lack the internationally recognised organization of a sovereign state".

ETHNO-RELIGIOUS CONFLICT

Ethno-religious conflict refers to a situation in which members of an ethnic group practicing the same religion engage in mutually opposing coercive interactions with members of another ethnic group practicing the same but different religion from the former group. Ethno-religious conflict is often characterised by a mixture of both ethnic and religious agitations. It is also a situation in which at least the interests or goals of members of an ethnic group who belong to the same religious group are in opposition to the interests or goals of another ethnic group practicing the same religion but different from the former group is exclusively defined in ethnic and religious terms. Ethnicity and religion are tools for identity construction by the elites who draw on the mesmerizing and manipulative tendencies of both ethnicity and religion in competitive situations. The combination of ethnicity and religion for identity construction produces a strong platform for identity mobilization.

THEORETICAL FRAMEWORK

TERRITORIAL IMPERATIVE THEORY

The study also adopted the theory of Territorial Imperative developed by Robert Ardrey in 1967, in which he traced the animal origin of

property, nations and territoriality. A territory is defined as an area of space which an animal or group of animals defend as an exclusive preserve. It is within such territory that the basic needs and interests of such animals are gratified. These needs include: security of space and food, identity, prestige, etc. They therefore defend such an area at all costs and strive to keep it out those who undermine their interests and needs. Following the above postulation, all animals, including man, have the natural tendency or instinct to be territorial and possessive, especially when their territories and possessions are threatened. In order to ward-off this threat, they will employ any means available to them to defend their territories and possessions. This is the reason why Ardrey (1967) opined that “if we defend the title to our land or the sovereignty of our country, we do it for reasons no different, no less innate, no less ineradicable, than do lower animals.”

In the same manner, Sherif and Sherif (1969) support this view by arguing that territorial aggression in animals is based on the relatively simple chemical, tactile and visual discriminations involved in detecting unfamiliar ‘opponents’ while for humans the concept of ‘territory’ depends on complex cultural symbolizations of property or ‘homeland’. People, they pointed out, are quite capable of territorial loyalty without actually living in the territory itself. Therefore, conflict may ensue in an attempt by individuals, groups, or countries to defend their territories, land, traditions, culture, and property they so value. For instance, *Tor-Tiv*, the paramount ruler of the Tiv people observes that “in many traditions, land matters are closely tied to the custom of the people; hence it could be very volatile” (Torkula, 2002).

This, in part, explains the reasons why ethnic groups fight over land and territory. Indeed, scholars have argued that territorially concentrated groups in divided societies are more likely to demand self-determination (Saideman and Ayres, 2000 and Toft 2003; Toft and Saideman 2010) and to be engaged in violent conflict in its pursuit (Fearon and Laitin 1999; Weidmann, Rod, Cederman 2010). This also explains the situation of the protracted ethno-religious conflicts in Wukari between the Jukun Christians allied with the Jukun traditionalists versus the Jukun Muslims supported by Hausa Muslims. The latter feels threatened by the resolve of the former to chase them out of their ancestral land and also deprive them of participating in both the political affairs of Wukari Local Government and in the Traditional Council of Wukari. As a result, the two groups have been engulfed in a fierce battle for the contest over who owns Wukari land and who is qualified to enjoy the rights and benefits of being indigenes of Wukari Local Government Area of Taraba State. The conflict between the two groups in Wukari, Taraba State is a classic example of a struggle over territory and ethnic dominance.

ORIGIN AND CAUSES OF VIOLENT ETHNO-RELIGIOUS CONFLICTS IN
WUKARI LOCAL GOVERNMENT AREA OF
TARABA STATE, NIGERIA

Inter-group relations among communities in Nigeria is rooted in the colonial history of the Nigerian state. However, inter-group relations in Nigeria predate the pre-colonial era and as a matter of fact, inter-group relations among Nigeria's pre-colonial societies could be said to be both harmonious and conflictive and span diverse areas such as: cultural exchanges, commerce, politics, and social spheres. But one fascinating aspect of inter-group relations in the Nigerian pre-colonial societies was that ethnic migrants were in many places integrated and assimilated into their host communities, even inter-marrying. Buttressing this argument, Olaniyi (2001) cites the case of Yoruba Ayagi quarters in Kano who after a century of settlement had been assimilated into Hausa culture. Usman (1981) describes a similar assimilation process in respect to diverse groups that migrated into Katsina and became "absorbed into the households patronages through marriages and cohabitation."

The colonial political economy further increased the migration of Hausa people into Yoruba land. This was due to the emergence of the colonial capitalist economy which introduced taxes and opened up roads and railways linking all the major cities of Nigeria. Hopkins (1973) believes that such factors encouraged and facilitated the increase in migration of Nigerians generally. Furthermore, Swindell (1984) observes that "as the twentieth century developed, labour migration clearly took on new dimension and, from what can be inferred, there was a rapid increase in the volume of migration to meet new levels of taxation and demands for labour in the towns and commercial crop zones." Consequently, this trend has heightened competition for the available scarce resources between hosts and settlers across major towns in Nigeria until today. This is also the case with Wukari Local Government Area of Taraba State, which is an amalgam of different ethnic and religious populations and has consequently witnessed many violent ethnic and religiously induced conflicts.

Recently, Wukari has been experiencing a protracted ethno-religious conflict and the main cause of the conflict has been the struggle for the control of Wukari land and, by extension, competition for the economic and political resources in the area between the Jukun Christians allied with the Jukun traditionalists and the Jukun Muslims supported by Hausa Muslims in the area. Both parties hold tenaciously to their disparate narratives which they often express. On one hand, the Jukun Christians in alliance with the Jukun traditionalists accuse the Jukun Muslims supported by Hausa Muslims of wanting to deliberately and systematically violate the Jukun traditional culture by planning to politically con-

trol Wukari. The Jukun Christians, who consider themselves not only the owners of Wukari land but also the custodians of the Jukun traditional culture, are prepared to spill their last blood to defend it from the encroachment of the Muslim Jukun supported by the Hausa Muslim settlers on Wukari land.

On the other hand, the Jukun Muslims supported by Hausa Muslims accuse the Jukun Christians and the Jukun traditionalists of excluding them from the political control of Wukari Local Government Area as well as from the traditional Council. These are the real issues in the conflict and these issues have encouraged the politicization of both ethnic and religious identities in Wukari area. This is so because scholars have argued that ethnic and religious conflicts are rooted in the politicization of ethnic and religious identities and the competition and conflict for political power by the ethnic and religious communities respectively (Anarfi, 2004; Conversi, 1999). More specifically, Takaya (1992:112) identified centrifugal factors that gave rise to the politicization of ethnic and religious identities in Nigeria, which include:

- (i) the existence of two or more ethnic and religious groups with numerical strengths that can significantly affect the outcome and direction of a democratic political process;
- (ii) the instrumentalization of ethnicity and religion as a legitimizing tool of hegemony in instances when the interests of the political class are under threat;
- (iii) when there is an ascendant radical thinking within a politically significant ethnic or religious group capable of upstaging hegemony;
- (iv) when the society is characterized by political, social or economic hardships that can cause alliances along ethnic and religious fault-lines.

The persistent conflicts between Jukun Christians/Jukun traditionalists versus the Jukun Muslims supported by Hausa Muslims have led to loss of many lives and the destruction of much property and have distorted inter-group relations in the Wukari community. The mixture of ethnicity and religion have taken the situation between the warring groups to unimaginable and deadly heights such that brothers and sisters who have the same ancestral linkage and have co-existed in harmony for centuries have suddenly turned on one another with murderous fervor, a situation re-enforced by bitter and dangerous politics.

The vulnerability of the Wukari community to violent conflicts can be attributed mainly to factors such as: the contest for indigeneship of Wukari LGA; competition for political, social and economic space; the problem of youth unemployment; and arms proliferation in the area. It is in the light of these factors that Mitchell (2000) asserts that conflicts

involving settlers and natives usually revolve around the question of land, and in most cases around the quest by settlers to dispossess the natives of their land through what he called migratory overcrowding. Mitchell's assertion can be said to be true about the Wukari community which is an area that is agriculturally rich and has often resulted in violent competition for resources between the Jukun, who consider themselves as the natives of Wukari, against the other ethnic groups such as Tiv, Fulanis and Hausa communities in Wukari.

The Jukun Christians/Jukun traditionalists believe that the Hausa/Fulani settlers are collaborating with the Jukun Muslims and that their hidden agenda is to Islamize and take over Jukun land. This suspicion of the Jukun Christians and Jukun traditionalists is also the same one that is held by most host communities where the Hausa/Fulani groups are settled. This accounts for why the Hausa/Fulani settlers are much resented, which along with their domineering tendencies, makes the host communities discriminate against them. Best (2006) has rightly observed that "the struggle of ethnic minorities, framed by their experience of domination, tends to be targeted primarily against the Hausa/Fulani, and indirectly against the Nigerian State". The mobilization of religious and ethnic sentiments and solidarity towards gaining control over Wukari land has been fueling violent conflicts between the Jukun Christians in alliance with the Jukun traditionalists against the Jukun Muslims also in alliance with the Hausa settlers in Wukari.

Another major cause of the violent ethno-religious conflicts in Wukari is the availability of small and big arms in the area. For instance, Wukari has witnessed so many violent conflicts such as the protracted violent conflicts between the Jukun and Tiv which, according to Momodu (2014), is:

One of the most violent and recurring ethnic conflicts that have occurred in Nigeria and the periodic clashes between the two groups span from the 1860s to 1899, 1904, 1950s, 1964, 1976, 1987; and from 1990-1993 and 2001-2002, it climaxed into violent warfare. The human, economic, political, social and psychological costs associated with these perennial conflicts are colossal and some of these costs are still very visible in Wukari (Momodu, 2014).

Wukari has also witnessed pockets of skirmishes between the Tiv and Fulani, Jukun and Fulani as well the current persistent ethno-religious conflicts in the area. These several crises have deeply entrenched the culture of violence in inter-group relations in the area. Momodu (2014) established that, "the free usage of arms especially by the Tiv and Jukun militias to kill and maim indicates the magnitude of proliferation of arms

in Wukari and its environs and it also suggests the vulnerability of Wukari to violent conflicts.” This situation therefore underscores the “privatisation of violence that challenges the monopoly of violence as a defining feature of the state” (Debiel, 2002). The proliferation of arms in Wukari has made the area unstable and unsecured.

Clearly, the Wukari community is Balkanized along ethnic and religious fault lines thus resulting in a situation where the Jukun Christians lack confidence or trust in their fellow Jukun Muslims or Hausa/Fulani settlers in Wukari community. As a result, there currently exists a psychological and physical fault line between the Jukun Christians and Jukun Traditionalists on one hand and on the other hand the Jukun Muslims and Hausa/Fulani. This situation has often given the impetus for violent conflicts. This tendency if not checked will continue to create instability in the area, which is the way in which it is currently playing out.

IMPACT OF ETHNO-RELIGIOUS CONFLICTS ON INTER-GROUP RELATIONS IN WUKARI LOCAL GOVERNMENT OF TARABA STATE

The following table is the time line of violent conflicts in Wukari Local Government Area of Taraba State, Nigeria between 2000 up till date.

TIME LINE OF VIOLENT ETHNO-RELIGIOUS CONFLICTS IN WUKARI L.G.A. FROM 2000 – 2014

S/no:	Triggers	Period	Casualties
1.	The destruction of a mosque under construction at the premises of FRSC Office Wukari by Jukun youths led to a violent conflict between the Christians and Muslims	Early 2000	18 people were killed while several properties were destroyed
2.	An argument between a royal prince and some Muslim youths over right of way led to a violent conflict between Jukun Christians and Hausa/ Jukun Muslims	October 17, 2005	7 people were killed while several properties were destroyed
3.	The demolition of a mosque built at the Area Command Headquarters of the Nigeria Police by Jukun Christian Youths led to violent conflict between Christian Jukun and Hausa / Jukun Muslims	July 13, 2010	10 people were killed while several others were injured and several properties destroyed. Over 2000 people were displaced.

4.	The accidental shooting of a Jukun youth during an argument over the use of a football field by two opposing teams triggers a violent ethno-religious conflict	February 23, 2013	340 people were killed, several properties destroyed while several people were displaced.
5.	A misunderstanding between Christians and Muslims during the burial procession of one of the Jukun Traditional Rulers led to a violent conflict	May 3, 2013	Over 500 people were killed while several people were injured. More than 100 buildings were destroyed and over 3,000 people displaced.
6.	Armed Fulani herdsmen attacked Ando-Manu village in Wukari LGA	April 3, 2014	The Village Head was killed and several people were injured, while several villagers in the area were displaced to Wukari town.
7.	Armed Jukun Youths attacked Jibu town for allegedly harboring and accommodating Fulani herdsmen that attacked Ando Manu village	April 7, 2014	73 people were killed while several others were injured
8.	A reprisal attack by Fulani herdsmen from Jibu town against Jukuns in Nwokyo village for attacking Fulani herdsmen in Jibu	April 14, 2014	3 people were killed in Nwokyo village and more than 15 houses were destroyed with several people displaced
9.	The attack on Nwokyo village by Fulani herdsmen led to a violent ethno-religious crisis between Jukun Christians and Hausa/Jukun Muslims	April 15, 2014	Over 273 people were killed, 48 houses burnt and several people injured. Also, over 5000 people were displaced
10.	The April 15th crisis in Wukari spilled over to Gindin-Dorowa town	April 19th, 2014	Over 120 people were killed with several properties destroyed and a lot of people were displaced to Wukari town
11.	Jukun youths attacked Chinkai village in reprisal attack against Hausa / Jukun Muslims	May 25th, 2014	62 people were killed while over 40 buildings were burnt down and lots of people were displaced

12.	Another violent ethno-religious conflict erupted between the Jukun Christians and Jukun/Hausa Muslims as result of the burning of a phone booth owned by a Hausa Muslim by an unknown assailant.	June 15th, 2014	About 300 people were killed, while over 200 buildings were destroyed in Wukari metropolis.
13.	The violence that erupted on the 15th of June in Wukari spilled over to Rafin Kada, a neighbouring Jukun settlement.	June 15th, 2014	About 30 people were killed, while a lot of buildings were also destroyed.
14.	Un-known gun men from Ibi and Bantaji towns, attacked Nwuban, a Jukun Village, in Wukari Local Government Area.	August 17th, 2014	About 13 were reportedly killed and many properties worth thousands of Naira were destroyed as well as many people displaced from their homes.
15.	Another violent ethno-religious conflict erupted in Wukari.	September 2nd, 2014	About people were reported killed while several properties were destroyed and many people were displaced from Wukari town.
16.	Suspected Fulani herdsmen attacked Tunari village in Wukari Local Government	14th September, 2014	About 20 people were killed including several buildings destroyed.
17.	Unknown gunmen attacked Tsundi town on Sunday	19 October, 2014	26 people were Killed while 5 people were wounded and several people displaced from Tsondi town
18.	Unknown assailants attacked and killed a Jukun along Federal University road in Wukari .There was a reprisal attack by Jukun youth the next day.	On 7 November, 2014	About 15 people were killed.
19.	Another violent crisis happened in Wukari as a result of the November 7th attack.	On 8 November, 2014	12 people lost their lives
20.	A violent crisis erupted on at Gidin-Doruwa a settlement in Wukari Local Government.Area.	2 December, 2014	44 people were killed, while several houses were destroyed.

Source: Researcher's survey, 2014

A cursory look at the above timeline of the violent ethno-religious conflicts in Wukari Local Government Area of Taraba State reveals that the conflict is primarily rooted in the struggle for political and economic control of Wukari, which assumed ethnic and religious dimensions. The persistent nature of the conflict also indicates that it has become protracted, particularly from April 2014 to date. Generally, the impact of the violent ethno-religious conflicts on inter-group relations in Wukari Local Government Area of Taraba State can be categorized as follows:

- Humanitarian impact
- Economic impact
- Social impact
- Political impact

HUMANITARIAN IMPACT

Violent ethno-religious conflict in Wukari community has claimed so many lives of the residents of the area, especially Christians and Muslims, Jukun and Hausa/ Fulani. For instance, *The People's Daily* of Monday June 16, 2014, reported that about thirty-two people were killed in Wukari. The persistent ethno-religious conflicts in the area also led to the displacement of many residents of Wukari. *The Guardian Newspaper* of Monday, August 18, 2014 indicated that there were many displaced persons from the incidences of ethno-religious conflicts while *The Premium Newspaper* also observed that over seven hundred (700) people were displaced from Wukari.

ECONOMIC IMPACT

The persistent ethno-religious conflicts in the Wukari Local Government Area of Taraba State have also negatively impacted the economy of the area. The Tiv farmers whose farming resourcefulness is the mainstay of the economy of Wukari as well as the Igbo traders are now both moving out in large numbers from the area for fear of their lives. This situation has greatly affected commerce and the economy of area.

SOCIAL IMPACT

Social interactions have been dislocated by the persistent ethno-religious conflicts in the Wukari town and its environs. There is social and psychological separation between the Jukun Christians and the Jukun/ Hausa Muslims, deepened by mutual hatred and suspicion. The violence has also created a divided settlement pattern separating 'Jukun Christian/ jukun traditionalist settlement' and 'Jukun/Hausa Muslim settlement.' By this settlement pattern, neither side could risk crossing to the other side without being killed.

POLITICAL IMPACT

Politics in the area has also been negatively impacted by the persistent ethno-religious conflicts in Wukari. The political machinery of the area is controlled by the Jukun Christians and the Jukun Traditionalists. The Jukun Muslims and Hausa Muslims feel excluded from the politics of the area. The Jukun Muslims in particular feel that it is wrong for the Jukun Christians and Jukun Traditionalists to exclude them from what is rightfully theirs and vent their anger and frustration by repudiating and vilifying the Jukun culture, which the Jukun Christians and Jukun Traditionalists perceive as an abomination which must be corrected by all the means possible. During election periods, votes are often cast along religious lines and the Jukun Christians, because of their sheer numerical size and the support it enjoys from its allies, the Jukun Traditionalists, dominates the political landscape of Wukari Local Government Area of Taraba State.

SUGGESTED SOLUTIONS TO THE MANAGEMENT OF ETHNO-RELIGIOUS
CONFLICTS ON INTER-GROUP RELATIONS IN WUKARI LOCAL
GOVERNMENT OF TARABA STATE

Ethno-religious conflict is a common feature of most multi-cultural and divided societies, as Rabushka and Shepsle (1972) assert in their famous work, *Politics in Plural Societies: A Theory of Democratic Instability*. According to Rabushka and Shepsle, “divided states remain perennially unstable and many survive on the brink of collapse and disintegration.” Divided states also lack the capacity to manage the diverse groups interests, as Jinadu (2007) rightly observes about the nature and character of the state:

. . . the state and its institutions are ethnicised and immersed in clientelist ethnic and religious networks and in ethnic/religious based struggle to implant and entrench ethnic or religious ‘gatekeepers’ in critical, key positions in the bureaucracy and educational institutions, and in other public sector institutions and even in the private sector, which in many African countries relies heavily on the public sector (Jinadu, 2007).

Notwithstanding the above position, a very fundamental truth that must be stressed at this juncture is the fact that most conflicts in divided societies have become protracted and irresolvable primarily because people still largely believe that it is only the state that has the capacity, or the *magic-wand*, to resolve conflicts when it is in fact the state that is generating social conflicts within its domain through its actions and inactions. Rummel (1994) argues that the “government of any state is the greatest

potential threat to any group inside its boundaries.” It is imperative therefore that citizens and communities should understand that they are the ones who need to manage their problems, hence they must establish mechanisms and strategies that will effectively address the problems confronting them. No community or society can exist in isolation of other communities because communities exist interdependently. In this regard, Touval (1985) has rightly observed that the “pluralistic character of most African states has led to the development of mechanisms of adjustment enabling the accommodation of the interests and needs of diverse ethnic groups. Most have developed norms and procedures enabling the maintenance of an ethnic (religious) balance within the political and administrative institutions.”

The following suggestions are proffered towards permanently addressing the persistent ethno-religious conflicts in Wukari Local Government Area of Taraba State:

a). Establishment of a Truth and Reconciliation Committee

Peace, as a valuable gem cannot be decreed unto any society because it requires the collective resolve of all stakeholders in order to plant the seed of peace, nurture it, and harvest its fruits. Peace, therefore, requires true reconciliation among all the stakeholders in any society in order for it to be instituted and sustained. The persistent ethno-religious conflicts in Wukari community have negatively affected the political, economic, social and cultural landscapes of Wukari, with debilitating negative implications on inter-group relations in the area. All of the stakeholders in Wukari, especially the Jukun Christians and Jukun Traditionalists, Jukun Muslims and the Hausa Muslims, should immediately agree to establish a Truth and Reconciliation Committee that will be saddled with the responsibility of reconciling the parties involved in the conflict.

Michael Ignatieff (1996), remarks, “as the African proverb reminds us, ‘truth is not always good to say’, but when it is shared, it is capable of healing the wounds.” Therefore, the establishment of a Truth and Reconciliation Committee (TRC) is important because it will create the platform that will assist the warring parties in Wukari to make sense of the complex issues involved in the conflict as well as reconcile them. As Lerche (2000) argues, all sides have their own version of the truth of “what really happened.” The parties will be able to reconcile the issues that had hitherto been irreconcilable. Some of these issues are what Harold Saunders identifies as: “fear, suspicion, rejection, mistrust, (exclusion and marginalization), hatred and misperception which are often greater obstacles to peace than an inability to resolve technically definable problems“.

b). Power Sharing Arrangement

It is a fact that most and if not all ethno-religious conflicts are inextricably linked to the competition for political and economic resources and the tool that is often used in such competition is identity politics which is usually done by invoking the dare-devil politics of indigene versus settler dichotomy. In this contest, an indigene is perceived to be somebody who is historically affiliated to the place or town or community or locality being contested for and by the virtue of his/her affiliation to the place, he/she enjoys some certain rights and benefits that those who are considered as settlers in the area cannot enjoy.

On the other hand, a settler is perceived as a person who does not have historical affiliation to a place or town or community or locality, due to this, he or she is excluded from enjoying certain rights and benefits that those who considers themselves indigenous to the place enjoy. This kind of perception and definition is a total violation of the concept of citizenship which is supposed to guarantee every bona fide citizen the legal right to enjoy the basic rights and benefits available in any part of a sovereign state. This is the reason why Ibrahim (2000:69) argues that ethno-religious conflicts in Nigeria are linked to citizenship within the context of identity, which is rooted in the politics of inclusion or exclusion. These are tied to claims and counter-claims over identity as a basis for determining who is excluded or included from decision making as well as access to opportunities under the 'we' versus 'them' cliché (Kwaja, 2008:83). At the core of ethnic agitations and conflicts are "distributive questions, which are the fundamental sources of ethnic tensions in Nigeria" (Nnoli 1978 and 1994).

As pointed out by the Carnegie Commission on Preventing Deadly Conflicts (1997:100):

In many multi-ethnic and multi-religious societies, the procedures of majoritarian democracy have proven effective for managing group relations and maintaining social cohesion. However, in societies with deep ethnic and religious divisions and little experience with democratic government and the rule of law, strict majoritarian democracy can be self-defeating. Where ethnic and religious identities are strong and national identity weak, the population may vote largely along ethnic or religious lines. Domination by one ethnic or religious group(s) can lead to a tyranny of the majority [emphasis added] (100).

Indeed, it is always very important for communities and societies experiencing conflict to avoid both the tyranny of the majority and the

revengeful terrorism of the minority, and to understand that they have to work together to resolve their differences so as to build a just and fair community or society in which the rights and interests of all can be guaranteed. This example can also be applied to the Wukari case. Both the Jukun Christians and the Jukun Traditionalists who are the majority in Wukari Local Government Area of Taraba State and the minority Jukun Muslims who are always in alliance with the Hausa Muslims in the area must come to the understanding that they need to work out an inclusive political arrangement that would give both sides, and even the other groups resident in the area, the sense of belonging in the political architecture of Wukari. This is especially because some researchers on conflict management have pointed out that the openness of political institutions decreases the chances of occurrences of violent conflict and protests (e.g., Kriesi, Koopmans, Duyven-dak and Giugni, 1995). This is important because inclusive political arrangements reduce the tendency of competing groups resorting to violent agitations. The adoption of this practice will therefore assist in the accommodation of diversity, which will allay the fears of both the ethnic and religious minorities in the area as well as guarantee the protection of the rights of all the residents of Wukari. In addition, it will assist in the transformation of the perception of ethnic and religious loyalties from being a threat to the social cohesion of Wukari to being utilized as an engine of socio-economic development.

CONCLUSION

Religion and ethnicity are two very important tools that the elites in Nigeria employ in constructing and mobilizing identity in competitive situations. Identity politics have resulted in violent and uncontrollable conflicts of different intensity and magnitudes. The major task of this paper has been to examine the dynamics of the persistent ethno-religious conflicts in Wukari area of Taraba State, Nigeria and the possibility for its sustainable management. The paper therefore proposed some very robust strategies for tackling the persistent ethno-religious conflicts in Wukari community with a view to making all the residents of Wukari, regardless of their ethnic or religious divide, work out some kind of *modus vivendi* that would enable them to accommodate each other and peacefully coexist. This is with the understanding that no community can exist in isolation of other communities hence communities exist interdependently.

REFERENCES

- Albert, I.O. eds. 2001. Ife-Modakeke crisis. In Otite, O & Albert, I.O. *Community Conflicts in Nigeria: Management, Resolution and Transformation*. Ibadan: Spectrum Books Limited.

- Armed Conflict Location & Event Dataset (ACLED), www.acleddata.com
- Ballard, R. 1996. "Negotiating race and ethnicity: exploring the implications of the 1991 census," *Patterns of Prejudice*. Pp. 3-33.
- Bulmer, M. 1996. "The ethnic group question in the 1991 Census of Population." In *Ethnicity in the 1991 Census. Volume 1*. Demographic characteristics of the ethnic minority populations, Coleman D, Salt J (eds.), Office for National Statistics, HMSO: London: xi-xxix.
- Carnegie Commission, 1997. "Preventing Deadly Conflicts: A Final Report", Washington, DC: Carnegie Commission.
- CLEEN Foundation 2012. Justice Sector Reform, Summary of Findings of 2012 National Crime and Safety Survey. p.3.
- Coleman, D. and Salt. J. 1996. *Ethnicity in the 1991 census population*. HMSO.
- Conversi, D. 1999. "Nationalism, Boundaries and Violence" *Millenium Vol.28*.
- Debiel, T. 2002. "Do crisis regions have a chance of lasting peace? The difficult transformation from structures of violence." *Fragile Peace, State Failure, Violence and Development in Crisis Regions*. London. Zed Books. 1-20.
- Etanibi, E O. and Alemika, S. 2000. "A sociological analysis of ethnic and religious conflicts in the middle belt of Nigeria, in ethnic and religious rights." *A Quarterly Publication of Human Rights Monitor, Special Edition*, edited by Festus Okeye, April 2000, Kaduna Nigeria.
- Fund for Peace, 2013. The Failed States Index 2013, <http://ffp.statesindex.org/rankings-2013-sortable>.
- Hopkins A. G. 1973. *An Economic History of West Africa*. London: Longman.
- Ibrahim, J. 1999. "Ethno-Religious Mobilisation and Sapping of Democracy in Nigeria" in Hyslop, J. (ed.) *African Democracy in the Age of Globalisation*. Wit water-rand University Press.
- Ibrahim, J. 2000. "The Transformation of Ethno-Religious Identities in Nigeria." In Jega, A (ed) *Identity Transformation and Identity Politics under Structural Adjustment in Nigeria*, Stockholm, Elanders Gotab.

- Ignatieff, Michael. 1996. "Articles of Faith." Abridged from the article published in *Index On Censorship*, 5(96), September. URL located at: <http://www.niza.nl/uk/publications/001/ignatieff.htm>
- Jega, A.M. 2002. "Tackling Ethno-Religious Conflicts in Nigeria." *The Nigeria Social Scientist* 5 (2) Pp. 35-39.
- Jinadu, A. L. 2007. "Explaining & Managing Ethnic Conflicts in Africa: Towards a Cultural Theory of Democracy," Claude Ake Memorial Paper Series (CAMP) No.1, Uppsala: The Nordic Africa Institute.
- Kwaja, A.M.C. 2008. "Ethnic and Religious Conflicts in Wase LGA, Plateau State, Nigeria," in Best, S.G (ed) *Causes and Effects of Conflicts in the Southern Zone of Plateau State, Nigeria*, Ibadan, John Archers Publishers Limited.
- Kriesi, Ha., Koopmans, R., Duyvendak, J. W. and Giugni.M. G. 1995. *New Social Movements in Western Europe: A Comparative Analysis*. Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press.
- Lerche, Charles O., III. 2000. "Truth Commissions and National Reconciliation: Some Reflections on Theory and Practice." *Peace and Conflict Studies*, 7(1), May, 2000.
- Lewis, P., and Bratton, M. 2000. "Attitudes Towards Democracy and Markets in Nigeria: Report of a National Opinion Survey," January-February 2000, Washington, DC: International Foundation For Election Systems and Management Systems International.
- Mohammed, H. 2004. "Plateau. Crises: The Press as the No.1. Culprit," *Daily Trust*, June 30, 2004.
- Mitchel, T. G. 2000. *Native vs settlers; ethnic conflict in Israel/ Palestine, Northern Ireland, and South Africa* Westport; Greenwood press.
- Modood, T., Berthoud, R., Lakey, J., Nazroo, J., Smith, P., Virdee, S. and Beishon, S. 1997. *Ethnic Minorities in Britain: Diversity and Disadvantage*. London: Policy Studies Institute.
- Momodu, A. Jude 2014. *The Challenges of Government Institutions and Non-Governmental Organisations in the Management of Tiv-Jukun Conflicts in Wukari, Taraba State*. Unpublished Ph.D. Dissertation, Peace and Conflict Studies Programme, Institute of African Studies, University of Ibadan, Nigeria.
- Nnoli, O. 1978. *Ethnic Politics in Nigeria*, Enugu, Fourth Dimension Publishers.
- Olaniyi R. 2001. "Urban Violence, Ethnic Conflicts and Diaspora Identity: The Experience of the Yoruba Community in Metropolitan Kano, Nigeria." In: Eruvbetine E. (Ed.). *Rethinking the Flame of*

Development through a Humanistic Management of Pluralism. Lagos: Faculty of Arts, University of Lagos.

- Okwueze, M. L. 1995. *Religious Problems and Conflict in Nigeria Revisited; Contemporary Issues in Social Sciences*, Enugu; Acena publishers.
- Omohan, S. O. 2005. "Management of ethno- religious conflicts; the Nigerian experience." In A.M.Yakubu, *Crisis since 1980*. Kaduna; Baraka press and publishers Ltd.
- Quaker-Dokubo, C. 2001. "A Nigerian case study". Paper presented at a conference at the University of Pretoria, 25-26 July 2001. In *Politics of Identity and Exclusion in Africa: from Violent Confrontation to Peaceful Cooperation*, pp. 43-56.
- Rabushka, Alvin and Kenneth A. Shepsle 1972. *Politics in Plural Societies: A Theory of Democratic Instability*, Columbus: Charles E. Merrill
- Ross, M. 2000. "Good- enough isn't so bad; thinking about success and failure in ethnic conflict management peace and conflict" *Journal of Peace Psychology*, 6 (1) 27-47.
- Rummel, R. J. 1994. *Death by government: Genocide and Mass Murder since 1900*, New Brunswick NJ, Transaction Publishers.
- Saunders, A *Public Peace Process*, 74.
- Solomos, J. and Back. L. 1996. *Racism and Society*. London: Macmillan.
- Swindell, K. 1984. "Farmers, Traders and Labourers: Dry Season Migration from the North-West Nigeria 1900-1930". *AFRICA: J. Int. Institute* 54(1). The News, January 24, 2000.
- Takaya, B. J. 1992. "Religion, Politics and Peace: Resolving the Nigerian Dilemma", in Olupona, J. K. (ed) *Religion and Peace in a Multi-faith Nigeria*, Ile-Ife, Obafemi Awolowo University Press.
- The Fund for Peace, 2007. 'The Failed States Index 2006'. Internet: <http://www.fundforpeace.org/programs/fsi/fsindex2006.php>, accessed 24 August 2014.
- Transparency International (TI), 26 September, 2007. 'Corruption Perceptions Index 'Internet http://www.transparency.org/news_room/in_focus/2007/cpi2007/cpi_2007 table accessed 17 November, 2014.
- Usman. Y. B. 1981. *The Transformation of Katsina, 1000-1883*. Zaria: Ahmadu Bello University Press.

Vision of Humanity, Global Peace Index, 2013. Nigeria, <http://www.visionofhumanity.org/#page/indexes/global-peace-index/2013/NGA/OVER>.

Zartman, W. I. 1989. *Ripe for Resolution: Conflict and Intervention in Africa*, New York: Oxford University Press, 269.

Willigenburg, T. 1995. *Nation, State and the Coexistence of Different Communities*. Kampen: Kok.

TRIBAL-LED PEOPLE'S RESISTANCE IN TRANSITION: 1765-1800

Ananda Bhattacharyya
West Bengal State Archives

The first formidable peasant led Adivasi (Tribal) resistance against the East India Company was the Chuar Rebellion. The Adivasis of the Jungle Mehal (mostly south-west Bengal including a part of Singbhoom, Manbhum, Chthonagpur and a portion of Orissa) were divided into various ethnic groups, viz. Bagdi, Kurmi, Santal, Bhumij, Bauri, Kora, Mahli and Munda and other communities could not tolerate the British policy of resumption of land which they enjoyed since the Mughal period. Besides the lands and their services to the local magnates they had no other means of subsistence. Their grievances coincided with the precarious condition of the zemindars leading to the spark of a popular revolt which is commonly known as Chuar rebellion. The peasants, being oppressed both by the East India Company Officials and local magnates, found no other alternative but to join in the clarion against the colonial regime.

J. C. Price, the Settlement Officer of Midnapore, described the so-called Chuar Rebellion of 1799 the outcome of the "evil passions of the infuriated Sardars and Paiks," which "carried slaughter and flame to very doors of the Magistrate's cutcherry."¹ The Paiks ('foot-men', being local, hereditary watchmen and militiamen) had been dismissed in large numbers under the British administration established in 1760 and their land grants (*paikan*) were resumed. What is commonly known as the Chuar rebellion was mainly a revolt of the Paiks and Chuars. The Adivasis living in the jungle mahal were commonly called Chuars since the medieval period as Sri Chaitanya, the Vaishnava apostle of Bengal, passing through the area in 1509, described these tribal communities as "pirates gathered on the rivers, and robbers on the land."² A similar perception was found in *Kalketu Upakhyān*, as Kavikankan Mukundaram Chakraborty called them Chooars. Jogesh Chandra Basu took the Chuar to mean "outlandish fellow,"³ and the name was applied in Midnapore to the wild tribes who inhabited the jungle mehal and the tracts beyond them. The ethnic groups of South-West Bengal, according to the narra-

¹ J. C. Price, *The Chuar Rebellion of 1799*, Calcutta, 1873, 1-3

² L.S.S. O' Malley *Bengal District Gazetteer, Midnapore*, Calcutta, 1911, p. 22.

³ Jogesh Chandra Basu, *Medinipur Itihas* (in Bengali), Calcutta, 1939 pp. 37-41 A similar account may be found in Tarilokyanath Pal (*Medinipur Itihas* (in Bengali), Calcutta 1888), pp .75-78

tives of District Gazetteer, were mainly aborigines composed of Kurmi, Santal, Bhumij, Bauri, Kora, Mahli and Munda and other communities.

The works of Narendra Nath Das⁴ and Binode Sankar Das⁵ contain some information about the Chuars. The Bhumij, Mundas, and Mankis of Chotonagpur and Sardar Ghatwals formed organized tribal communities and were the main force among of the rebels of jungle mehal.⁶

DIFFERENT PHASES OF THE ADIVASI RESISTANCE

In 1760 the Company acquired from Mir Qasim, along with Midnapore, the territories of jungle mehals and Dhalbhum. After the grant of Diwani in 1765, the British penetration began in this area when Graham the Resident at Midnapore dispatched a military force to subjugate the jungle zaminders to the west of Midnapore by following "the process of assessing the jungle district to revenue."⁷ Fergusson began by attacking and capturing the fort of the chief of Jhargram.⁸ The zamindars of Ramgarh, Samkakulia (Lalgarh), Jambani and Jatbani (Shilda) submitted to the British, who then could push on to Balarampur *thana* and secure submissions from the chiefs of Amainagar (Ambikanagar), Supur, Manbhum, Chhatna, Barabhum, Rajpur and Phulkusma.⁹

Fergusson was conscious, however, that the tribal chiefs had by no means been thoroughly subdued. Unless a permanent force was established in that area, the collection of the revenue was deemed difficult.¹⁰ Despite the resistance from the Chuars, there were some zamindars who paid the stipulated revenue to the British authorities. The stronghold of the Chuars lay in Manbhum and Barabhum, particularly in the hills between Ghatsila and Barabhum. They held their lands under a kind of feudal tenure, but were not attached to the soil, being always ready to change the plough for the club, at the bidding of their turbulent jungle chiefs or zamindars who could not be coerced into paying revenue. In a letter from the Collector of Midnapore to Hastings (November, 23, 1781), the rents of the jungle zamindars are described as kind of quit-rent collected from their Paiks and Chuars who are inhabitants of these zamindaris. Several expeditions were sent against them in 1767, 1769

⁴ Narendra Nath Das, *History of Midnapore, (1760-1803)*, Calcutta, 1956. Two-third portions of the book (in two volumes) contain the narratives of Chuar Rebellion.

⁵ Binode Sankar Das, *Civil Rebellion in the Frontier Bengal, (1760-1805)*, Calcutta, 1973. He has dealt the Chuar Rebellion in detail throughout the book.

⁶ Proceedings of Judicial Criminal, dated 27th June, 1796, No. 27, West Bengal State Archives.

⁷ Graham to Fergusson dated 4 February 1767. This material has been collected from Midnapore District Collectorate (henceforth the source will be referred to as MDC).

⁸ Fergusson to Graham dated 7 February 1767, No. 120 (MDC).

⁹ Fergusson to Graham dated 29 February 1767, No. 129 and 6th March 1767, No. 139 (MDC).

¹⁰ Fergusson to Graham dated 6 March 1767 (MDC).

and 1770, but without any substantial success. So a scheme of building small thanas in the interior with 60 sepoyes each was put into execution as a means of temporary defence. Later on, in 1795, the landholders of the jungle mehals were vested with the joint charge of police of their respective estates to act in concert with the darogas under Regulation XXII of 1793.

The district records of Manbhum are full of accounts of the Chuar outbreaks in different parts of the country. In 1771 Lt. Goodyear and in 1772 Capital Carter, Lt. Gall and Lt. Young were operating in these areas. In 1782 Major Crawford suppressed disturbances in Jhalda and took charge of the collections. He also recommended that the inhabitants of the area formed by the triangle Jhalda, Pachet and Ramgarh be disarmed. Again in 1783-84, disturbances broke-out in Kuliapal, many of these disturbances were related to an increase in taxation.

It was stated that "Barahabhum and other estates which were first assessed got off very lightly, whereas Jhalda, Katras, Jharia, Nawagarh and other estates, which were taken up later on when the British control had been considerably strengthened, had to submit to a comparatively heavy assessment."¹¹ In this context we should refer the compilation of Walter. K. Firminger.¹²

The surrender of Ghatsila in August 1767 had been preceded by the spontaneous coming together of the zamindars of Patkum and Singhum, and of the Chhatna zamindar. All three were anxious to secure British protection against the attack of their neighbours; indeed, the Chhatna zamindar declared that he would rather "quit the country and starve than become a vassal of Patchet."¹³ In mid-1768 trouble was renewed in Ghatsila. Towards the end of 1769 the tribal people, especially Bhumijis, living between the pargana of Dhalbhum and Barabhum were in turmoil and the adivasis of Patchet, Patkum also joined the insurgents. They invaded Ghatsila and forced the Company's sepoyes to retire to the Narsinghagarh fort. Subha Singh, the jaigirdar of Koilapal one of the "obstinate" Chuar chiefs, had joined the rebels. He was seized and hanged on the spot as an example for his rebellious mind and mentality.¹⁴ It appears that the advasis in their initial attempt were not inclined

¹¹ W.K. Firminger (ed.) *Midnapore District Records (Letters Issued)*, Calcutta, 1909, Vol. I, No Manbhum settlement reports, para. 37; J.C. Price, *Notes on the History of Midnapore*, pp. 67-68, 109, 111, 122; *District Gazetteer, Midnapore*, p. 38 ff; W.W. Hunter, *Bengal MS Records: A Selected List of 14,136 Letters in the Board of Revenue*, Calcutta, 1782-1807, with an historical dissertation and analytical index, London, 1894, Nos. 269, 272, 273, 403-404, 504, 514, 537, 588, 594, 614-618, 677-678, 713-715, 724.

¹² A. Mitra, *District Handbook, Midnapore, 1951*, Appendix IV, p. xxvi; Graham to Fergusson dated 30 January 1767 (MDC): W.K. Firminger, *Midnapore District Records*, Vol. I, No. 109.

¹³ Fergusson to Vansittart 5 June 1767, No. 202 (MDC).

¹⁴ Vansittart to Lt. Nun, 8 January 1770, Nos. 509 (MDC).

to surrender the gun and matchlocks which they seized from the Company's forces. They were undaunted and backed by the sardar of Dhadka, Ghatsila.¹⁵ It was resolved that "unless Jagannath Dhal was subdued the East India Company could never obtain any revenue from the side of Subarnarekha."¹⁶

Trouble continued in 1770. The Company sent Lt. Goodyear to quell the revolt and he immediately got engaged against various rebels.¹⁷ With considerable difficulty the rebellion was suppressed at long last in 1773. The British Government being compelled to make peace by restoring the estate of Jagannath, the Raja of Dhalbhum who was the leader of the zamindars.

The disturbances in the western jungles were renewed by Subla Singh and many others including Kuilapal jaghindar, the sardar of Dhadki. They refused to accept the authority of the Company, to settle revenue, and to survey their possessions. The Company mobilised a force of a thousand paiks under Sitaram thanadar. The main object was to reduce them to subjection and to bring them to Midnapore for a speedy and favourable settlement. The uprisings took a serious turn when in February 1773 fresh disturbances broke out in the western jungles under the leadership of Jagannath Dhal of Ghatshila. The ryots of Haldypukur joined with Jagannath and rose in revolt. The paiks of Dompura headed by Mangovin, the zamindar of Silda, were encouraged to commit depredations.¹⁸ In fact, however, most of the early depredations of the Chuars took place outside the Midnapore district. At this stage Warren Hastings adopted the astute policy of recruiting all able-bodied adult males of this area into the Company's army, keeping them in the Company's pay while recognizing their interest in paikan lands in this territory. These recruits were employed against the Marathas in the First Maratha War.

Much of the Midnapore district was covered with wide stretches of jungles, its inhabitants being mostly Paiks and Chuars, who had the reputation of being careless cultivators but expert in pillage. The hilly and geographical environment of Manbhum helped the insurgents to spread in that region. In the eighteenth and early nineteenth centuries Manbhum was still thickly forested with *Sal*. Thus, in 1773 it was described as "mountainous and over spread with thick woods, which render it in many places utterly impassable."¹⁹ In fact, two thirds of Midnapore in the early nineteenth century consisted of jungle, the greater part of which was

¹⁵ Eward Baber to Goodyar dated 30 November 1770 *Midanpore District Records*, Vol. 4. No. 70.

¹⁶ Eward Baber to Lt. Goodyar, dated 30 November 1770 (MDC).

¹⁷ Capt. J. Forbes from Haldypukur dated 4 April 1773 (MDC).

¹⁸ Midnapore Collector to Warren Hastings dated 23 November 1781 (MDC), W.K. Firminger *Fifth Reports*, p. CXXIX; see also J.C. Price, *op. cit.*, p. 67.

¹⁹ Letter to Warren Hastings dated 27 November 1781 (MDC); J.C. Price *op. cit.*, p. 67.

uninhabited and inaccessible. Bogree, Bishnupur, Pachet, Singhbhum and Mayurbhanj, the main strongholds of the adivasis were surrounded by jungles. The difficulty of realizing revenues from the jungle estates failed very early and it was reported that the adivasis of the jungle mahal areas were "bred up as much for pillaging as cultivating, pay a kind of quit-rent from the profits of both occupations."²⁰ If we agree with the opinion of Hunter, it can be said that the Permanent Settlement tried to suddenly substitute contract for custom."²¹ The tribal cultivators and chiefs had always been guided by their own customs. The new system damaged the interest of both the semi-tribal chiefs and ignorant ryots. Rani Shiromani of the Midnapore estate, the Raja of Pachet, the zamindar of Raipur and several others found themselves driven from pillar to post and they had to face unusual humiliations e.g, arrest, mortgage, sale and attachment of property. According to J.C. Price, the jungle zamindar was a sort of military chief, "to who his ryots might look for protection who might command his paiks with effect, and whose title should not be doubtful."²² Such doubt was raised out the possession of the zamindari of rani Shiromani, which was caused to be confiscated. The logic of the East India Company behind such acquisition was its bad management and arrears of revenue. She was only entitled to a *moshaira*. For a time the rebels' sardars wanted to make the Rani their leader but the Rani, though she secretly sympathized with rebels, was not in a position to antagonize the Company's Government. She could not long maintain her neutrality when in the last decade of the eighteenth century the inevitable clash between the Paiks and the Government reached its climax. At the same time the zamindar of Simlapal also encouraged the ryots to rise against the Company. Rani Shiromani was very popular with the dispossessed rebels, Paiks, and the exploited artisans of Anandapur factory.²³

There was also much public sentiment behind the Rani, as a victimized widow. Her zamindari was let out and brought under Government management. Support for the cause of the Rani constituted a major factor behind the revolt of 1799. In this phase of insurgency the rebels were supported by the peasants who had so long tilled lands for the Paiks without rent, but now they were subjected to the new system of taxation. The situation was aggravated when they suffered from the enhanced prices of salt which coincided with the disbandment of the Paiks. Rani Shiromani also made common cause with Chunilal Khan of Narajol. The situation deteriorated to such a degree that the Government *tehsildars*

²⁰ A Price, *op. cit.*, p. 73.

²¹ Hunter, *op.cit.* Nos.1374, 1489,, 1933-35,7890-93,7953.

²² Price, *op. Cit*, p.70

²³ H.V. Bayley, *Memoranda of Midnapore*, Calcutta, 1902, p. 2.

could not even collect a rupee from the ryots.²⁴ Tribal peasants also were also greatly disturbed by the exit of their old chiefs and the entry of new non-tribal zamindars. There was, therefore, much unrest from 1795 to 1800 in all those estates which were auctioned off for revenue arrears. In the case of Pachet and Raipur, the Government had to yield. In Bishnupur, the Bhumis of Barabhum, Manbhum and other jungle mahals came in thousands to assist the family of the late Raja Chetan Singh to get back its zamindari.²⁵

The unrest began to spread when the Ghatwals began to get aggrieved by the actions of the Government. In 1799 the Midnapore Collector wrote about the ryots that these people “were contented, industrious, brave, truthful, and confiding, much attached too to their proprietors, but if they were oppressed, a whole village would literally in one night ‘up stick’ and off to some zamindar, whose general character promised them better treatment.”²⁶ The Ghatwals, appearing as the leaders of the tribal community, defied their own chiefs. The Permanent Settlement also damaged the interest of the Ghatwals, so that their custom of receiving ‘rewards’ was totally curtailed. Their *ghatwali* (paikan) lands were resumed under the 1793 Regulations. They had thus no alternative but to join with their brethren against the Company’s Government.

TRENDS OF POPULAR REVOLT

The main targets of the rebels’ attacks were the *tehsildars* and *serishtadars* of Janpur. The tehsildar of Anandpore also reported that it was impossible to realize the revenues and there was a grave risk to his life. The striking feature of the situation was that the police system proved an utter failure. The police darogahs were prone to take bribes and to exploit the simple tribal people at their will. Thus, in 1794 Govind Ram, the police darogah of Chatna and Manbhum, was charged with “having received bribes for releasing persons accused before them.” The British Government thought that, the tribals themselves were “in general a very brave and inoffensive people.”²⁷ Under the circumstances it was proposed to frame separate regulations for the jungle zamindars and the ryots in order to realize the revenue. The jungle chiefs or zamindar, however, were deemed a turbulent and independent class, described as follows in 1778: “These zamindars are mere freebooters who plunder their neighbours and one another; and their tenants are banditti, whom

²⁴ Revenue Department Proceedings (WBSA) 12 April 1799, no. 45

²⁵ Ibid 15th February, 1799, no. 25.

²⁶ Judicial (Criminal) (WBSA) 22nd February, 1799, no. 1.

²⁷ Judicial (Criminal) 22nd February, 1799, no. 1.

they chiefly employ in their outrages. These depredations keep the zamindars and their servants continually in arms."²⁸

It was suggested that the jungle zamindars outside the area of jungle mahal should be made responsible for the preservation of public peace in their respective estates. Considering the situation, the implementation of a new scheme was deferred until the rebellion had entirely ceased since it was argued that such a concession might create a sense of victory in favour of the Chuars.

The Adivasis adopted guerrilla warfare and avoided any direct clash with the troops, but they hit the sepoys from behind jungle and hill. Many of the sepoys also succumbed to the unwholesome air of the jungles. Written guarantees (*muchalaka*) were obtained from Raja Gopinath Dhal of Supur, Motilal Dubraj, the eldest son of Raja Jagannath Dhal of Ghatshila, Birchand Hakim, *Mukhtar* Gopinath, the minor zamindar of Ambikanagar, Pratap Narain, zamindar of Manbhum, Bansi Maiti, mukhtar of Barabhum, and Lachmi Narain, zamindar of Chhatna that they should not assist the Adivasis in any way. Side by side the Board had recommended in September 1799 that for the sake of restoring cultivation, the Paiks might be restored to their former lands and a remission of dues might be allowed.²⁹

The loyal zamindars were also entrusted with apprehending the insurgents and it was stated that "any zamindar who may be convicted of having connived at the assemblage or passage of choars" would be punished. Zamindars would also be held responsible for all the property stolen in their jurisdictions.³⁰

The Adivasis were encouraged by the zamindars to commit plunder and outrages upon the loyal zamindars. Such plundered booty in addition to revenue on some occasions was distributed among the ryots. These zamindars were considered by the British as 'refractory' and the inhabitants of the territory 'rude and ungovernable.'³¹

The rebels did not think it necessary to keep it a secret that their main intension was to burn and plunder the *tehsils* and zamindaris. Midnapore itself was threatened several times. The situation was so dangerous for the zamindars and European officials that it became quite difficult to travel in the daytime. In 1780, one Rudra Bauri with a hundred of Dhalbhum people plundered the inhabitants of Bishnupur. The Rani of Karnagarh supported the leaders of the disturbance and the Zamindar of Simlapal encouraged the ryots and other villagers of that area to rise up. Raja Jadu Singh was the brain of the insurgents. The powerful servants

²⁸ Revenue Department Proceedings 15th March, 1799, no. 33.

²⁹ Board of Revenue Proceedings, 21st February 1799, No 35

³⁰ Revenue Department Proceedings, 14th September 1799, No. 54

³¹ Judicial (Criminal) Proceedings, 21st September 1800, No.23

of the Rani being dispossessed of their lands, they instigated the paiks to open rebellion. The Rani herself and her attendants took up the leadership of the rebellion together with the other chiefs of the Jungle Mehals. The resistance of the Adivasis became aggressive and formidable after 1794. The Magistrate of Midnapore permitted to distribute the Company's offer of reward for apprehending Lutchmun Singh and others.

In the vicinity of the town of Midnapore there were three places where the Paiks assembled in force, viz. Bahadurpore, Shalbani and Karnagarh, the last place being the residence of the Rani of Midnapore, which had been brought under *khas* or government management. In these places they started on their various attacks in search of plunder, returning to divide the spoils. In consequence the ryots left their homes and so prevented the collection of revenue.³² The former Zamindar of Raipur along with the Paiks and Adivasis surrounded the kutchery of the darogha of Gunada and had fought from evening until 10 o'clock of the following morning. They set fire to the bazaar and kutchery and overran the place and blocked it up. They wounded a sepoy and two of the barkandazes and killed two ryots. The principal leader of the rebels was one Durjan Singh who reputedly had a following of 15,000 men with whom he raided the country. He was once captured, after he had attacked, plundered, and burnt some thirty villages, but when he was put on trial, he had to be released because no one dared to appear against him. His release from jail raised the spirit of the rebels to commit depredation on a wider scale and this in turn compelled the Government to cancel the sale of Pachet and restore the zamindar to his estate. In May 1798, Durjan Singh's followers, a body of 1,500 Chuars, made their appearance in Raipur, set fire to the bazaar and cutchery and raided the countryside.

In July 1798, about 400 adivasis under Gobardhan Dhakpati, a Bagdi leader of pargana Bagri, in Midnapore, appeared in Chndrakona thana. Gobardhan Dhakpati decamped from Daibiha but his wife and daughter were made prisoners. In December the Paiks became so audacious as to take possession of six or seven villages, cutting down the crops, and also plundering fifteen villages taking away their cattle and other effects. The *tehsilder* of Janpore was unable to collect any revenue from the ryots, who refused to pay unless they were protected. It was feared that the Paiks would take complete possession of the estate. There was trouble also in Basudevpoore. The rebels plundered a village and menaced Satpati. A numerous party of Paiks plundered and burnt Rajgarh and were daily committing attacks on Shalbani. The town of Midnapore itself was also threatened. Imhoff, the Collector, wrote to the Magistrate on March 10, 1799, informing him of a report that the Chuars

³² Extract of a letter of Magistrate, Midnapore to the Revenue Board dated September 14th, 1799: Hunter, Bengal MS records, p. 42.

intended to plunder and burn the town of Midnapore 'either to-night or tomorrow.'³³ On March 14th, the Chuars burned down two villages and, on the next day, government property amounting to 2,000 *arras* of paddy was consigned to flames in the very large village of Shiromani which was totally sacked. The Chuars raided the zamindari of one Kishen Charan Chatterjee, and plundered the *maujas* (villages) of Ceamorry, Inaitpur, Ghoshpur, Raghunathpur and Adipur. Madhab Singh, brother of the Raja of Barabhum, at the head of his Chuar followers became so formidable that Wellesley's government had to adopt special measures for his apprehension.

The Paiks had grown so bold that villages not more than one *coss* from Midnapore were plundered, and the Collector wrote that a few nights earlier about 200 of them with lighted mashals (torches) came to the opposite side of the river Having by Midnapore. They ordered Raghunath Pal, a *tehsilder* of the lately resumed *paikan* land, to supply them with a large quantity of rice, *dal* etc. The ryots were daily streaming into Midnapore with their cattle and effects, while others went to other districts to avoid being plundered. The paddy was not yet cut down, nor did any person dare to cut it down, as they ran the risk of being murdered. When the Collector sent peons, they were generally threatened and manhandled, particularly those whom he sent to demand the balances of *Abkari Mahals* in the month of Baisakh 1205 (corresponding to 1798-99). The rebels murdered six persons at Shiromani on September 13th; on the 26th two men were put to death near Anandapur; on the 9th October a party of Chuars attacked a village ten miles from Midnapore; and on the 5th and 30th December 1799 they plundered several villages near the town. Durjan Singh, the late zamindar of Raipur, together with a following of 1500 Paiks, attacked some thirty villages, wounded and killed the ryots, plundered their effects and burnt their houses. They also surrounded the houses of the current zamindar's clerk and the daroga ran away. This success so excited the Adivasis that they again with the help of Durjan Singh rose in arms. The zamindar's *naib*, Kinu Bakhsi, being unable to remain at Raipur for fear of the Paiks, fled to Balarampore. The revenues due from zamindar fell into arrears and part of his estate was ordered to be sold. The Adivasis were so defiant that they appeared in the villages with lighted torches (mashals) and matches and burnt the houses of the officials of the zamindars so that no one dared to harvest the crops. One *surbarakar* was cut to pieces and another was so beaten that his life was despaired of the Paiks then set fire to the village and all the *golahs*. The ryots fled to Anandpore where there was once a police outpost, but that place was also threatened. The *tehsildars* also left their cutchery and

³³ Judicial (Criminal) Proceedings 29th March 1800, No. 30

took refuge in Midnapore. The rebels also made a bonfire at Salbani of the village accounts and took away the property of the deceased Surbarakar Baktaram's house. Amin Ramchandra Chakraborty, who had been deputed to make the *jamabandi* of Slabani and other villages, was surrounded by about fifty men and threatened with death. No one was willing to take charge of the revenue collection at Bahadurpur. On February 26, 1799 the collector wrote that five villages near Satpati were plundered and burnt and twelve zamindari *amlahs* (officials) were brutally beaten and burnt to death. The royts, in consequence, fled to the jungles to obtain means of subsistence. The Collector was under the apprehension that the Paiks would succeed in robbing the treasury. They were so bold that in open daylight they hanged suspected persons in the town and plundered their properties. They even threatened to burn the town of Midnapore, so that many of its inhabitants left. The Collector of Midnapore in a letter of March 19, 1799 reported: "I am at a loss to point out the situation of a district Midnapore. I cannot remain an idle spectator of the innumerable outrages which are daily committed with impunity. On the night of the 14th two villages in which there was a quantity of grain were burning during the whole night and part of the next day. . . Bahadurpore also is entirely deserted. . . the grain merchants are unable to come to pargana Midnapore to purchase paddy. . . all communications being cut off, the inhabitants are flocking to the town for protection. . and believe that the paiks have determined to plunder and burn."³⁴

The property of the Government kept in Anandpore village was burnt and plundered by 2000 Paiks. They cut off the heads of one of the *Sebandi* sepoy and of a *barkandaz* and hung them up a tree; the rest made their escape to Midnapore. The Collector was alarmed when the Paiks declared their plan to plunder the town of Midnapore. A reward was offered for the arrest of Gobardhan Dagpati and Kanak Singh, "the dangerous men." The police *daroga* could not obtain any assistance either from Paiks or Digwars, who in fact, threatened death to any of the merchants who should dare to supply the sepoy with provisions, and they declared that they were authorized to do so by the Rani Siromani and the Raja of Karnagarh and Narajole. The peaceful ryots and the zamindars of that locality also joined them.

The Magistrate directed to arrest the Rani, and her adherents and to capture the fort of Karnagarh, a convenient refuge for the insurgents. The Rani asked all the jungle zamindars to meet and decide upon a common course of action. The Paiks spiritedly joined the band of the Adivasis even after the arrest of the Rani and her adherents. The bazaar of Dhalhara was burnt, and a number of cattle carried off.

³⁴ Letter from the Magistrate to Col. Dunn, dated 19th March 1799 (MDC).

In spite of all the measures adopted by the Government, one hundred insurgents attacked the house of Lakshi Charan, Kalicharan Pal, Rupcharan Mahapatra and two *chaukidars* of Anandapore. Patra, a village of the East Midnapore was set fire to, and Gangaram Mondal who farmed a *hudda* during the period of decennial settlement, was put to death. Two villages of Silda and Raipur were occupied under a Bagdi leader. They took possession of six or seven villages of Balarampur, Rajgarh, Salbani and Anandapur.

In September 1798 the Adivasis took possession of six or seven villages of Nyabasan and Barjit, refused to pay their revenues to the state treasury, cut down the corps and plundered tehsils' revenue which was ready for dispatch. Thus there were large scale migration of peasantry from the affected villages causing the arrear of revenue and stoppage of cultivation. Some local bandits and robbers took advantage of the situation and tried to create terror in the adjoining areas. Alarmed, the Company's Government installed night patrolling in the streets of Midnapore. Some police officers of Raipur, Silda, Satpati and Manbhum refused to work on the plea of 'indisposition' and so were considered 'delinquents.' Thus the suspicious persons were told to appear at the bungalow of the District Magistrate within fifteen days from the date of publication of a notification.

In considering the nature of rebellion, we have to keep in mind that the main targets of attacks were the loyal zamindars, *Tehsildars*, grain dealers and the common people. There are some instances where the peasants had become the victims in the hands of the rebels but in most of the cases the peasants had assisted the rebels.³⁵ A common cause of friendship was established between the peasantry and the Adivasis if any one comes across the thousands of files of West Bengal State Archives and Midnapore District Collectorate. Without the peasant support it was very difficult for the rebels to hide out in the dense forests for a long time. But Ranajit Guha in spite of his attempt to find out the beginning of the peasant insurgency against the colonial Raj had failed to locate such relationships³⁶ in the tribal led adivasi resistance and Benay Bhushan Chowdhury³⁷ has a casual reference in his work and did not go beyond the explanation already advanced by others. Chowdhury's firm conviction was that "the chuar movements did include a number of tribals who

³⁵ On the basis of the official sources it appears that out of 350 attacks two-third of which with the help of the peasants were directed against the Company, zemindars, tehsildars and other loyal servants of them.

³⁶ Ranajit Guha, *Elementary Aspects of Peasants Insurgency in Colonial India*, Delhi, 1992.

³⁷ Binay Bhushan Chaudhury, "The Transformation of Rural Protest in Eastern India 1757-1930" Presidential Address delivered in the *Indian History Congress Session* 1989, pp.503-541.

had lost their main occupations as agriculturists.” It is true that they participated either as recruits of the armies of the local Rajas or other chiefs, or out of motives of gains from plunder and loot, where their means of subsistence were precarious. The threat to burn the town with the help of multi-dimensional components was no doubt an indication of anti-colonial resistance. A phase of the Chuar movement was organized mainly by a group called Paiks who often combined cultivation with their ‘police’ work for their employers. Quite a number of them had only recently lost their lands and the movement aimed at their restoration.

There is no denying the fact that the resumption of paikan lands was the main reason behind the growth of the rebel’s extreme dissatisfaction and that they had no other alternative to “gaining their livelihood than by entering upon a career of rapine and pillage.” This explains why the paiks since the beginning of colonial rule were lukewarm in showing their allegiance to the ruling power.

The immediate effect of the Chuar rebellion was that the injudicious system of the management of the paikan lands was postponed. The zamindars of the jungle mehals were armed with police powers, and the inelastic portions of Regulations were not enforced against the defaulting estates. Henry Strachey selected to take charge of the district, while answering to the interrogatories sent by George Dowdeswell, secretary to the government in the judicial department, stated in his letter of January 30, 1802 that two years earlier, the Chuars numbering some thousands burnt and plundered several parganas of Midnapore, but he had adopted the policy of restoring the zamindars to their former estates and securing them in their rights and using their influence and manage their subjects and followers. This policy of investing the zamindars with full authority became the principal means of restoration of tranquillity. Even then, the Chuars were not completely subdued.

TRUSTING AN ABUSIVE SYSTEM: SYSTEMIC RACISM AND BLACK POLITICAL ENGAGEMENT

Matthew Simmons
Temple University

Black political participation has been long argued as an avenue for equality and freedom for Blacks in American society. However, Africana contemporary political leadership has pushed the political arena as the sole avenue to affect change in society on a large-scale. This method of engagement, this project will argue, has rendered political progress stagnant because it relies upon a system that is rooted in systemic racism. The folly of believing that the system cares about Africana issues will be explored in this project, as well as some solutions to this abusive engagement. This article will also explore the shortcomings of this theory in empowering Africana people in the fight for liberation in this country and provide exploratory solutions to obtain that liberation. Let it be reiterated that this project is an exploratory examination of this phenomenon which utilizes Feagin's theory of Systemic Racism, which will be explored at length in the following pages. The first part of the project will examine the relevance of Systemic Racism to this project.

RELEVANCE OF SYSTEMIC RACISM

The theory of Systemic Racism, conceptualized by Joe Feagin, forms the theoretical thrust of this article. Feagin articulated that "systemic racism includes a diverse assortment of racist practices: the unjustly gained economic and political power of whites; the continuing resource inequality; the rationalizing white-racist frame; and the major institutions created to preserve white privilege and power."¹ Feagin argues that America has racism emanating from all directions in an attempt to maintain White privilege and perpetually subjugate people of color. The American political system, from its inception, built its contemporary economic and political influence upon the subjugation of people of color while justifying that racism through its authoritative rhetoric.

Feagin based this premise upon the racist origins of the United States Constitution. He argues that while most Americans believe that this document was created to solidify the emerging country's unity, it

¹ Feagin, Joe R. *Racist America: Roots, Current Realities, and Future Reparations*. (New York: Routledge. Second Edition, 2010), 9.

was actually created to maintain racial separation and oppression at the time and for the near future.² He further argues that the institution of the enslavement of Africans in America was allowed because the framers of the United States Constitution had a vested interest in the vitality of what Paulo Freire calls the “dehumanization” of the oppressed.³ The United States Constitution’s framers had to take the humanity from the Africans in order to justify their suppression. This country’s freedom depended on the enslavement of Africans and other groups of color in order to maintain White rule.

This treatment continued to manifest itself throughout American history. After the end of slavery after the American Civil War, new systems of political and social oppression against Blacks were implemented in order to maintain the White order. Examples of these institutions were the Black Codes, which were a series of legislation implemented by ex-confederate states to limit and control the movements of free Blacks; Jim Crow as it pertains to literacy tests, poll taxes, and White mob rule over Blacks; and finally the challenging and ending of Jim Crow with the passing of the 1964 Civil Rights Act and the 1965 Voting Rights Act.⁴ Blacks were able to fight the oppression of White rule through the utilization of the American judicial and political systems, thus making inroads into what some would call “progress” within that socio-economic and socio-political sphere.

Therefore, when Blacks utilized these various forms of American political participation, most notably voting political representation into public office, they did so with the hope that their interests would be understood, heeded, and implemented. They hoped that their economic issues, in regards to impoverishment and educational funding, would be recognized. Blacks employed the apparatus of the American political system in hopes that Africana communal matters would be addressed. However, if Feagin’s theory of Systemic Racism is applied, then the community concerns of Africana people would never be realized due to the inherent racism that is in that system. The tenet that will be utilized to examine the impotence of solely relying upon Black engagement with the American political system lies in the “extraordinary costs and burdens of racism.”⁵ This tenet articulates the extreme affliction that Afri-

² Ibid, 6.

³ Freire, Paulo. *Pedagogy of the Oppressed*. (London, Penguin Books, 1970), 26.

⁴ W.E.B. Du Bois goes into depth of the ramifications of the Black Codes upon the Black community in his book *Black Reconstruction in America: 1860-1880*, (New York, The Free Press, 1935), 171-180. Other publications look at the Black Codes on individual state level such as Dan Moore and Michele Mitchell’s *Black Codes in Georgia*, (Atlanta: The Apex Museum, 2006) and Joe M. Richardson’s “Florida Black Codes” in the *Florida Historical Quarterly*, (Vol. 47, No. 4, 1969,), 365-379.

⁵ Feagin, 19-23.

cana people endure in order to exist in America. However, it is the argument of this article that this tenet also speaks to the extraordinary dilemma that Blacks have to endure: how to converse with a political system that does not have the interests of the Africana community in mind. This article will also utilize the works of Ronald Walters and contemporary data to bolster the argument that the utilization of the American political system, in itself, is a defeatist avenue and that other mechanisms must be employed in order to benefit and ensure the vitality and survival of Africana people in America. The next section will explore the findings of Ronald Walters and the Black America voting populace.

SYSTEMIC RACISM AND BLACK POLITICS

The shortcomings of Africana people relying solely upon the American political system will be explored in this section. This article will be relying upon the various publications of Ronald Walters and the assessments of other people of Africana descent to argue that the systemic racism that exists within the American political system will continue to generate the racial inequalities that have existed since Blacks were forcibly placed in America. The reliance upon the oppressor's tools will never generate liberation for the oppressed. Freire articulated that the pedagogy of the oppressed cannot be generated by the ones doing the oppressing.⁶

The protection of Black voter enfranchisement in the United States lies in the 1965 Voting Rights Act. This piece of legislation was considered the "crown jewel" of Black political achievement because it gave federal protection and oversight over states that historically disenfranchised African Americans for trying to utilize the voting mechanism in order to have representatives in the political realm to push their needs on the national, state, and local stages while simultaneously bolstering the Fifteenth Amendment that gave Black men the right to vote during Reconstruction.⁷ This act had enormous effects on the local political landscape. It exponentially raised Black political representation directly after the passage of the 1965 Voting Rights Act. Some states had about a 45 percent increase of Black officials by 1985 and by the year 2000, there were states that yielded the largest number of Black elected officials where they had the least participation pre-Voting Rights Act.⁸ There was also an enormous increase in local officials when comparing Black elected officials in 1970 to those in 2002. There were 1,469 elected

⁶ Freire, 36.

⁷ Walters, Ronald. *Freedom is Not Enough: Black Voters, Black Candidates, and American Presidential Politics*. (Lanham: Rowman & Littlefield Publishers, 2005), 14.

⁸ Walters, 19.

Black officials in local, state, and national offices in 1970 while in 2002 there were 9,040 Black elected officials.⁹ That represented a little over two percent of all elected officials in the nation. Africana grievances cannot be heard with such representation in political offices.

However, has that increased representation yielded better results for the Black community as a whole in contemporary times? It is the stance of this article that it has benefited individuals within the Black community but not the entire Africana community. Ronald Walters contended that Black America still has a ways to go in order to achieve equality in America. He based his findings upon the 2004 Index of Inequality report that stated that Blacks lagged significantly behind their White counterparts in the areas of economics, home ownership, life expectancy, educational opportunities, and social justice.¹⁰ According to a 2013 Washington Post report, these contemporary conditions are comparable with the poverty, educational opportunities, and other issues that the Africana community faced in the 1960s.¹¹ These conditions are still prevalent in the Black community today according to the 2014 report that was released by the National Urban League. However, it articulated that Black political engagement is strong. 73 percent of the African-American community is registered to vote and 66 percent of those voters voted in 2012.¹² Therefore, if the economic and social conditions of Africana people have not improved, why does the Africana community continue to vote?

Ronald Walters explored this relationship in his book *Pan Africanism in the African Diaspora: An Analysis of Modern Afrocentric Political Movements* (1993). He juxtaposed the two traditions of conversing with the American political system: 1) the accommodationist tradition and 2) the resistance tradition. Ronald Walters describes the position of the accommodationist tradition: "The accommodationist tradition, to be sure, arises because of the existence of men who compromise the goal of race advancement for their private ends, and also because good men feel that political objectives may be achieved through cooperation and coalition with those who control the instruments of policy."¹³ Ronald articulates the issue with the inherent problematic concern with the utilization of

⁹ Walters, 22.

¹⁰ Walters, 23.

¹¹ Plumer, Brad, "These Ten Charts Show the Black-White Economic Gap Hasn't Budgeted in Fifty Years." *The Washington Post*. August 28, 2013. Accessed March 1, 2014. <http://www.washingtonpost.com/blogs/wonkblog/wp/2013/08/28/these-seven-charts-show-the-black-white-economic-gap-hasnt-budgeted-in-50-years/>

¹² National Urban League. *One Nation, Underemployed, Jobs Rebuild America: 2014 State of Black America*. (U.S.A: National Urban League, 2014), 39.

¹³ Walters, Ronald. *Pan-Africanism in the African Diaspora: An Analysis of Modern Afrocentric Political Movements*. (Detroit: Wayne State University Press, 1993), 221.

voting to secure freedom from oppression: that race advancement is controlled by the individuals who directly benefit from being in power. Carter G. Woodson also articulated this sentiment: “It is unfortunate, too, that such a large number of Negroes do not know any better than to stake their whole fortune on politics. History does not show that any race, especially a minority group, has every solved an important problem by relying altogether on one thing, certainly not by parking its political strength on one side of the fence because of empty promises.”¹⁴ The individuals who are in the United States Congress are not economically representative of the Africana constituency. At least half of individuals who are in congressional positions are individuals who are worth at least one million dollars.¹⁵ According to the Congressional Black Caucus, there are currently forty-three Black members of Congress: forty-one members in the House of Representatives and two members in the Senate.¹⁶ There are four hundred thirty-five (435) members in the House of Representatives and one hundred (100) members in the Senate. Therefore, the make-up of that Congressional body is not conducive to push the concerns of Africana people.

The executive branch is an interesting study of the relationship between Africana people and the power that the position entails. Even though President Barack Obama is in the most powerful position in the world, he is not able to directly address the policies that most affect Africana people. This position is argued in Harris’ book *The Price of the Ticket* (2012). He argued that the President’s neutral political agenda and the Africana community’s needs are not on the same page. He articulated this position in the following statement:

The vision of independent black politics—which places community issues above all else—would have predicted that the rise in black political empowerment, symbolized by the election of Obama as president, would produce more substantive policy outcomes for black America. That having a Black president, a Black attorney general (Eric Holder) and a Black chairman of the house Judiciary Committee (John Conyers, when the Democrats were in the majority during the first two years of the Obama’s presidency, has not resulted in any major re-

¹⁴ Woodson, Carter G. *Mis-Education of the Negro*. (Tribeca Books, 1933), 65.

¹⁵ Choma, Russ. “Half of Congress Members are Millionaires.” *Washington Post*, Jan 9, 2014. <https://www.opensecrets.org/news/2014/01/millionaires-club-for-first-time-most-lawmakers-are-worth-1-million-plus/>

¹⁶ Congressional Black Caucus. “Congressional Black Caucus Online”. 2014 (Accessed Dec. 2, 2014). The Congressional Black Caucus has primarily been Democratic members. The 113th Black congressional members have forty-two Democratic members and one Republican member. This will change when the new Congress convenes in January 2015.

form in the criminal justice system shows the substantive limits of black politics at the peak of “empowerment.”¹⁷

Harris further argues that other constituents, such as the Tea Party and the Gay/Lesbian Movements, have been able to make avenues towards issues that fit their interests. The Africana community cannot make headway to get the issue of mass incarceration, which disproportionately affects Black and Latino men, effectively addressed by the President.¹⁸ Additionally, the 1965 Voting Rights Act was recently weakened by the *Shelby v. Holder* Supreme Court case, which deemed the formula for federal government oversight over states and districts with a long history of political disenfranchisement of Africana people unconstitutional.¹⁹ This gave the opportunity for those states and municipalities to pass voter identification laws that have been empirically proven to disproportionately affect people of color.²⁰

This all speaks to the systemic racism that is in the American political system. Feagin speaks about the political advantages that Whites are able to access in contemporary times. Feagin argues that today’s political system often does little to implement real democracy in its operations at state, local and the federal level.²¹ It continues to operate for the benefit of those who gain the most from it: well-off White individuals, while disregarding Africana people. The system is maintained because of the inherent day-to-day decisions that are unconsciously made by those in power to maintain that power. This is the crux of Systemic Racism. The next section will delve into the shortcomings of this theory as a way of exploring this social phenomenon.

SHORTCOMINGS OF SYSTEMIC RACISM/SOLUTIONS

Systemic Racism, as a theory, adequately explains the inherent flaws of Africana people trusting the same system that oppresses its constituents in order to remedy its social and economic woes. However, the solutions that it poses are wanting. Feagin argued that in order to fix the systemic racism that is inherent in the current American system, the current constitution must be removed, a new constitutional convention must

¹⁷ Harris, Fredrick C. Harris. *The Price of the Ticket: Barack Obama and the Rise and Decline of Black Politics*. (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2012), 175.

¹⁸ Alexander, Michelle. *The New Jim Crow: Mass Incarceration in the Age of Colorblindness*. (New York: The New Press, 2012).

¹⁹ *Shelby v. Holder*, 570 (United States Supreme Court, June 23, 2013).

²⁰ See Timothy Vercellotti & David Anderson. “Voter-Identification Requirements and the Learning Curve.

PS, *Political Science and Politics*. 42.1 Jan 2009, p 117-120; Matt A. Barreto, Stephen A Nuno, and Gabriel S Sanchez. “The Disproportionate Impact of Voter-ID Requirement on the Electorate: New Evidence from Indiana.” PS, *Political Science and Politics*, 2009: 111-116.

²¹ Feagin, 197.

be called, and representatives from all ethnic and racial groups must be present to structure that new constitution.²² That is a good start; however, it would still have groups of people who benefited from the “prior” political system who have historically displayed a tendency to maintain their power by any means necessary. And as Freire has argued, the oppressor will never give their position of domination and having is a condition of being.²³ Therefore, that option will never come into fruition.

Another shortcoming with this theory is that even though it does talk about the centrality of Black Nationalism to the vitality of Black people, it does not address the need for a cultural centering and a discovery of agency within the Black people. Asante argued for the need for this to occur in the Africana community in order to achieve liberation for Africana people.²⁴ Marimba Ani also articulated this centering in the African Worldview rather than the Eurocentric ideology.²⁵ The African Worldview is important to the survival of Africana people because it is the foundational piece of their identity. Franz Fanon spoke about this identity crisis in terms of language. He argued this point below:

All colonized people—in other words, people in whom an inferiority complex has taken root, whose local cultural originality has been committed to the grave— position themselves in relation to the civilizing language; i.e., the metropolitan culture. The more colonized has assimilated the cultural values of the metropolis, the more he will have escaped the bush. The more he rejects his blackness and the bush, the whiter he will become. In the colonial army, and particularly in the regiments of Senegalese soldiers, the “native” officers are mainly the interpreters. They serve to convey to their fellow soldiers the master’s orders, and they themselves enjoy a certain status.²⁶

He articulated that Africana people who assume the dominant culture render those people void of their home culture and makes them assimilate within the colonizer’s culture. The same argument can be made about Africana participation with the notion that the American political system can effectively address the concerns of the community. Assimilation into the American political system renders the Africana cultural values inert because it is believed that the colonizer’s culture is their culture

²² Feagin, 284-289.

²³ Freire, 40.

²⁴ Asante, Molefi K. *The Afrocentric Manifesto*. (Cambridge: Polity Press: 2007).

²⁵ Ani, Marimba. *Let the Circle Be Unbroken*. (New York: Nkonimfo Publications, 1980).

²⁶ Fanon, Franz. *Black Skin, White Mask*. (New York: Grove Press, 1952), 2-3.

when this society was not made for them to be participants, but only subjects.

The solutions must come on a multitude of fronts. First, Africana people must strategize in order to be on one accord. As Kwame Ture articulated, "Before a group can enter the open society, it must first close ranks."²⁷ Africana people also must be aware of how the American political system functions and have a place at the political table, but politics must play a part of that strategy, but not the only one. Coalitions based on interests should be explored, but not by political parties. Also, strategic outside agitation not connected to the political system should also be employed in order to get the short-term goals achieved. However, keep in mind that political, economic, physical land autonomy, and armed resistance may be avenues that Africana people need to consider in order to operate from a position of strength rather than a position of dis-agency. These can be considerations in addition to just solely relying upon the American political system for the fulfillment of Africana interests.

CONCLUSION

This project is just an exploratory one that looks at the role of Black politics and its relevance in contemporary times. Africana people have resisted the oppressive tendencies of this nation and its European counterparts since the conceptualization of the use of racial biases in order to enact a racialized society based upon domination. This project is geared towards identifying contemporary solutions that plague Africana people and provide solutions to those issues by Africana people. The solutions are not easy to come by, but as Freire stated, "The oppressed must be their own example in the struggle for their redemption."²⁸ That is the role of this project and that is the role of an Africana Studies scholar.

BIBLIOGRAPHY

- Alexander, Michelle. *The New Jim Crow: Mass Incarceration in the Age of Colorblindness*. New York: The New Press, 2012.
- Ani, Marimba. *Let the Circle Be Unbroken*. New York: Nkonimfo Publications, 1980. Asante, Molefi K. *An Afrocentric Manifesto*. Cambridge: Polity Press, 2007.
- Bois, W.E.B Du. *Black Reconstruction in American: 1860-1880*. New York: Free Press, 1935.

²⁷ Ture, Kwame. *Black Power: The Politics of Liberation*. (New York: Random House, 1967), 44.

²⁸ Freire, 36.

- Caucus, Congressional Black. *Congressional Black Caucus Online*. 2014. (accessed December 2, 2014).
- Choma, Russ. "Half of Congress Members are Millionaires." *Washington Post*. January 9, 2014. <https://www.opensecrets.org/news/2014/01/millionaires-club-for-first-time-most-lawmakers-are-worth-1-million-plus/> (accessed December 9, 2014).
- Fanon, Franz. *Black Skin, White Masks*. New York: Grove Press, 1952.
- Feagin, Joe R. *Racist America: Roots, Current Realities, and Future Reparations*. New York: Routledge, 2010.
- Freire, Paulo. *Pedagogy of the Oppressed*. London: Penguin Books, 1970.
- Harris, Fredrick C. *The Price of the Ticket: Barack Obama and the Rise and Decline of Black Politics*. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2012.
- National Urban League. *One Nation, Underemployed, Jobs Rebuild America: 2014 State of Black America*. U.S.A: National Urban League, 2014.
- Plumer, Brad. "These Ten Charts Show the Black-White Economic Gap Hasn't Budged in Fifty Years." *Washington Post*. August 28, 2013. <http://www.washingtonpost.com/blogs/wonkblog/wp/2013/08/28/these-seven-charts-show-the-black-white-economic-gap-hasnt-budged-in-50-years/> (accessed December 1, 2014).
- Shelby v. Holder*. 570 (U.S. Supreme Court, June 23, 2013).
- Ture, Kwame. *Black Power: The Politics of Liberation*. New York: Random House, 1967.
- Walters, Ronald. *Freedom is Not Enough: Black Voters, Black Candidates and American Presidential Politics*. Lanham: Rowman & Littlefield Publishers, 2005.
- . *Pan Africanism in the African Diaspora: An Analysis of Modern Afrocentric Political Movements*. Detroit: Wayne State University Press, 1993.
- Woodson, Carter G. *Mis-Education of the Negro*. Tribeca Books, 1933.

THE FUNDI EFFECT: ACTIVISM THROUGH EMPOWERMENT

Tony Jamal Lee
Afrikan Unity Initiative

New ideologies and methodologies are continuously influencing individuals aspiring to create changes to current disparities in society. The Afrikan has been in an everlasting struggle since arriving in the Western Hemisphere. The MAAFA of the Afrikan people ignited the warrior spirit into the very nature of the descendants of Afrika in the Americas. Through this nature, the voice of Afrika rose through many vessels that have influenced people to take action against the oppressive system in which they live. The Civil Rights Movement of the 1950s and 60s in the United States garnered worldwide attention through unremitting efforts to receive equality for all people in the nation by performing acts of civil disobedience.

The participatory democracy strategy of organization used by Ella Baker was greatly productive in grassroots activism, and has the potential to strengthen the political struggles of the present to the height of the movements in times past. Ella Baker was a prominent figure in the black freedom struggle. She was active in fighting for equal rights for Afrikans in America for over five decades. She began in 1930 as a member of Young Negroes Cooperative League. This group focused on the development of economic empowerment in the Black community. As the national director of this organization, Baker structured community cooperatives promoting strong commercial progress. Baker had an early introduction to the injustices that exist with regard to race. She was also raised to resist and battle against those very struggles. She found much pride and strength in the stories of her grandmother surviving many challenging times during enslavement (Sullivan, 1999; Grant, 1998).

Her approach was characterized by an ability to mobilize and influence youth to action. In this work, there will be an analytical examination of how this methodology is equipped to stand the tests of time through what will be called The Fundi Effect. Fundi is a word that is found in both the isi-Zulu and ki-Swahili languages and means person of great knowledge. Not only is the Fundi knowledgeable, but this person also has the distinguished ability to share their information and experiences with the coming generations as to assure that the work is continued.

The Fundi Effect, therefore, describes Baker's approach to activism because she always looked to create leaders rather than simply have fol-

lowers. The fight against oppression in the United States of America has and will continue to drastically change over time. The Fundi Effect, however, goes beyond the concerns of the present and serves to prepare people to flow with the inevitable changes that occur in life. The Fundi Effect is a method of activism that is capable of being applied inter-generationally, and has the ability to address the reactionary manner with which injustice is dealt in attempts at social movements at present.

The ways in which people in the Black freedom struggle approached the issues they faced determined how instrumental their activity was to the movement. It is here that the examination of participatory democracy will prove its effectiveness. Many sources support this idea of Baker's methodology being transformative and unconventional which appealed to many people who had no organizational affiliation (Grant, 1981; K. Tutashinda, 2010). There are three themes that are consistent throughout the literature and they are as follows: humility, adaptability, and the highly influential nature of The Fundi Effect.

HUMILITY

"You didn't see me on television; you didn't see news stories about me. The kind of role that I tried to play was to pick up pieces or put together pieces out of which I hoped organization might come. My theory is, strong people don't need strong leaders¹" — Ella Baker

Much of the success of the freedom struggle came from the humble spirit of Ella Baker. She reached out to the masses and developed leaders among those who were already respectable within their communities. The literature suggests that Ella Baker was a person of action with more concern for the progression of the movement than her own public image (Grant, 1998; Ahmad, 2007; Jeffries, 2006; K. Tutashinda, 2010). She was often in contention with Dr. King over this ideology (Ahmad, 2007; Grant, 1981). She was a firm believer that freedom would be won by raising many leaders who worked together cooperatively (Hayden, 2004; Sullivan, 1999; DeLaure, 2008). This was in opposition to the usual type of hierarchal leadership in which everyone depends on one man to lead. Participatory democracy works in opposition to hierarchy (Grant, 1998; Grant, 1981; DeLaure, 2008; K. Tutashinda, 2010). The foundation of this style of activism gives more responsibility to the everyday people struggling for freedom, and it also gives them a more personal connection to the movement. People will surely be more willing to participate if they are regarded to be significant contributors in the struggle. Baker understood this and continually organized from this vantage point.

¹ Grant, J. (1998). *Ella Baker: Freedom Bound*. New York: John Wiley & Sons Inc.

INFLUENTIAL

“The major job was getting people to understand that they had something within their power that they could use, and it could only be used if they understood what was happening and how group action could counter violence . . .” —Ella Baker

Many people and organizations have been either directly or incidentally influenced by the works and ideas of Ella Baker (Jeffries, 2006; Ahmad, 2007; Grant, 1981). The Fundi Effect allowed Baker to speak to the spirits within people to encourage their potential to materialize into action. Baker also had an invaluable talent to relate to people who were on the fence about activism entirely (K. Tutashinda, 2010; Grant, 1998; DeLaure, 2008). Baker felt that the relationships that she built were imperative to her work. Her organizing tactics made people comfortable with the ideas of fighting for what was right, even if the impact was small. She was special because of her actual interest in the lives of the people she met. This was what truly gave her the significant advantage to develop leaders wherever she went (Grant, 1981; Grant, 1998; K. Tutashinda, 2010; Sullivan, 1999).

Many people have a misconception of this movement as being passive. In fact the efforts of these people were anything but passive. The Black Power Movement was directly birthed from the Civil Rights Movement. This means that there was indeed a radical ideology within the predecessor in order to create such a powerful influence. The audacity of Afrikan students at North Carolina A&T State University to organize a sit-in at a segregated lunch counter must be categorized as confrontational revolutionary strategy (Ahmad, 2007; Jeffries, 2006; DeLaure, 2008). It was this one event that sparked a total movement of student sit-ins and ultimately created the activist organization known as the Student Non-violence Coordinating Committee (SNCC). SNCC was brought together by Ella Baker who saw that this movement would be successful through the collective energy of the youth (Ahmad, 2007; Jeffries, 2006; Igus, Ellis, Patrick, & Wesley, 1991; Grant, Ella Baker: Freedom Bound, 1998). The Fundi Effect was at work as she was able to identify the leadership potential in those students. She was one of the only people with the insight and capability to take the student sit-in initiative that had at the time become national, and organize these young minds into a collective unit. She was the mother of SNCC (Ahmad, 2007; Hayden, 2004; Sullivan, 1999). Baker intentionally advised the young students to create their own organization, as opposed to being a

² Grant, J. (Director). (1981). *FUNDI: The Story of Ella Baker* [Motion Picture].

sub-group under the SCLC umbrella (Grant, 1998; Ahmad, 2007; Grant, 1981).

ADAPTABILITY

“In order for us as poor and oppressed people to become part of a society that is meaningful, the system under which we now exist has to be radically changed. . . It means facing a system that does not lend its self to your needs and devising means by which you change that system.” —Ella Baker

Baker saw this as an opportunity to utilize the group centered leadership strategy as the foundation of this new organization with young minds that would be more willing to accept her wisdom. Her ability to mentor and mobilize individuals while not needing to be publicized for her work, gave her the irreplaceable value of reaching people through all generations. Her message resonated through both the Civil Rights and Black Power movements (Ahmad, 2007). There is a clear advantage to the group centered activism of Ella Baker. Baker began to distance herself from strict organizational relations as their methods proved to be static (DeLaure, 2008; K. Tutashinda, 2010; Grant, 1998; Grant, 1981). The hierarchy within these organizations generally opposed participatory democracy as the primary approach from which to battle the race struggle in the nation. Baker related to the new radical forms of activism exhibited in the youth and was able to see the benefits of their approach when other older people thought them to be too reckless (Grant, 1981; Hayden, 2004; K. Tutashinda, 2010; DeLaure, 2008). She was also able to temper their resentment toward those who were not of radical thought, and instead showed how to work alongside them. Many of these young minds initiated the Black Power movement which is referred to by some as the evolution of the Civil Rights era (Jeffries, 2006; Ahmad, 2007; DeLaure, 2008).

The Fundi Effect adapted to the dynamic forces that any movement encounters and successfully continued through the changes in thought and method at the time. The adaptability of The Fundi Effect extends to the ways in which people in the freedom struggle could successfully resist the attacks that were brought on by the government. With the knowledge of how the Counter Intelligence Program (COINTELPRO) of the FBI worked to disrupt and destroy all freedom struggles in this nation, it may have been better if there were no identifiable leaders in any of the organizations struggling for equal rights (Jeffries, 2006; Ahmad, 2007). Leader-centered groups are at risk because when the shepherd is re-

³ Grant, J. (Director). (1981). *FUNDI: The Story of Ella Baker* [Motion Picture].

moved the sheep scatter. However, when each person in the organization is a leader they become more difficult to infiltrate (Jeffries, 2006; Ahmad, 2007; DeLaure, 2008). With a conscious mind of how all of these events happened in the past, The Fundi Effect, if used in a concerted effort, could help the struggle for freedom progress without destructive consequences.

CENTRAL ARGUMENT

In the aftermath of the zenith of the Black freedom struggle, there has been an era of lethargic activism when there is any at all. The twenty-first century version of so-called activism is lacking the basis through which all movements are fueled: love. The Fundi Effect extends beyond the anger and disgust that motivates the recent efforts of attaining justice. The fire of anger quickly dissipates as time passes. The Fundi Effect initiates movements from the enraging moments. Though there must be a genuine love for the issues and the people for this to properly function. Love is what permeates through the inevitable impediments that come along with fighting for justice. The Fundi Effect can only be operated with the correct motives. It is too often that people in the Black community are only seen fighting for justice when the press is present, but as the news coverage dies their involvement does as well.

The participatory democratic tactics of Baker are encompassed within The Fundi Effect, but are not the totality of it. The very essence of Baker's approach to the people with whom she engaged adds potency to this technique. In order to eradicate the apathy of the people, empathy must be reestablished within the Afrikan community. People have to understand that they are the leaders who they are awaiting. The Fundi Effect makes every community member responsible for the desired change. Baker argued that strong people are not in need of strong leaders, and this model carries accountability (Grant, 1998). This model also is quite difficult to infiltrate with divisive schemes as J. Edgar Hoover did to obliterate the Black Power movement. This is why Baker began to weaken her associations with particular organizations. Organizations are easy to identify, but the organized efforts of individuals through grassroots movement creates great challenges to those who oppose the struggle. People will then be prepared when cases such as the murders of Trayvon Martin, Tamir Rice, Michael Brown, Freddie Gray, or the events surrounding the Jena 6 trials occur.

The Fundi Effect has the capacity to turn the youth's rebellious attitudes into something constructive promoting progress. Baker had a heart for the youth, and she realized that their energy could be used to establish new ways to approach social action. This means that through educating the young people of the organization in their history it is possible to

awaken many dynamic ways in which to face socio-political obstacles. The Fundi Effect embraced the sit-ins that were called radical and made them into a respected movement. It can do the same for the youth of today and beyond by the elders embracing the rebellion of the youth and directing this energy towards beneficial aims.

Along with the formerly mentioned aspects, The Fundi Effect also contains the tools of organization and strategy. The emotions that follow major injustices such as the recent Michael Brown and Tamir Rice executions tend to overshadow the logical ways to handle these situations. An accurate study of the social movements of the past indicates that there was strategic method behind the activities that ensued (Marable, 2000; Ahmad, 2007). The case of Plessey vs. Ferguson was a premeditated endeavor by the NAACP to bring the subject of segregation to the Supreme Court. The Montgomery bus boycott was also planned similarly with Rosa Parks intentionally getting arrested that day as a catalyst to the events that followed (Franklin & Moss, Jr., 1947; Igus, Ellis, Patrick, & Wesley, 1991).

Strategy is at the heart of any functional tactic. Baker was able to strategically facilitate the young people of SNCC to organize their efforts to desegregate lunch counters. The Fundi Effect strategizes in similar ways as the aforementioned cases with one exception, the people are encouraged to help the facilitator best cater their needs. There have been marches and demonstrations in reaction to the injustices from the Rodney King to the Eric Garner case, but there was no clear direction to these actions. The new activists have taken a look at the surface of the movements of the past with an un-analytical lens of the ground work taken to make these acts successful. A cohesive and unified mission must be at the center of any productive struggle. Baker organized people by showing them how the issues are relative to their lives. Once this was done it was not difficult to establish unity among the people and create strategies to address the problems that existed. The Fundi Effect must be carried out by those who are respected in their communities and used to organize and prepare people to fight injustice anytime and anywhere. Information is transferred from one generation to the next and that is the basis of this methodology. This methodology is not only strongly based from the model of Baker's participatory democracy, but is the evolution of what she generated. There is a consciousness that must be developed in order for this function.

The vessel through which the Fundi Effect is employed is through Afrikan Unity Initiative, Inc. Afrikan Unity Initiative is an organization catered toward creating a better world for Afrikans and all people through interactive service and education. It is called an initiative because the word exemplifies proactiveness, which is a necessity when

fighting injustice. All of the initiatives are designed to work in any place around the globe in order for the methods to help people of Afrikan descent wherever they may be in the Diaspora. With respect to the fact that Baker had cut ties with formal organizations Afrikan Unity Initiative, Inc. operates more as a global network of people working towards building and sustaining strong ties across the Afrikan Diaspora.

CONCLUSION

The Fundi Effect is a method of activism that is capable of being applied inter-generationally, and has the ability to address the reactionary manner with which injustice is dealt in attempts at social movement in the present. In the current system of individualism and reactionary activism, The Fundi Effect has the ability to penetrate a listless generation. Social injustices are bound to become more apparent and overt if these unorganized and languid efforts persist. The best way for these methods to be applied would be for an information transfer from the Ivory Tower to the street. Baker is no longer around to teach these methods, and the access to her work is presently not as available to everyone as it should be. The black freedom struggle continues and has many obstacles that have many layers to address. One major form of oppression that plagued many Afrikan people was colonization from European powers. As with enslavement, colonization has been defeated. The problem is that the psychological conditioning which was utilized in both systems sustains the oppression into the present.

The Fundi Effect works proactively to engage people in community development and global cooperation. No longer will the people of Afrikan descent be exploited due to isolation. Through the Afrikan Diaspora Dialogues the issues facing people globally will be known throughout the network and will be addressed as the problem of all Afrikan people. When diamonds are being unjustly taken from Sierra Leone, Afro-Peruvians, Nigerians, and Afrikans in the United States will stand in opposition to that act. The isolation of the Afrikan Diaspora has allowed for racism and the oppression of Afrikan peoples to continue for many generations. The divide between scholars and lay people must be broken. A focus on youth leadership development is also an intricate piece of this being realized. The Fundi Effect permeates into the spirit of humanity, and is developed to pass knowledge forward in order to ensure that social injustice is battled in every generation with the same or even more vigor than their predecessors. Baker felt that the relationships that she built were imperative to her work. Her organizing tactics made people comfortable with the ideas of fighting for what was right, even if the impact was small. She was special because of her actual interest in the lives of the people she met. This was what truly gave her the significant

advantage to develop leaders wherever she went. This is the essence of The Fundi Effect. The sharing of this philosophy should be implemented in a way that would make all who adhere to this design a Fundi in their own right.

WORKS CITED

- Ahmad, M. (2007). *We Will Return in the Whirlwind: Black Radical Organization 1960-1975*. Chicago: Charles H. Kerr Publishing Company.
- Collier-Thomas, B. (1998). *Daughters of Thunder: Black Women Preachers and their Sermons 1850-1979*. San Francisco: Jossey-Bass Publishers.
- DeLaure, M. B. (2008). Planting Seeds of Change: Ella Baker's Radical Rhetoric. *Women's Studies in Communications*, 1-29.
- Fanon, F. (1961). *Wretched of the Earth*. New York: Grove Press.
- Franklin, J. H., & Moss, Jr., A. A. (1947). *From Slavery to Freedom*. New York: McGraw-Hill Inc.
- Freire, P. (1970). *Pedagogy of the Oppressed*. London: Penguin Books.
- Gates Jr., H. L., & Marable, M. (2000). A Debate on Activism in Black Studies. In M. Marable, *Dispatches from the Ebony Tower: Intellectuals Confront the African American Experience* (pp. 187-191). New York: Columbia University Press.
- Gates Jr., H. L., & Marable, M. (2000). A Debate on Activism in BlaMarableck Studies. In M. Marable, *Dispatches from the Ebony Tower: Intellectuals Confront the African American Experience* (pp. 187-191). New York: Columbia University Press.
- Grant, J. (Director). (1981). *FUNDI: The Story of Ella Baker* [Motion Picture].
- Grant, J. (1998). *Ella Baker: Freedom Bound*. New York: John Wiley & Sons Inc.
- Hayden, C. (2004). Ella Baker As I Knew Her: She Trusted Youth. *Social Policy*, 101-104.
- Hilliard, A. G. (1997). *SBA: The Reawakening of the African Mind*. Gainesville, FL: Makara Publishig Company.
- Igus, T., Ellis, V. F., Patrick, D., & Wesley, V. W. (1991). *Book of Black Heroes Vol. II: Great Women in the Struggle*. New Jersey: Just Us Books Inc.
- Jeffries, J. L. (2006). *Black Power in the Belly of the Beast*. Chicago: University of Illinois Press.

- K. Tutashinda, D. (2010). The Grassroots Political Philosophy of Ella Baker: Oakland, California Applicability. *The Journal of Pan-African Studies*, 25-43.
- Marable, M. (2000). *Dispatches from the Ebony Tower: Intellectuals Confront the African American Experience*. New York: Columbia University Press.
- Sullivan, L. Y. (1999). Ella Baker. *Social Policy*, 54-58.

BOOK REVIEWS

KIESE LAYMON. *How To Slowly Kill Yourself and Others in America: Essays* (Chicago: Bolden, 2013). 148 pp., \$15 paper.

Social scientists will most likely categorize writer Kiese Laymon's collection of essays as a literary intervention into masculinity studies in our current era: marked by the (seeming) paradox of black presidency and celebrity on the one hand, and the entrenchment of police power over black boys and men on the other. Scholars of history and literature might situate Laymon in political and literary traditions stretching from turn-of-the-twentieth century "race men" to the work of feminists of color in our time, noting his acknowledgements to Ralph Ellison, James Baldwin, Octavia Butler and Toni Morrison (12).¹ With its Mississippi setting and sensibility, American Studies scholars will likely soon cite it, particularly the essay "Hip-Hop Stole My Southern Black Boy," as an example of the "New Southern Studies," which places the Black South and regional identity at the center of an analysis of national economic, political, creative, and intellectual narratives.² *How to Slowly Kill Yourself and Others in America* will surely teach brilliantly in classrooms in all of these fields.

But as his title suggests, Laymon is not writing primarily to "those who are paid to read for a living"—nor even those students who pay tuition to read—but instead those who read "for living," and he writes determinedly against the academic tendency to flatten experience, identity and literature into arid sociological categories and intellectual trajectories. He imagines his essays as musical tracks in the Black American tradition, incorporating multiple voices, echoes, "ad lib, riff, collaboration, and necessary digression," revolving around black audiences' experiences and imagination at the center (13). The result is a set of deeply personal philosophical reflections on black people's responsibility to each other, the nation's responsibility to black citizens, and the reciprocal artistic responsibilities of writers, readers, and teachers.

Laymon began composing the essays at a destructive moment when, he explains, he refused responsibility for behaving dishonestly and inhumanely, "as American monsters and murderers tend to do" (11). He closes the book emotionally transformed, in large part by writing and teaching, and through those painstaking processes recognizing the effects of his actions and ambitions on himself and beloved others. "I don't want to be a murderer anymore," he confesses. "I choose life" (145). The nation has engaged in no such honest accounting, many of the essays

observe. "The Worst of White Folks," for example, contrasts the responsibility accepted and borne by generations of black southern women in the face of "servitude, sexual assault, segregation, poverty, and psychological violence" to the denial of white Americans who not only shirk responsibility for racism, but celebrate themselves for "post-racial" multiculturalism. "There is a price to pay for ducking responsibility, or clinging to the worst of us, for harboring a warped innocence," Laymon writes. "There is an even greater price to pay for ignoring, demeaning, and unfairly burdening those Americans who have disproportionately borne the weight of American irresponsibility for so long. Our grandmothers and great-grandmothers have paid more than their fair share and our nation owes them and their children, and their children's children, a lifetime of healthy choices and second chances. That would be responsible" (32-33).

For Laymon, assuming responsibility requires reckoning honestly with black masculinities, which he does in a series of real and imagined conversations with family members, hip hop artists, comedians, athletes, politicians, and peers. Broadening the spectrum of responsibility involves expanding definitions of violence to include everything from "drones murdering civilians around the world" (107) to the slow violence of "eating," "fucking," "lying," "slanging," "robbing," "gambling" or "shooting" your way "out of sad," which are "just slower, more acceptable ways for desperate folks, and especially paroled black boys in our country, to kill ourselves and others close to us in America" (45). In "Echo: Mychal, Darnell, Kiese, Kai, and Marlon," the participants reflect on their hurtful and healing relationships with intimate others and each other, essentially examining how to conduct oneself with love, honesty, integrity and humanity in the context of dehumanizing institutions and ideological systems (73-83). These systems include professing and publishing, and the writers, editors, readers, and teachers involved. Throughout this collection, Laymon presents writing, reading and teaching as an exchange necessitating work and "moral change" at all turns. From his account of refusing to make substantial changes demanded by an editor ("You Are the Second Person") to his hope that a broad audience "work with the essays" and "write back with brutal imagination, magic, and brilliance" (20), Laymon calls on the subjects, readers, teachers (and reviewers) of his work to take on responsibility for getting better at "being human" (13, 145).

NOTES

¹ Hazel Carby, *Race Men*. (Cambridge: Harvard University Press, 2000)

² Examples of "New Directions in Southern Studies," include Zandria Robinson, *This Ain't Chicago: Race, Class, and Regional Identity in*

the Post-Soul South (Chapel Hill: University of North Carolina Press, 2014); “Forum: What’s New in Southern Studies, And Why Should We Care?” *Journal of American Studies* 48: 3 (August 2014): 691-733.

Reviewed by: Leslie K. Dunlap
Willamette University

DWAYNE MACK, ELWOOD D. WATSON, AND MICHELLE MADSEN CAMACHO, EDS. *Mentoring Faculty of Color: Essays on Professional Development and Advancement in Colleges and Universities* (Jefferson, North Carolina: MacFarland and Company, Inc., 2012). 220 pp., \$45.00 paper.

Looking back at my graduate school years, the most vital mentorship I received came in the form of sometimes brutal, but often measured honesty from a small set of trusted advisors and advanced graduate students. Their guidance was critical to my journey because they talked openly about the obstacles they faced in navigating work/life balance, spoke candidly about dealing with unsupportive colleagues, and relayed freely the challenges they encountered in their attempts to gain legitimacy as academics or scholars-in-training. In short, much like the earnest insight shared by the authors of *Mentoring Faculty of Color: Essays on Professional Development and Advancement in Colleges and Universities*, they avoided clichés and other platitudes—they “kept it real.”

In this timely collection of first-person essays, underrepresented faculty and administrators discuss their personal experiences on the road to achieving tenure. Each author effectively links their own ethnic identities to the broader “how to’s” to achieving the benchmark moments central to their professional development. Indeed, an important strength of the collection is the breadth of issues that they address along the way. Getting tenure is not just about publishing—and this is especially the case for Faculty of Color. Notably, they must also develop effective teaching strategies, deal with disrespectful or discriminatory attitudes by students, colleagues, or administrators, and serve as the “diversity” go-to person for campus and community events.

One of the greatest strengths of this collection is its attention to action and honesty. Judith Liu’s open letter on how to succeed in academia is an excellent example of raw insight that combines strategies for professional success while not losing your soul along the way. In outlining how to avoid the three Ds—depression, disillusionment, and despair—common attributes for academics—she advises to be cognizant

of time and avoid giving the short shrift to family and friends. Junior faculty are often more susceptible to the time trap of committee work. We will feel obligated, she tells us, especially when it comes to being asked to be part of a diversity-based committee. Instead of immediately responding yes or no, explain to all those who ask that you must first clear this request with the department chair. This strategy gives you the opportunity to pause and think about whether or not this service commitment is doable given your schedule.

Work obligations and circumstances are also shaped by gender. Michelle Camacho's essay tackles the cultural contradictions that Women of Color mothers face in academia—some departments are welcoming spaces for pregnant women or women with small children and others are not. However, this is not where the challenges end. Broader college and university institutional structures, in her words, “fall short” when it comes to dealing with the intersections of motherhood, race, and the tenure track. Notably, she cites a Cornell University study that found that by adding that a job candidate has a young child led to the perception that the applicant was less competent than childless interviewees. Such judgments are not only compounded by race, but also translate into significant wage differentials. Hidden workloads and microaggressions abound—when Women or Men of Color seek out or make the case for flexible family-leave, they are often viewed as demanding special privileges. Women must learn to live in the “mommy closet” and censor frank discussion about the difficulties and joys associated with motherhood.

I learned a great deal from the advice offered in this collection. There is something very empowering about knowing that you are not alone with your anxieties, and in some cases, your experiences. That said, I wondered about the often under-recognized intersections of race, mental health, and academic life. Perhaps this lends itself to an entirely different project, one that might have been addressed in a formal conclusion that identified areas that merit closer attention. Another blind spot relates to a discussion of the experiences of queer Faculty of Color. What are some of the distinct challenges they face? What advice might senior faculty offer in the job search process and then later on the tenure track? These points, however, do not take away from the strengths, timeliness, and importance of the collection—critical insight that will undoubtedly help countless scholars-in-training better manage their journeys through academia.

*Reviewed by: Marie Sarita Gaytán
University of Utah*

MICHAEL KIMMEL. *Angry White Men: American Masculinity at the End of an Era* (New York, NY: Nation Books, 2013). 314 pp., \$26.99 (cloth), \$16.99 (paper).

A well-established sociologist of masculinities, Michael Kimmel, in his work, *Angry White Men: American Masculinity at the End of an Era*, offers a highly accessible journey through the oxymoron that white men are oppressed by disenfranchised women and minorities. Moreover, *Angry White Men* argues that their pain and rage is legitimate, though the direction of their anger is not “true.” While attacking those with less social capital offers an easier target than the neoliberal policies of the powerful, this process denies the solidarity which could threaten the status quo. Instead, their pain becomes self-fulfilling as these men perpetuate the very injustices that feed their now impotent anger. In contrast, Kimmel argues that by correcting biased “inputs,” such as racism and sexism, a new American Dream could produce the social, political, and economic equity that would defuse their anger. Thus, *Angry White Men* seeks to prove that the refusal of some white men to accept increasing gender and racial equity is not a moral question alone, but their own impediment as well.

In the introduction, Kimmel notes that while many white men embrace growing equity, this reactionary anger reaches beyond the American fringe. As a result, the theory and delivery of *Angry White Men* seems less a report of scholarship, but intends rather to persuade a general audience that feminism, and equity more broadly, is (still) our society’s best hope. As such, Kimmel weaves together an expansive review and analysis (his own interviews and past work included) to foreground the gender and race-specific meanings of such ideas as work, independence, provider, and protector which are present in white men’s anger. In doing so, Kimmel empathically separates legitimate injustice from the rhetoric of nostalgic victimhood, inherent in what he calls “aggrieved entitlement.”

Following a humanizing introduction to *Angry White Men*, Kimmel turns to a discussion of (1) the Right Wing media’s use of coded messaging calculated to trigger shame and transform it into rage, (2) the perpetually relevant and oversimplified case of white male mass murderers, (3) Men’s and (4) Father’s Rights Activists, and (5) the broader epidemic of misogyny and violence. Linking specific cases to general themes, (6) Kimmel next examines the economic underpinnings upon which these men’s gendered and raced pain and anger rest. Indeed, in his discussion of the White (supremacist) Right that follows (7), it is hard to miss the harmonizing of global and domestic extremism responding to the trans-

national reach of neoliberalism. Finally, in the Epilogue, Kimmel briefly examines anger as a hopeful tool for change.

To be sure, *Angry White Men* is an important addition to the study of white men who stake their personal and collective value in the promises of a twentieth century American Dream. Indeed, for many, this access was the reward granted their "European ethnic" grandparents for coming to the aid of whiteness when they assimilated into Caucasia. As a result, it is unmistakable in the interview quotes, and Kimmel's instructive example of Limbaugh reframing a caller's pain into anger (pg. 32), that The Dream's crumbling illusions of fairness and dignity provide the common source of anger that an identity politics of hate can then explain and direct. However, Kimmel's belief that a reconstituted American Dream founded on social equality can produce economic dignity requires the adoption of this identity-centered framing. Critically, this also obscures the role of The Dream in perpetuating economic and social class inequalities and produces analyses of zero-sum pursuits of privilege instead of twisted efforts to reclaim the dignity and intrinsic value capitalism cannot provide, and to which we are all indeed entitled.

Thus, as both an ethnic study and a call for change, *Angry White Men* would benefit from a clearer critique of the American Dream ideal itself in order to more directly undermine the angry right's claims. Further, to challenge Dream ideology effectively also requires a more thorough criticism of the left's embrace of neoliberalism, without which the book seems like an argument for why these men are wrong rather than for understanding and collective struggle. Ultimately, however, *Angry White Men* is a critically important discussion of United States white men's complex positionalities as the twenty-first century begins, particularly for the accessible nature of the text. Certainly Kimmel is right, the most important contribution a study of aggrieved white men can offer is an accurate analysis of power in which they can identify both the true sources of their pain and their natural allies. *Angry White Men* is an important and significant step toward that vision.

*Reviewed by: Jonathan Grove
University of Washington*

Ethnic Studies Review Journal Information

Guidelines for Submitting Manuscripts

ESR uses a policy of blind peer review. All papers are read by at least two reviewers who are experts in the area. Manuscripts must not have been published previously or be under consideration by other publications. ESR seeks manuscripts of 7500 words or less, inclusive of notes and works cited. Endnotes rather than footnotes should be utilized, although these should be kept to a minimum. If possible please follow the Chicago Manual of Style, double space all text, and use Times New Roman 12 point font. Given ESR is a multi-disciplinary journal other style formats will be considered. Submissions must include a 200 word abstract, 200 word author biography, and 6-8 key words in order of importance.

Manuscripts should be sent as attachments in Word, pdf, or rtf format to ESR@ethnicstudies.org.

Other Correspondence

Other inquiries and correspondences, such as back titles or advertising, should be directed to the National Office:

National Association For Ethnic Studies

PO Box 842542

Virginia Commonwealth University

Richmond, VA 23284

Email: NAES@ethnicstudies.org

Subscriptions

Membership in the NAES includes ESR* and The Ethnic Reporter newsletter, published in the Fall and Spring. Annual membership dues are based on the following income chart: Up to \$24,000: \$35, \$24,001 - \$36,000: \$45, \$36,001 - \$48,000: \$55, \$48,001 - \$60,000: \$65, \$60,001 - \$80,000: \$75, \$80,001 and above: \$85, Institution/Library: \$65, Patron: \$150, Life Membership: \$500, Associate Members (students/retirees): Above scale up to maximum of \$40.

*Please note: ESR is included with memberships paying \$65 and up. All others can order ESR for \$15 per copy. Ethnic Reporter comes with all memberships.

